

Turai Gabriella

Medieval Female Mysticism and Weber's Charismatic
Authority

The Case of Angela of Foligno

Magatartástudományi és Kommunikációelméleti Intézet

Témavezető:

Prof. Dr. Dr. Máté-Tóth András
A Magyar Tudományos Akadémia doktora

©Turai Gabriella

Budapesti Corvinus Egyetem

Társadalomtudományi Doktori Iskola
Társadalmi Kommunikáció Alprogram

Medieval Female Mysticism and Weber's Charismatic Authority
The Case of Angela of Foligno

Doktori értekezés

Turai Gabriella

Budapest

2019.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ix
ABSTRACT	xi
SIGNIFICANCE AND TOPICALITY OF THIS DISSERTATION	1
<i>1.1. Introduction</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>1.2. Angela of Foligno: The Most Important Franciscan Female Mystic</i>	<i>8</i>
1.2.1. Magistra Theologorum	8
1.2.2. Angela in contemporary studies	9
1.2.3. Angela of Foligno in the mirror of Evelyn Underhill	9
<i>1.3. Franciscans and the Women's Movements</i>	<i>11</i>
1.3.1. A brief sketch of the Franciscan Order (Ordo Fratrum Minorum, or O.F.M)	11
1.3.2. The Penitential Movement	13
1.3.3. The Women's Movement and Franciscan Women of the Time	13
<i>1.4. Angela's Canonization</i>	<i>15</i>
1.4.1. The Genio Femminile	15
1.4.2. The Canonization of Saint Angela of Foligno	15
1.4.3. The only discourse that exists is the discourse presented in current social discourse	17
<i>1.5. Feminist Interest of the Female Mysticism</i>	<i>17</i>
1.5.1. Evelyn Underhill	18
1.5.2. Elizabeth Petroff	20
1.5.3. Grace Jantzen	21
1.5.4. Caroline Bynum-Walker	22
1.5.5. Amy Hollywood	23
<i>1.6. The charismatic authority approach</i>	<i>25</i>
1.6.1. A multidisciplinary interest: The social dimension of mysticism	25
1.6.2. The legacy and future of mysticism	27
1.6.3. Weberian approach: The charismatic authority in progress	27
1.6.4. Conclusion and outlook	30
THE LIFE AND CONTEXT OF ANGELA	32
<i>2.1. Introduction</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>2.2. Life of Angela of Foligno (1248-1309)</i>	<i>33</i>
2.2.1. Biographical profile	33

2.2.2. Women in the Middle Ages	37
2.2.3. Angela as a unique case	38
2.2.4. Body-soul interconnection in Angela's <i>Liber</i>	38
2.3. <i>Context</i>	39
2.3.1. Foligno: The local, historical and religious context of Angela's life	39
2.3.2. Myticism is a public discourse in the Middle Ages	40
2.3.3. A new turn in mysticism	41
2.3.4. Characterizing the 13th century	42
2.4. <i>Conclusion and outlook</i>	44
CHARISMA BETWEEN INSTITUTION AND EXCITEMENT	45
3.1. <i>General introduction</i>	45
3.1.1. Overview	45
3.1.2. The predecessors: Rudolph Sohm and Karl Holl impacts on the evolution of the Weberian charisma	46
3.1.3. The very original source of Weber's charisma	47
3.1.4. How to approach the diversity of the Weberian charisma?	48
3.1.5. The function of charismatic authority based on Martin Riesebrodt's notion	48
3.1.6. Charismatic authority and the question of legitimacy in Weber's work	49
3.1.7. Stephen Turner's notion of charisma	50
3.1.8. Systematization process of charisma based on Adair-Toteff	50
3.1.9. Specific introduction to the individual investigation	51
3.1.10. Sample and methods	51
3.1.11. Preview of the variety of charisma	52
3.1.12. Transition	52
3.2. <i>Dimension of high intensity vs. kenotic character</i>	53
3.2.1. Introduction	53
3.2.2. High intensity	54
3.2.3. Kenotic character	58
3.2.4. Summary	59
3.3. <i>Dimension of magical vs. immanent legitimacy</i>	59
3.3.1. Introduction	59
3.3.2. Magical legitimacy	60
3.3.3. Succession of magical power	64
3.3.4. Immanent legitimacy: Economy, politics, and charismatic leadership	65
3.3.5. Transition between magical and immanent legitimacy	66
3.3.6. Summary	69
3.4. <i>Dimension of person vs. institution</i>	69
3.4.1. Introduction	69

3.4.2. Person	70
3.4.3 Charisma as individual divine energy in different religious traditions.....	72
3.4.4. Questions to the personal dimension	75
3.4.5. Institution.....	75
3.4.6. Institution building	76
3.4.7. The beginning of the institutionalizational process	77
3.4.8. Office charisma: Church.....	78
3.4.9. Charismatic education as an institution building force.....	82
3.4.10. Research questions.....	83
The research question the present dissertation seeks to answer are as follows.	83
3.4.11. Summary.....	84
3.5. Chapter summary.....	84
 DETOUR: THE AFTERMATH OF WEBER'S THEORY OF CHARISMA	86
4.1. Introduction	86
4.1.1. Biographical background.....	87
4.1.2. Understanding the animal-erotic dimension of charisma by virtue of Weber's personality	87
4.2. Authority.....	88
4.2.1. Nine characteristics of the charismatic leader according to Boss's classification.....	88
4.2.2. The legendary authority of Liu Chi: A possible parallel for Angela.....	89
4.3. Therapy.....	90
4.4. The postmodern state	94
4.4.1. The postmodern possibilities of charisma	95
4.4.2. The interpretation of charisma in the postmodern condition	97
4.4.3. Weber's concept of charisma according to Oevermann	98
4.4.4. Summary	99
 ANGELA'S WORK.....	100
5.1. Introduction	100
5.1.1. Angela's work: Why?.....	100
5.1.2. The scholarship on Angela.....	100
5.1.3. An individual approach to analyze Angela's Book	102
5.2. <i>Liber Sororis Lelle</i>	102
5.2.1. The structure of the Liber	103
5.2.2. Memorial.....	104
5.2.3. Instructions	105
5.3. The key structure of Angela's mysticism based on the Weberian analysis	106

5.3.1. General introduction: Angela of Foligno and Max Weber	106
5.3.2. Introduction	106
5.3.3. Personal dimension	107
5.3.3.1. The first twenty steps of Blessed Angela on the way to penance and spiritual perfection.....	107
5.3.3.2. Via Negativa.....	124
5.3.3.3. Emptiness in Weber	124
5.3.3.4. Summary of the personal dimension	126
5.3.4. Institutional dimension.....	127
5.3.4.1. The turn/shift of Angela's personal charisma	127
5.3.4.2. Charismatic legitimacy of the institutions.....	129
5.3.4.3. Charismatic education	134
5.3.4.4. Summary of the institutional dimension in Angela	142
5.3.5. Chapter summary	142
CONCLUSION	144
6.1. <i>Outcomes</i>	145
REFERENCES	147
PUBLICATIONS.....	160

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I would like to express my very great appreciation to Prof. Dr. Dr. András Máté-Tóth, supervisor and inspirator of this dissertation.

I would like to offer my special thanks to Prof. Dr. József Pál who from the very first day of my university life supported me in choosing the path of *scientia sacra*.

I would like to express my very great appreciation to Prof. Dr. Christopher Adair-Toteff for his valuable and constructive suggestions during the development of my research. His willingness to give his time so generously has been very much appreciated.

I would like to express my deep gratitude to Prof. Dr. László Sólyom, former President of the Republic of Hungary, offering me a generous fellowship to carry out research in the prestigious Vatican Apostolic Library.

Ich möchte ganz herzlich bedanken die finanzielle Unterstützung von KAAD (Katholischer Akademischer Ausländer-Dienst) für mein Forschungsaufenthalt in Berlin und die geistliche Unterstützung von Pater Max Cappabianca OP.

My special thanks are extended to the staff of the Doctoral School for Social Communications, Corvinus University of Budapest.

Un particolare ringraziamento spetta al Prof. Dr. Enrico Menestò per la Sua massima generosità e disponibilità dimostrata nei miei confronti durante i miei soggiorni italiani. Vorrei altrettanto ringraziarLe che mi ha reso possibile l'accesso alle fonti di primo rango riguardanti gli studi su Angela da Foligno e il suo tempo.

Szívből köszönöm és végtelenül hálás vagyok szüleimnek és családomnak a kifogyhatatlan szeretetért és mindennemű támogatásért, amelyet ezen az úton adtak. Köszönöm barátaimnak, hogy a hétköznapiakban elkísértek és támogattak.

Abschließend möchte ich mich für die unendliche Unterstützung und Liebe von Alexander bedanken.

“My secret is mine.”
Angela of Foligno, Liber

“Tell me, can you picture yourself to be a mystic?”
“That would certainly be the last thing that I could think about myself. Can you then
picture yourself as one?”
“It could even be that I am one. How much more in my life have I ‘dreamt’ than one
ought actually to allow oneself, thus I never feel entirely dependably at home. It is, as I
could (and want) just as well as also to withdraw myself entirely from everything.”
A conversation between Marianne and Max Weber recounted by Eduard Baumgarten
Adair-Totef 2016, p.24

ABSTRACT

Medieval Female Mysticism and Weber's Charismatic Authority: The Case of Angela of Foligno is the topic of the following investigation. The research focuses on three key issues, namely, medieval female mysticism, the role and presence of Angela of Foligno, charisma – charismatic authority as Max Weber conceived of it. The research question is the following: is it possible to consider medieval female mysticism – emphasizing the case of Angela of Foligno – as a charismatic authority in a Weberian sense.

To make possible such an investigation of this complex and enormous topic, it has to be narrowed sharply regarding two aspects. On the one hand, regarding mysticism, and on the other hand, Weber's theory of authorities. As far as mysticism as a concept, the following authors and their works are considered fundamental in this dissertation: Inge (1938); von Hügel (1908); Butler (1922); Brunner (1924); Peers (1924); Stolz (1936); Zaehner (1957); Pepler (1957); Knowles (1967); Katz (1978); Louth (1981); de Certeau (1982); Bouyer (1986); McGinn (1991), and Sık (1996).

Since the study is written in the domain of social studies aiming to give a sociodimensional model of the interpretation of mysticism, it inevitably requires prior knowledge regarding the relation of mysticism and social dimension (cf. Klaniczay 1994; Máté-Tóth 2007; Loades 2010; McGinn 1996; Katz 2013; Mooney 2007; Ruffing 2001; Hollywood 2012).

The central figure of the investigation is Angela of Foligno (1248-1309, a medieval Umbrian saint who represents the blossoming female spiritual revival of her time. Medieval female mysticism is a focus of contemporary scholarship and so is the figure of Angela of Foligno. A number of works is taken as the basis of the discussion (Puskely 1990; Schütz 1932; Ijjas 1976; Jørgensen 1938; Menestò 1992; Andreoli 2006; Cervigni 2005; Tar 2005; Thier-Calufetti 1985; Arcangeli 1995; Bassetti-Toscana 2012; Alfonsi 1995; Thorold 1900; Ruh 1990).

The last key issue of the investigation is the Weberian theory of charisma and its impact on societal interaction based on a strictly text centered analysis of the concept in Weber's entire work. Weber established a theoretical framework to investigate the question of authority based on its legitimacy in modern societies. Based on that very

legitimacy he distinguished traditional, legal-rational and charismatic authorities. The present work investigates only the latter, charismatic authorities (Weber 1905; 2002; 1922; 1976; 1951; 1958; 1993; 1994; 2013; Sohm 1912; 1923; 1892; Riesebrodt 1999; Turner 2003; Adair-Toteff 2015; 2016; D'Avray 2010; Mommsen 1974; Schluchter-Solomon 1996).

This dissertation aims to prove through a Weberian analysis of Angela's work, the *Liber*, that Angela is a charismatic leader in the Weberian sense and her case study can be used as a model for further investigation on the topic. To do so, the work consists of six chapters. Chapter 1 outlines the significance and topicality of the project. Chapter 2 introduces the life and context of Angela of Foligno. Chapter 3 outlines Weber's theory of charisma with numerous direct quotations from Weber and their explanations. Chapter 4 addresses the legacy of Weber's theory of charisma, examining the question of authority, therapy and the postmodern condition. Chapter 5 provides the central point of the dissertation in the Weberian analysis of *Liber*. Chapter 6 summarizes the findings of the dissertation and draws the possible conclusions of the project.

CHAPTER 1

SIGNIFICANCE AND TOPICALITY OF THIS DISSERTATION

1.1. Introduction

The current dissertation is dedicated to discussing medieval female mysticism as a charismatic authority in a Max Weberian sense, introducing a new social scientific approach in the flourishing field of interpretations. Until fairly recently scholarship has focused on mysticism especially as an individual experience with the ultimate reality neglecting its social dimension. In this work I argue for a sociodimensional model of the interpretation of mysticism analyzing the figure of Saint Angela of Foligno, the most important Franciscan female mystic.

Before doing so, however, I provide a general introduction to mysticism. What is it? What is it all about? What is the aim of mysticism and what is it for? In this very introduction I present the various definitions of mysticism in order to understand the concept. Furthermore, I give a brief overview of the mystical tradition of Abrahamic religions in connection with love mysticism. Love mysticism is a general characteristic of medieval mystical traditions, and, as such, it is essential for a more profound understanding of medieval female mysticism discussed later. In addition, I find it important to provide a brief introduction to the conceptual framework of understanding mysticism. It is inevitable to discuss tangentially the medieval and modern theological understanding of it, the findings of psychology of religion in this regard, and modern classifications theory. Certainly, the feminist approach and the summary of the social dimension of mysticism would fit in this part. However, I find them so crucial that I dedicate major attention to them later in this chapter.

To understand better the emerging presence of Angela of Foligno in our time, I want to introduce her as a member of the Franciscan Third Order, focusing on the dominant presence of the Franciscan Order and the Women's Movements in the late

Middle Ages. Another important fact about Angela is her equivalent canonization by Pope Francis in 2013, which casts light on her significance and topicality as well.

In the third part of the chapter my focus is on the emerging interest in medieval female mysticism which cannot be other than multidisciplinary. The Study of Religions, Theology, and Gender Studies are all fields of relevance regarding this topic. Special attention is given to feminist scholarship, which contributed the most to the dissemination and interpretation of medieval female mysticism. A detailed, nonetheless quite inventory-like introduction aims to overview the most relevant scholars of feminist scholarship who devoted much attention to the topic. The pioneering work of Evelyn Underhill opens this part, then the 1980's feminist turn directs my focus to scholars like Grace Jantzen, Elisabeth Petroff, Caroline Bynum-Walker and Amy Hollywood.

In the last part of this introduction the approach itself is in the spotlight. Using different views of major scholars, Angela will be discussed as an original case. In this examination my aim is to understand how the major scholars thought about Angela, and how many different approaches can be used to understand her person and work in a better way. At the end of the introduction I propose a bold new approach to analyse Angela of Foligno using Max Weber's theory on charismatic authority.

1.1.1. A General Introduction to Mysticism

Generally saying, mysticism refers to claims of immediate knowledge of the Ultimate Reality by direct personal experience (von Hügel 1908; Butler 1922; Brunner 1924; Peers 1924; Stolz 1936; Jones 2005; Cross-Livingstone 2005; King 2010). In 1899 Dean W. R. Inge already described twenty-five different definitions of mysticism (Inge 1899). Since then, and especially in recent years there has been a significant increase in interest in mysticism. It has sometimes been suggested that mysticism is the aim of all religion. Some scholars suggest that mysticism is the common core in all religion (Huxley 2010). Meanwhile some deny this (Zaehner 1957).

Mysticism and mystical (*mysticos*) are terms of long traditions. *Mystical* reflects the esoteric nature of the Greco-Roman mystery religions whose content is addressed only to insiders (those of who were not initiated were excluded). The word *mystical* and *mysticism* derive from the Greek verb *muo* which means “to close, to lock, to close one's eyes or one's lips, to remain silent”.

In the Greek mystical cults the word *muein* “remaining silent” is presumably referred to the secret content of the initiation ceremony. In later periods, especially in Neoplatonic theories, mystical silence turned into wordless meditation. Mysticism has many interpretations in Christianity, in non-Christian religions, in the field of the Study of Religions and in the various modern religious trends as well. However, a common feature lies in each interpretation. All those who lived a mystical experience say that "they experienced God" (Sik 2010).

Regarding the mystical trends of the Abrahamic religious traditions, the Middle Ages was definitely a peak period. Judaism, Christianity and Islam all acknowledge the spiritual *eros* which becomes a defining characteristic in the medieval period. Love mysticism was a concept in which one's personal love of God is decisive.

I begin with the Christian tradition of it. During the 12th century the Christian religion was transformed. The most decisive feature of this transformation was in God's anthropomorphic characteristics. God appeared as love. To prove this statement, I want to quote Wilhem St. Thierry: “When the object of thought is God and the will reaches the stage at which it becomes love, the Holy Spirit at once infuses Himself by way of love [...] The understanding of the one thinking becomes the contemplation of one loving” (Jones, 2005, 6349). The most famous figure of Christian love mysticism was Saint Bernard of Clairvaux and his sermons on the Song of Songs (‘Sermones super Cantica Canticorum’) (ed. princ. Brocard 1508) (Klaniczay 1994). In these his topics range from the practical life of the monk to the mystical confrontation between the bridegroom and bride of the Canticle using an allegory of the bridegroom as Christ and the bride sometimes as the Church, and sometimes as himself (Cross-Livingstone 2005).

Nonetheless, with a sharp accentuation of law and orthodoxy, Islam became a fertile soil for the intense personal experience of Allah's love. Most Islamic mystical trends can be characterized by love mysticism. A lot of texts are similar to the late medieval mystical texts of Christianity. The biggest figure of early Sufi love mysticism was Rabiah. “Oh, my Lord, the stars are shining and the eyes of men are closed, and kings have shut their doors, and every lover is alone with his beloved, and here am I alone with Thee” (Smith, 1928, 22). The climax of Sufi mystical theology was the work of Shaykh al-Junayd, who even adopted Plotinus's theory. The greatest Islamic theologian, Al-Ghazali left his teaching post to live as a wandering Sufi for eleven years. With his life experience he tried to emphasize the primacy of experience instead of dogmatics. Finally, the finest Persian mystical poetry was often expressed in erotic

language. The work of Jalal-al-Din Rumi shines with timeless beauty. Attar and Ibn-al-Arabi's influences are visible on Rumi's works. "[...] I have put duality away, I have seen that the two worlds are one: One I seek, One I know, One I see, One I call. He is the first, He is the last, He is the outward, He is the inward" (Nicholson, 1898, 125). Later on in the territory of Iran appeared the first dervish convents. One of them was founded by Rumi himself. After the 15th century on, Islamic mysticism receded. Only in recent decades has there been a new turbulent revival of this tradition, expressed in Sufi organizations (www.suficenter.org).

Finally, Judaism has such a variety of mystical traditions that it is hard to find a shared point for reflecting on it. Gershom Sholem, the outstanding scholar of this field, emphasizes the eschatological nature of Jewish mysticism as a possible common core (Sholem 1941). In early times, the esoteric Merkavah mysticism was present with some gnostic contents up to the 7th century, presumably exerting influence on medieval German Hasidism. The popular movement of Hasidism itself started in the 12th century and lasted until the 19th century. It was closely related to *halaka* (law). The early development of Hasidism was registered in *Sefer Hasidim* (The Book of the True), it had an eschatological character and showed similarity to Neoplatonism. While Merkavah mysticism was contemplative, Hasidism was mainly characterized by prayer and retreat. The origin of one of the most famous Jewish mystical traditions, Kabbalah originated in 12th century Spain. It is known as a system of Jewish theosophy, using an esoteric method of interpretation of the Old Testament. It was believed to reveal to its initiates hidden doctrines (Cross-Livingstone 2005). It pervaded gnostic theology. The main work of Kabbalah is *The Zohar* (Book of Splendor). According to the Jewish tradition, *The Zohar* is presumably the work of rabbi Moses de Leon. The complex content of the work fascinated already the medieval and renaissance Christian theologians and philosophers alike.

After the brief overview of the most significant sources and dimensions of the Abrahamic religious traditions regarding mysticism, I want to introduce a possible conceptual framework for the understanding of mysticism.

1.1.2. A conceptual framework to understand mysticism: Approaches to medieval Christian mysticism

I want to introduce the concept of mysticism in a broad interpretative framework, proving that the concept cannot be fixed in rigid, closed structures. Thus, I aim to present different constructions of mysticism: the medieval and modern theological constructions, the psychology of religion approach, and modern classification theories.

One can find many different ideas and authors during the Middle Ages regarding the interpretation of mysticism and mystics. No broad consensus among them existed. However, the medieval theological interpretation of mysticism is symbolized by the figure of Pseudo-Dionysios Areopagite. Below, I point out the contradiction in his works in connection with mysticism. In his work about *Mystical Theology* he states those who are concerned with mystical themes must abandon all that is perceivable and spiritual, existent and non-existent, and without any insight have to merge with the One who is above all essence and cognition. Therefore, one must allow Him to penetrate into the supernatural light of divine darkness in a purely liberated inspiration. The higher one gets, the more words are rarefied; there is silence in the darkness (*alogia*) and lack of knowledge (*anoesis*). Therefore, theology must be denying, according to Dionysios. That is why Dionysios is known primarily as the author of negative theology during the Middle Ages. God is not perceivable, unknown, non-existent, and not non-existent. At the same time, Pseudo Dionysos calls the divine cognition mystical and points to a dual tradition in theology. One of these is hidden and mystical, meanwhile the other open and palpable.

As we can see, then, on the one hand, mysticism serves to express a divine knowledge beyond all knowledge, and, on the other hand, the knowledge regarding God is the content of mysticism. Medieval theologians inclined to make the mystical divine knowledge one of the categories of their rational system, in some ways rationalizing the irrational. In later centuries, however, the two types of theological tradition are present in different ways, including the interpretations of the most modern theologians.

1.1.3. A modern theological framework: Hans Urs von Balthasar

Balthasar, first of all, states that the concept of "Christian mysticism" opens up a never ending interpretational process. Originally, all was conceived mystical which had to do in some way with the divine reality within the Bible and the liturgy (Beierwaltes, Balthasar and Haas, 2008). In a later part of the study he accepts the classic formula of

the Middle Ages (St. Thomas, Bonaventura, Gerson), according to which mysticism is nothing but *cognitio Dei experimentalis* (Vauchez, 1998). That divine reality is not only conceptual but an existential experience.

The specific nature of Christian mysticism stems from the fact that it is not human beings who start searching for God (Hildegard, Angela of Foligno and Brigitta of Sweden), but God follows – unexpectedly and spontaneously – in the footsteps of man. Of course the human desire to search for God cannot be excluded. However, in contrast to other non-Christian mysticism, the particular nature of Christian mysticism comes from the fact that Christ is the path to be followed. So the decisive maxim is that the measure of perfection is human obedience and skills. According to Balthasar's concept of Christian mysticism, there are three important details: (1) the primacy of mystery, (2) the personal experience that every believer obtains with the mystery of the Cross, and (3) the special experience of some believers (mystical experience).

The approach of the psychology of religion to describe mystical experiences was first introduced by William James. He established an intellectual framework for the comparative study of mysticism and the religious experience in general. Four distinctive features are used to separate the altered state of consciousness in the mystical experience, according to William James's model, are as follows: ineffability, noetic quality, transiency, and passivity. Those who are in a mystical state of mind cannot formulate or say what they experience. The content of the experience cannot be verbally phrased and cannot be communicated to anyone else. It also follows that no one who has not gained such an experience can understand it. Furthermore, the mystic feels his/her circle does not understand him/her. The mystical state is characterized by deep spiritual realizations. At the same time, the third feature of the experience is its transiency. The mystical experience is limited in duration. With a few examples, it takes 30 minutes or maximally an hour. Finally, passivity characterizes this particular state. In a sense the mystic feels that his/her own power and decision-making ability is abolished and a supreme power takes control of it.

Actual religious mysticism begins exactly when God's direct presence suddenly becomes detectable. One of its features is cosmic consciousness. This consciousness manifests itself in different religions. So in this regard James talks about yoga, the dhjана meditation of Buddhism, Sufi mysticism, taken from a quote by Al-Ghazali, and, finally, the mystics of Christian churches, especially John of the Cross, and Theresa of

Avila. The most important need for mysticism is to link the gap between the individual and the Absolute.

1.1.4. The modern question of classifications

As it has already been mentioned, according to Aldous Huxley, mysticism represents a common core in all of the major world religions (Huxley 2010). As a contrapoint, R.C. Zaehner suggests that there are three fundamental types of mysticism. The first type is *theistic*, with most forms of Jewish, Christian, Islamic mysticism and occasional Hindu and Buddhist examples belonging here. The second type is *monistic*, which is characterized by the experience of unity of one's own soul, with Buddhism and Hindu schools such as Samkhya and Advaita Vedanta being the main representatives. The third type is *panenhenic* or *nature mysticism*. Here we have drug induced mysticism, animistic experiences, and the writings of poets like Wordsworth and William Blake (Zaehner 1957).

Finally, the current way of the study of mysticism is a comparative way, which is considered as the latest and most efficient way to study the varieties of mysticism (Katz 2013). After this short introduction to the study of mysticism we can see that there are so many interpretations as many authors.

The following section aims to continue this introduction but tries to be more specific, providing insight into medieval female mysticism as well. The reason for this introduction is to approach, step by step, the figure of Angela of Foligno, the most important Franciscan female mystic.

1.2. Angela of Foligno: The Most Important Franciscan Female Mystic

The heyday of the mystical in the Middle Ages was characterized by dominant female voices starting with 1200. The big opening of this special female wing in the history of mysticism is labelled by the presence of Hildegard of Bingen (1098-1179), a Benedictine abbess, the Sybill of Rhine (Ruh 2006). Beginning with her childhood, she was subject to supernatural religious experiences and exerted a significant influence during her life on Emperor Frederick of Barbarossa and various kings, prelates, and saints with her correspondence (Cross-Livingstone 2005).

Another important exponent of female mysticism was a contemporary of Hildegard's, the Benedictine Elisabeth of Schönau (1129-1164), who became famous for her ecstatic visions. This period is characterized by persons like Marie of Oignies (1177-1213), the Beguine who was recorded by Jacques de Vitry, then Beatrice of Nazareth (1200-1268), a Flemish Cistercian nun, a mystic as well, and the prioress of Abbey of Our Lady of Nazareth, Hadewijch, the mystic of Brabant, another Beguine Mechtild of Magdeburg, and finally the German Benedictine Gertrud of Helfta and many others female voices (McGinn 1998). The medieval mystical heyday of women lasted until the end the 1500s. Afterwards, a new revival of the female mystics is detectable only in the 20th century.

However, for my examination, a Franciscan tertiary plays the dominant role. In the sections below, my focal mystical figure, Angela of Foligno will be introduced.

1.2.1. Magistra Theologorum

Saint Alphonsa, Bridget of Sweden, Claire of Assisi, Francisca Josefa de la Concepción, Veronica Giuliani, Jutta of Kulmsee, Mary of Jesus of Ágreda, and Juana de la Cruz Vázquez Gutiérrez, Saint Angela of Foligno are all Franciscan female mystics. However, the 13th century Umbrian tertiary, Saint Angela of Foligno stands out from among the above mentioned women, because she is honoured as the greatest Franciscan female mystic of all times. Furthermore, it is also important to admit that Angela's presence is a field of interest for various scholarly approaches. It is worth taking a look at the many ways that her legacy is studied.

1.2.2. Angela in contemporary studies

To this day Angela remains a dominant figure in scholarship. She continues to be the focus of the works of philology (Thier and Calufetti, Enrico Menestò), historiography (Kurt Ruh, Claudio Leonadio, Giovanni Pozzi, Romana Guarnieri), theology (Alessandra Bartolomei Romagnoli), feminist scholarship (Petroff, Jantzen, Bynum-Walker, etc.), and even in the arts (Giovanna Bruschi).¹ Angela's unique voice and presence is an everlasting source for scholars from all fields. However, in the following chapters of my study I need to focus on a possible sociodimensional approach. Before doing so, it is important to introduce Angela's person more closely, invoking Evelyn Underhill and Peter Dronke's works.

1.2.3. Angela of Foligno in the mirror of Evelyn Underhill

“In his contemporary the ‘Blessed’ Angela of Foligno (1248-1309) who was converted from a sinful life to become a tertiary hermit of the Franciscan Order we have a mystic of the first rank whose visions and revelations place her in the same class as St. Catherine of Genoa and St. Teresa. Known to her followers as the Mistress of Theologians, and numbering among her disciples the brilliant and tempestuous ‘spiritual’ friar Ubertino da Casale, the lofty metaphysical element in Angela’s mysticism suggests the high level of spiritual culture achieved in Franciscan circles of her time. By the sixteenth century her works, translated into the vernacular, had taken their place amongst the classics of mysticism. In the seventeenth they were largely used by St. François de Sales, Madame Guyon, and other Catholic contemplatives. Seventeen years older than Dante, whose great genius properly closes this line of spiritual descent, she is a link between the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries in Italian mysticism.” (Underhill 1995, 421)

Underhill operates with a theological viewpoint on Angela, demonstrating also her literary capacities and social presence as well. Meanwhile Peter Dronke, in his analysis of great woman writers of the Middle Ages, highlights the fact Angela was an object of a cult in her time, and the whole period was pervaded by a religious

¹ Angela in the Arts: in September and October, 2014, the exhibition of Giovanna Bruschi on "*The Mystical Journey of Angela of Foligno*" was held in Assisi, Santa Maria degli Angeli, Museo della Porziuncola, Sala S. Pio X.

hypersensitiveness favouring the female mystical presence. The following quotation aims to provide more detail to this picture:

"Angela of Foligno, revered by Franciscan advisers in her lifetime, became the object of a cult. However extravagant her emotional utterances, Angela did not lay claim to any new belief, any idea that challenged the prevailing world-picture of theologians in her time. Her innovations were startling, yet they were confined, we might say, to the form in which she experienced and retold accepted spiritual realities; she did not impinge upon their content. Thus one can begin to understand why her *Memorial*, her book, was unfailingly treasured, whilst the far greater book of her contemporary, Marguerite Porete, led to Marguerite's being atrociously put to death." (Dronke 1988, 216–217)

Although Angela did not lay claim to any new beliefs, as a charismatic personality she gathered followers around herself. According to Dronke, Angela's *Memoriale* was treasured during the Middle Ages because of the "politically correct" content in consensus with the Church teachings, while Marguerite Porete's *Mirror*² caused Marguerite to be sentenced to death. In my opinion, however, a different approach is needed to understand this phenomenon. Angela came from a rich and noble family of the time, while Marguerite came from peasant origins just like Joan of Arc. The question why Marguerite and Joan of Arc were condemned with many other women of low social status has far more to do with their origins than the new doctrines they claimed. The question of noblemen of mystical visions and new doctrines was different, just like in the case of Giordano Bruno.

Finally, it should repeatedly mentioned that Angela was a member of the Franciscan Third Order and she achieved a "high level of spiritual culture" in Franciscan circles of her time. In the following section I will outline schematically the story of the Franciscans and the dominant women's movements of the time.

² Porete, M. (1993). *The Mirror of Simple Souls*, translated by Ellen L. Babinsky. New York: Paulist, 186.

1.3. Franciscans³ and the Women's Movements

1.3.1. A brief sketch of the Franciscan Order (*Ordo Fratrum Minorum*, or O.F.M)

In this brief description of the Franciscans I use the works of Paul Lachance, who as member of the O.F.M. and carried out several studies and summaries on the history of the Franciscan movement.

Franciscan spirituality dominated the period of Angela of Foligno. Saint Francis and his brethren worked in response to significant social and economic changes in Europe. The presence of the Franciscan Order responded to these changes with a radical observance of the gospel, including following in the footsteps of Christ in poverty, renouncing all forms of power, and sharing the conditions of those living on the margins of society. The radical identification with Christ peaks in the stigmata of Saint Francis (Lachance 1993, 29).

From the 13th century on, the importance and the message of Francis dominated the religious field. "The Franciscan Springtime is unique in history, it renewed both the Church and the society after Francis death. Franciscan fraternity had grown phenomenally and had become a solid institution" (Bouyer 1968).⁴ The rapid Franciscan expansion reached all corners of Europe and the Orient as well. Thanks to this growth, the Order became an international organization. However, the expansion was not without its problems, most of all regarding the question of poverty:

"The center of gravity within the Order moved to those who believed that the Order should develop in other ways and its message be adapted to growing numbers and changing times. The rising basilica in Assisi, the vast sums of money collected for it, the growth of the scholastic movement in the university towns, the clericalization of the Order, the

³ The relevant literature regarding the Franciscans and the biography of Saint Francis is the following: Raoul Manselli *St. Francis of Assisi*, trans. Paul Duggan. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1988; David Flood O.F.M., *Francis of Assisi and the Franciscan Movement*. Quezon City, Philippines: The Franciscan Institute of Asia, Contact Publication, 1989; David Flood O.F.M and Thaddeé Matura O.F.M., *The Birth of a Movement: A Study of the First Rule of St. Francis*, trans. Paul Schwartz and Paul Lachance, O.F.M. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1975; *Francis and Clare: The Complete Works*, trans. Regis Armstrong, O.F.M. Cap., and Ignatius Brady, O.F.M. New York: Paulist Press, 1982; Théophile Desbonnets, O.F.M., *From Intuition to Institution: The Franciscans*, trans. Paul Duggan and Jerry Du Charme. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1988; John Moorman, *A History of the Franciscan Order: From its Origins to the Year 1517*. London: Oxford University Press, 1968; reprint, Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1988.

⁴ Cfr. Leclercq, J., Vandenbroucke, F., & Bouyer, L. (1968). *The spirituality of the Middle Ages*. Desclee Company.

downpour of ecclesiastical privileges, and the clashes with the secular clergy – all were symptomatic of the new age.” (Lachance 1993, 30)

After Francis’s death, who in person was a charismatic leader, the natural order of charisma became a traditional authority in a Weberian sense, whose first characteristic is institutionalization. (The Weberian analysis of charismatic authority and its use regarding female mysticism will be discussed in Chapter 3 of this dissertation.) It might be that in the case of Weber’s rationalisation one has to face the fact of routinization as well. At all times social status can be understood as a charismatic and, at the same time, bureaucratic authority as well. Society is characterized by this kind of tension. These two criteria are sovereign and independent of each other.

During St. Bonaventure’s (1257-1274) generalate, the moderate reform did not meet the expectations of the radical party of the order, who wanted a more literal fidelity to the original Franciscan ideals. The crisis that the Order underwent in the late 13th century divided it into two big groups: the *zelanti* or Spirituals, and the community or conventuals. The Spiritual party was a coherent group with remarkable figures like Peter John Olivi, Pietro da Macerata, Angelo of Clareno, and Ubertino of Casale. Their most important doctrines or teachings were the preference for rural eremitism and the exaltation of sufferings in conformity with Christ’s experiences, and the observance of the Rule and Testament of St. Francis. The question of fidelity to the founder’s intentions was a crucial one, with especially the renunciation of power and a radical dispossession of material goods (*usus pauper*) being in the center of the raging controversy (Lachance 1993, 30-31).

After the Council of Lyons in 1274 the dispute between the two parties escalated. Pope Clement V attempted to reconcile the warring factions, promulgating the bull *Exivi de paradiso* at the Council of Vienne in May 1312, but the attempt failed.

“Finally, the coup de grace to the gross-roots revolt was dealt, again by John XXII (this time encouraged by the Dominicans), with the publication of *Cum inter nonnullos* (12 November 1323), with condemned as heretical the doctrine of the absolute poverty of Christ and his disciples. This tenet was shared by the Spirituals and the Community, as testified by a decision made by the Franciscan General Michael of Cesena at the general Chapter held in Perugia in 1322.” (Lachance 1993, 33)

1.3.2. The Penitential Movement

An increasingly educated and emancipated laity was emerging in the religious sphere, dominated by mystical-ethical lines which formed part of a complex penitential movement. The Franciscan expression of the penitential movement was instrumental in shaping the climate for Angela's spiritual journey. The Franciscan Third Order of Penance had a great impact in the 13th century. The bull *Supra Montem* (1289), the *Regula bullata* issued by the Franciscan Pope Nicholas IV, achieved more or less fixed status for the Penitent Movement as a distinct organization (Lachance 1993, 34).

The penitents enjoyed many privileges of the ecclesiastical state. They were obliged to wear a simple garb of plain colours, to go to mass regularly, say the seven canonical hours, go to confession and receive communion three times a year, keep certain fasts, live peacefully among themselves and serve as peacemakers in society, serving the poor, the sick and the lepers; their attendance at dances and spectacles was forbidden. Virgins lived with their parents, and widows – as the case of Saint Angela of Foligno shows – often lived with other penitents in the house of the deceased husbands (Lachance 1993, 34).

“The penitential movement, moreover, appealed to a number of mystics and anchorites who needed religious affiliation but could not live and work happily in any of the existing monasteries or religious houses. Among those of the late thirteenth century, the names of three members of the Franciscan Third Order are outstanding: St. Margaret of Cortona, Pier Pellinagno, the comb-maker of Siena made immortal by Dante, and Bl. Angela of Foligno.” (Lachance 1993, 35)

1.3.3. The Women's Movement⁵ and Franciscan Women of the Time

One of the most characteristic features of religious life in the 12th and 13th centuries is the considerably active presence of women in the public sphere. The new

⁵ For more on the women's movement in the Middle Ages, see:

Brenda M. Bolton, “*Mulieres sanctae*” in *Sanctity and Secularity: The Church and the World*, ed. Derek Baker, *Studies in Church History* 10 (Oxford: Blackwell, 1973), 77-95; Caroline Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987) Grundmann, *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter*; Richard Kieckhefer, *Unquiet Souls: Fourteenth-Century Saints and Their Religious Milieu* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984); Maria Consiglia de Matteis, ed., *Idee sulla donna nel medioevo* (Bologna: Patron Editore, 1981) “*Woman, Power and the Pursuit of Holiness in Medieval Christianity*,” in *Women of Spirit: Female Leadership in the Jewish and Christian Tradition*, ed. Rosemary Ruether and Eleanor McLaughlin (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1979), 99-130 and Vauchez, *Les laïcs au moyen âge*

penitent lifestyle was especially successful among women. Even the official church acknowledged this significant female presence by increasing the number of beatifications and saint processes. Furthermore, medieval women excelled in writing visionary literature communicating their experiences. Monica Furlong argues on the social influence of visionary women as follows:

"Because of their visionary and prophetic qualities, the women were influential in their private lives as well as in their newfound public personae. Margery's rude and disobedient son returned from a stay in Europe a changed man, changed, he said, because of her prayers. The Spiritual Franciscan Ubertino da Casale, describing the influence of Angela da Foligno upon him, said, 'No one who had known me before could doubt that the Spirit of Christ was begotten anew within me through her,' and his words were echoed by friends and disciples of many other holy woman." (Furlong 1996, 9)

The female status in the Middle Ages was a complex one, however, it is important to note the most successful achievement of women was in the religious sphere. The first time in Christian history, the Beguines women movement was a specifically female influence on the development of laity:

"In the Low Countries, for instance, great number of women, who became known as Beguines (and men, known as Beghards), congregated in more or less organized communal arrangements that allowed for a noncloistered combination of prayer and work [...] The Beguine program was based on the gospel and the apostolic church (*vita apostolica*) and it was characterized by the espousal of chastity and poverty, affective devotion to the humanity of Christ, extreme forms of asceticism, and an ardent love of Eucharist. Meditating on the suffering of Christ motivated conversion and subsequent desire to 'follow naked the naked Christ,' a leitmotif of the entire period. [...] Beguines, at times, developed eremitical tendencies and elaborated a strong nuptial mysticism that occasionally took on a clearly erotic bent." (Lachance 1993, 37)

As Eileen Power noted in a similar fashion on the other significant tendency of the time, *amor curtoise* was based on an erotic bent as well:

"It was the essence of courtly love that it should be sought and freely given; it could not be found in feudalism, which was often a parentel

arrangement binding children in the interests of land. Fiefs marry but men and women love. True, the adored lady was always a wife but always someone else's wife. This was one of the rules of the game.” (Power 2008, 24)

In Italy movements and associations similar to the Beguines and Beghards existed, where laity incarcerated themselves under the authority of a bishop or the local clergy. However, the great success of the Franciscan movement reached its peak in the work of Franciscan women who were especially sensitive to the Franciscan preaching. Among the women, St. Clare was in the first rank, associating herself with the early Franciscan movement. Clare's feminine dimension of the Franciscan charisma was an indispensable contribution, typified by her powerful personality.

“Among those who associated themselves more or less with the Franciscan current, two tendencies can be noted. One was characterized by a gospel life lived in proximity to and the service of the poor, St. Elisabeth of Hungary is the one who best exemplifies this ideal. Another and even more important tendency shifted the emphasis from service to the poor [...] to individual asceticism and contemplation. [...] Bl. Angela of Foligno, and countless others are examples of this trend.” (Lachance 1993, 39)

1.4. Angela's Canonization

1.4.1. The Genio Femminile

After the Second Vatican Council an emerging interest of the popes in the what has been called *genio femminile* can be detected. The female genius began to be part of Pope John Paul II's theology, was articulated the most in Pope Benedict XVI's work, and continues to be a focal point in Pope Francis's activity as well.

1.4.2. The Canonization of Saint Angela of Foligno

In an interview published in *L'Osservatore Romano*,⁶ the prefect of the Congregation for the Causes of Saints discussed why Pope Francis canonized St.

⁶ <https://www.catholicculture.org/news/headlines/index.cfm?storyid=20123> Downloaded: 04.03.2018 11:01; <https://www.franciscanmedia.org/saint-angela-of-foligno/> Downloaded: 04.03.2018 11:02

Angela of Foligno (1248-1309) on October 9, 2013. St. Angela, a member of the Third Order of St. Francis, was beatified in 1701. Pope Francis declared her a saint by “equivalent canonization”. In equivalent canonization – a procedure described by Pope Benedict XIV in the 18th century – the Pope waives the usual judicial process and declares that a blessed’s liturgical cult is extended to the universal Church. Pope Benedict XVI canonized St. Hildegard of Bingen (1098-1179) by equivalent canonization in 2012, and Pope Francis also canonized St. Peter Faber by equivalent canonization in December, 2013.⁷ “Equivalent canonization, though not frequent, is not rare in the Church,” Cardinal Angelo Amato had said in a December 2012 interview. “The best known are Gregory VII, Gertrude of Helfta, Peter Damian, Cyril and Methodius, John Damascene, the Venerable Bede, Albert the Great, Thomas More, John of Avila.” In another interview, Cardinal Angelo Amato said that St. Francis de Sales, St. Alphonsus Maria de’ Liguori, Pope Benedict XIV, Bishop Jacques-Bénigne Bossuet all held St. Angela of Foligno in high esteem. In the 1940s, various French bishops petitioned for her canonization.

In 1983, Saint John Paul II used Angela of Foligno’s writings as meditations during the Via Crucis in the Colosseum on Good Friday, and in 1993, he called her “teacher of theologians” during a homily. Later that day, as he prayed before her relics, he continued to praise her – prompting a petition for her canonization from her religious community.

In 2010, Pope Benedict devoted a general audience to Blessed Angela of Foligno, renewing interest in her. During the audience, he referred to her as a saint – a reference that is clearer in the original Italian (“la vita di santa Angela”) than in the official English translation (“Blessed Angela’s life”).⁸ Following Pope Benedict’s equivalent canonization of St. Hildegard in May 2012, the superiors of five Franciscan communities petitioned him to canonize St. Angela. In December 2012, Pope Benedict authorized the preparation of the necessary documentation.

<http://www.ciofs.org/portal/index.php/es/home-it/ciofs-notizie/999-the-canonization-of-angela-of-foligno-secular-franciscan> 04.03.2018 Downloaded: 04.03.2018 11:05

⁷ <https://www.catholicculture.org/news/headlines/index.cfm?storyid=20054> Downloaded: 21.05.2019

⁸ http://w2.vatican.va/content/benedict-xvi/en/audiences/2010/documents/hf_ben-vi_aud_20101013.html Downloaded: 21.05.2019

1.4.3. The only discourse that exists is the discourse presented in current social discourse

The fact that Angela was canonized by the Roman Catholic Church in 2013 can be interpreted as a continuous historical legitimization process of her charisma and charismatic authority inside the Catholic church and in Catholic spirituality. But her recognition is by far not limited to the ecclesiastical relations. Furthermore, the societal discourse on Angela reveals that Angela is present in contemporary public discourse, keeping updated her role and phenomenon.

However, the most vivid discourse about her is generated by feminist scholars. Because of this, the next part of this paper aims to introduce the feminist discourse on medieval female mysticism.

1.5. Feminist Interest of the Female Mysticism

At this stage of the study, I will introduce those major feminist scholars who comment on the figure of St. Angela of Foligno in connection with medieval female mysticism. Their work comprises various viewpoints and approaches, but in the focus of their understanding lies the particular phenomenon that we call medieval female mysticism.

Evelyn Underhill was the first woman who studied mysticism from a theological perspective, turning, with great interest, to the exploration of flourishing medieval female mysticism. She depicted each mystic as an individual phenomenon. In her investigation the embedding of the various mystics in their cultural context was unimportant.

Elizabeth Petroff's research interests include medieval literature, autobiography, and comparative mythology. She examines myths of the feminine and their relation to representations of the female subject in modern and postmodern texts. Petroff was amongst the first feminists who highlighted the questions of power related to medieval female mysticism.

The feminist philosopher and theologian Grace Jantzen worked on a new philosophy of religion from a feminist perspective. She had a major contribution to Christian mysticism and the foundations of modernity. In her later publications, she addressed phenomena like death and violence and emphasized them as characteristic

factors of Western culture. In my investigation of medieval female mysticism I regard Jantzen's statements about power, politics and mysticism as significant.

Caroline Walker Bynum is a historian and an outstanding medieval scholar who introduced the concept of gender into the study of medieval Christianity. Her works mostly focus on the way medieval people understood the nature of the human body in the context of larger theological questions and spiritual trends. The topics she advanced and elaborated are wonderful blood, gender and the human body in medieval religion, the significance of food for medieval women, Jesus as mother, and Christian devotional objects in a comparative perspective.

Amy Hollywood's research interests include the history of Christianity, religion, gender and culture, and the theology and philosophy of religion. In the focus of her interest stands the enthusiasm based understanding of Christian mysticism. The topics she works on are the following: sensible ecstasy, and acute melancholy.

According to Miller's core statement in her summary study on *Eroticized violence in medieval women's mystical literature*, suffering and violence are defining characteristics of medieval women mystics. Two leitmotifs can be observed in female mystics, the eros and the violent suffering as *imitatio Christi*.

Miller (1999) argues that the earliest French feminists, known as the French feminist, like Julia Kristeva, Hélène Cixous and Luce Irigaray, elaborated on psychoanalytical theories of the female mysticism of the Middle Ages. Meanwhile, American feminists (Petroff, Jantzen, Hollywood) highlighted the sociopolitical aspects of the female mystics. A conspicuous point of her study is when she quotes Richard Kieckhefer's *Unquiet soul* in which the author portrays medieval women's piety as a sublimated sado-masochism (Miller 1999, 26–48).

After this short introduction of the feminist scholars, I will discuss in detail the ideas of the above mentioned feminist scholars on the topic.

1.5.1. Evelyn Underhill

Evelyn Underhill is well-known for her notable and already classic work, *Mysticism*, published in 1911. She was the first female lecturer of the Oxford Faculty of Theology. In this pioneering attempt – which became the most popular work of its genre – Underhill cleared the term mysticism from any other dubious terms often associated with mysticism, like the occult and magic. Underhill dismisses the leading work of the

time, William James's *The varieties of religious experience*. Regarding the structure of Underhill's book, it is divided in two major parts: an introduction to the term mysticism and an in-depth study of the nature and development of human consciousness. Outstanding thinkers like Bergson and Troeltsch influenced her life work. In Underhill's investigation, the focus is the whole mystery of the Cross. Her Christcentric attitude is akin to the mysticism of women in the Middle Ages, especially the Christ centism of Saint Angela of Foligno. She had great influence on the work of the feminist theologian Grace Jantzen.

"By 'mysticism' she means expression of the innate tendency of the human spirit towards complete harmony with the transcendental order, and she made no claims at this stage for any particular theological formula" (Loades 2010, 62).

According to the argumentation of Anne Loades, Underhill clearly distinguished Christian mysticism from any other mystical traditions of world religions.

"She distinguished Christian mysticism from other possibilities, and her reason for doing so is that she believes it to break through in the human species for the first time in the person of Christ himself. She knows perfectly well in making her claim to be at odds with most scholarship of the previous half-century, but then such scholarship does not embrace her understanding of the importance of mysticism." (Loades 2010, 66)

Furthermore, Loades points out the difficulty of Underhill's model:

"The difficulty with the whole scheme is not so much that the liturgy may and, on her understanding, actually did or should recapitulate the mystical life, but that the Christology which underlies it was seen to be problematic. It would be one thing to claim that Christ's life may be read in the way that she reads it, but she claims more than that – that Christ's life actually reveals the 'mystic way', exemplifies it, and thus illuminates for us the Christian doctrine of the divine and human in the incarnation." (Loades 2010, 67)

What Jantzen criticizes the most in Underhill's research – never denying Underhill's influential legacy – is neglecting the cultural context of women mystics. Studying the cultural context of mystics of all times is necessary to understand the exact positions of mystics in Church history.

"Although Grace Jantzen acknowledged that Evelyn Underhill was amongst other things a lay theologian, she had no interest in Underhill's

contribution to specifically Christian theology. On the one hand she acknowledged Underhill's contribution to the development of the study of mysticism, despite the fact that she quoted the works of the mystics without reference to their historical context. It is worth noting, however, that this citation method remains standard practice across a range of disciplines. On the other hand Jantzen argues that Underhill severs the connection between spirituality and social analysis and action. This argument fails to attend to what Underhill wrote and taught about the practical gifts of the mystics, but also about the importance of intercessory prayer, central to her theological convictions, as the mode of action of the life of prayer characteristic of contemplative religious life." (Loades 2010)

Grace Jantzen's contribution to the female mysticism will be discussed below, in this chapter.

1.5.2. Elizabeth Petroff

Elizabeth Petroff in her studies on *Medieval women visionaries* is among the first "mystical feminists" who relate the question of power to female mysticism of the Middle Ages. Women visionaries were viewed with ambivalence by male clerics, in Petroff's account. In the medieval world the only form of religious life open to women was a contemplative one. It was believed that women's religious impulses were naturally contemplative and visionary.

"Visions gave these women direction and freedom to act, for the transformative process mediated by visions created a transformed self that was not vulnerable to social structures and conventional behaviors" (Petroff 1978, 34). In the same study she distinguishes the mystic's seven stages of exercising power. "The texts of the visions point to seven distinct stages, each dominated by a specific content and attitude: Purgative, Psychic, Doctrinal, Devotional, Participatory, Unitive, and Ordinary" (Petroff 1978, 34–35).

In my discussion of the social dimension of mysticism at the end of this study I will address in more detail Petroff's ideas on saints and mystics in connection with power.

1.5.3. Grace Jantzen

Grace Jantzen (1948-2006) was a Canadian feminist philosopher of religion notable for her work on continental philosophy and Western medieval mysticism. Jantzen's major monographs are the following: *God's World, God's Body* (1984); *Julian of Norwich: Mystic and Theologian* (1987); *Power, Gender and Christian Mysticism* (1995); *Becoming Divine: Towards a Feminist Philosophy of Religion* (1998); and *Foundations of Violence* (2004).

"Jantzen's next study, *Power, Gender and Christian Mysticism* (1995), brought a new political development in the field of mysticism by linking it with feminist and continental philosophical thinking. She showed how the category and construction of mysticism was determined by gender politics, not least by showing how women mystics who lacked access to the Latin text brought about an authority through visions, and how the female body was displaced and abused in the construction of the mystical." (Carrette, 2006)

Jantzen in her study on "Feminists, philosophers, and mystics" challenges the widely held view that mysticism is essentially characterized by intense, ineffable, subjective experiences. The article is an attempt to show that mysticism has undergone a series of social constructions, which were never innocent of gendered struggles for power. Jantzen argues for mysticism as an agenda of power and focuses her scholarly interest on pointing out the importance of studying the social context, social justice and gendered structures of authority in connection with female mysticism:

"Only with the development of the secular state, when religious experience was no longer perceived as a source of knowledge and power, did it become safe to allow women to be mystics. Schleiermacher, for example, in his *Speeches on Religion*, is happy to proclaim the greater religious consciousness of women, whom he also saw as ideally maintaining domestic bliss (Schleiermacher 1799, 195837; Briggs 1985, 227-29)" (Jantzen 1994, 190)

Similarly to Petroff, Jantzen's theory on the political impact of mysticism will be discussed in the section about the social dimension of mysticism.

"No social construction is the property of only one small group; rather, the nature of a social construction is that the definition imposed in the interests of a

powerful group in society becomes constitutive of the society as a whole, as part of received knowledge" (Jantzen 1994, 200).

1.5.4. Caroline Bynum

Bynum's works are mostly focusing on the way medieval people understood the nature of the human body in the context of large scale theological questions and spiritual trends.

In her study on "Fast, feast, and flesh: The religious significance of food to medieval women", Bynum states that famine was a significant phenomenon in 13th century Europe. Fasting and feasting are at the heart of Christian tradition. André Vauchez, Richard Kiekhof, Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M. Bell wrote several papers on male and female saints of the years 1000-1700, demonstrating the fact that only 18% of the saints were women. However, of these women, 30% had extreme austeritiy as a central aspect of their sainthood. Fasting characterized female saints generally, and Eucharistic visions appeared far more frequently to women than to men. As her account affirms, "medieval people 'theologized' what people today 'medicalize'" (Bynum 1985, 14).

Furthermore, food had a dual interpretation in medieval times. On the one hand, food as *function* was a possibility in women's hands to control and manipulate both their bodies and their environment. On the other hand, food as *meaning* was the following: fasting, eating and feeding all meant suffering at that time, and suffering meant redemption. In late medieval theology the representation of Christ's crucifixion was more central and located than Christ's resurrection. "Communion was consuming - i.e., becoming - a God who saved the world brought physical, human agony. Food to medieval women meant flesh and suffering, and through suffering, salvation: salvation of self and salvation of neighbor" (Bynum 1985, 14). Women themselves meant food in medieval times, because of breast feeding. (The lactating Virgin as a central picture of medieval figurative arts is significant, cf. Bynum 1985).

Following David D'Avray comments on Bynum's work, she showed the following:

"how cautious one must be about classing the selfstarvation of religious women in the later Middle Ages as a kind of 'anorexia', as Rudolf Bell did in a controversial book. Instead Bynum plausibly argued that the religious

culture set a high value on selfabnegation; men had more freedom than women to choose to give up sex or wealth; food was one thing women controlled, so one thing they could choose to give up.” (D'Avray 2010, 7)

In another significant study by Bynum titled “Why all the fuss about the body”, she introduces the concept of body as performance, making three observations on the body. The first is that the body is a discussion of sex and gender studies. The second is that the body means discomfort, as body-as-trap. The third is that the body in Western philosophy always refers a duality, from Plato to Descartes, the body was perceived in a dualist conception. She pays close attention to Judith Butler’s performative feminism, introducing the concept of Butler’s “performative body”. Analyzing the body, she brings Luce Irigaray’s work into the discourse. Butler and Irigaray both study Plato’s *Timaeus* and *Republica* (Bynum 1995).

1.5.5. Amy Hollywood

Amy Hollywood dedicates an entire study to examining the relationship between Angela of Foligno and Georges Bataille in “‘Beautiful as a Wasp’: Angela of Foligno and Georges Bataille” (1999). In the 1930’s Bataille thought to reintroduce the sacred into modern industrial, secular societies. For Bataille, the power of the sacred lies in its ambiguity on violence. Sacrifice and violence are central in his thinking. Religious questions for Bataille were irrevocably political. His emphasis is on the “inner experience”. Two fundamental works of his on this issue are *Inner experience* (2014) and *Atheological summa*. According to Bataille’s argumentation, human beings must come to realize that they are not everything. Nothingness becomes God for Bataille. Bataille’s contemporaries, Sartre and Caillois also note the importance of Angela of Foligno. Bataille turns to mysticism as an alternative form of community building during the years of the insecure atmosphere between the Great Wars.

“It is impossible for me to read at least most books. I don’t have the desire. Too much work tires me. My nerves are shattered. I get drunk a lot. I feel faithful to life if I eat and drink what I want. Life is an enchantment, a feast, a festival: an oppressing, unintelligible dream, adorned nevertheless with a charm that I enjoy. The sentiment of chance demands that I look a difficult fate in the face. It would not be about chance if there were not an incontestable madness. I began to read, standing on a crowded train,

Angela of Foligno's Book of Visions. I'm copying it out, not knowing how to say how fiercely I burn the veil is torn in two, I emerge from the fog in which my impotence flails." (Hollywood 1999, 220-221)

Bataille finds his model in Angela's writing, he is the most important spokesperson of the Folignate in the 20th century. Mazzoni introduces this question as follows:

"Bataille's discussion of Angela is probably the most complex of the three 20th-century interpretations considered here. Unlike Beauvoir and Kristeva, Bataille does not dwell on Angela's eroticism, her anorexia, or her masochism, nor is he intent on psychoanalyzing her language, for he seeks to imitate rather than to criticize the mystical pleasures at which she is his chosen model." (Mazzoni 1991, 66)⁹

We can conclude at this point of the present paper that Angela is a well recognized person inside the Roman Catholic church and as well outside it – mainly in feminist scholarship. The outstanding interest in Angela's person and work suggests testing the possibility of the interpretation of her phenomenon as a charismatic person and charismatic authority in the sense of Max Weber. Such an approach constitutes the core focus of my thesis. The societal dimension of the mysticism was reflected by the

⁹ For a deeper understanding of Bataille's *Eroticism*, consider: "I would like to highlight this solution from the perspective of Georges Bataille who was perhaps the most important philosopher of eroticism in the first half of the 20th century. The erotic experience is close to the sacred – says Bataille – because both can shatter our lives fundamentally. It belongs to the essence of both to turn us inside out. "The erotic activity liberates the beings who participate in it, it reveals their deep-rooted continuity like waves that of the story sea " (Bataille 1992: 923). In his understanding, orgy is exaggeration, turmoil, and religious zeal (Bataille 2001 [1958]: 147). It opposes labour with confusion. Labour means discipline, while confusion is eroticism, which represents the inspiring and all confusing challenge of the extremes. The essence of eroticism is that it crosses the world of taboos, it is transgression, just as confusion transgresses the system of rules of order. In his work *Eroticism* (2001) Bataille systematically explains his concept of eroticism, which he often discussed in his earlier lectures and essays. His key notions include continuity and interruption, different levels of eroticism (body, heart, mysticism), and also the sacred and the profane. With regard to Christianity, he explains that this religion has built up a whole system of taboos and regarded them as sacred. Eroticism has been excluded from inside the religious system and expelled to the satanic sphere of sin. While pagan religions considered transgression sacred, Christianity sees sanctity in compliance and system. His considerations are, on the one hand, provocative and paint a unique picture of eroticism and Christianity. On the other hand, they are rough and equate one characteristic of Christianity with the whole. One could state also that Christianity has been trying to turn eroticism into its service at least as much as it has been trying to exclude it. Bataille also refers to this possibility when he gives a positive interpretation of sin from the perspective of redemption in the analysis of the theological term *felix culpa* (blessed sin). However, in the case of mysticism that is related to eroticism, he does not reflect on erotic spaces within the Christian religious system." Máté-Tóth, András, and Gabriella Turai *Amor vacui: Religious attempts to tame love* In: Eszter Kovats (ed.) *Love and Politics*. Budapest: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 2015. 35-45.

scholars mentioned above. I attempt to summarize the main statements of their work to demonstrate the appropriateness of the sociological approach I propose.

1.6. The charismatic authority approach¹⁰

1.6.1. A multidisciplinary interest: The social dimension of mysticism

In this specific context, I mean by mysticism what Jean de Gerson thought. The 15th century chancellor of the Sorbonne described it as an “experimental knowledge of God through the embrace of unity love”. The definition was also used by Saint Thomas Aquinas (2015), Saint Bonaventure (1987) and it reappears in the life work of the outstanding German historian, Kurt Ruh (1990).

The social dimension of mysticism covers both the institutional embodiment of mysticism in groups and movements and the influence of mysticism on the wider society and vice versa. Moreover, there are not just social but also political aspects to mysticism:

“The connection of questions of power to questions of mysticism is obvious as soon as one stops to consider that a person who was acknowledged to have direct access to God would be in a position to challenge any form of authority, whether doctrinal or political, which she saw as incompatible with the divine will. If defining mysticism is a way of defining power, then the question of who counts as a mystic is of immediate political importance.” (Jantzen 1994, 186)

As can be seen, according to Grace Jantzen, mysticism is always political and interconnected with questions of power. Jantzen argues that mysticism has undergone a series of social constructions, which were never free of gendered power games. The main research question is the following: what is mysticism? Is it an individual/private/subjective and direct experience of God, or does it have political and social implications as well? According to Jantzen, mysticism is always a question of defining and delimiting authority. Mysticism is a great agenda of power. In Christianity, struggles for authority have always been significant, especially in the medieval period, when struggles increased and mysticism was an overwhelming

¹⁰ An earlier version of this subsection appeared in the following article:
Turai, Gabriella (2017): “Medieval female mysticism and Weber's Charismatic Authority.” *Belvedere Meridionale* 29, 152-157.

phenomenon. Is it possible to say that in epochs where struggles for authority are dominant, mysticism is an frequent phenomenon? Jantzen provides brief insight into some ways in which mysticism has been socially constructed in the Christian West. In her investigation, she uses Foucault as her point of departure, and then she outlines a historical background of mysticism based on Bouyer (1968) and McGinn (1991) and then a philosophical background with the help of Swinburne (1979) and Alston (1991). Jantzen affirms that who is considered mystic changes from time to time.

Mystics have played prominent roles in the doctrinal development of their traditions, in reform, in renewal, and protest, and sometimes in secretarian, messianic, and millenarian movements (Jones 2005).

“At the end of the Middle Ages mystical union was to become the royal road of feminine holiness” (Vauchez 1981, 336).¹¹ Visions have given authority and power to women and, at the same time, have made these women insiders of the Church, too. With the help of visions, women have become able to change the world, build convents, found hospitals, and preach, and their visions made them role models for other women with a deeper knowledge of self. Saints and mystics are rule breakers, unconventional and unpredictable people (Petroff 1978). In summary, it can be observed that mysticism showed itself not only as a special kind of rationality but as a special kind of social power as well.

This very important correlation between mysticism and charismatic authority was suddenly referenced by many gender inspired authors in the 1980s: Petroff (1978), Jantzen (1995), Bynum (1987). Therefore, I focus on this feminist approach.

“In the high and late Middle Ages, numerous women visionaries across the European continent, including among many others the famous Gertrude the Great and Mechthild of Helfta, Mechthild of Magdeburg, Hadewijch of Antwerp, Bridget of Sweden, Catherine of Siena, Julian of Norwich, and Teresa of Avila claimed authority for themselves as spiritual teachers and based that claim at least in part on the visions they had received. The construction of mysticism could no longer exclude women.”
(Bynum 1987, 13-30)

¹¹ Vauchez, A. (1981). L'ideal de sainteté dans le mouvement féminin franciscain aux XIII e et XIV e siècles. Movimento religioso femminile e francescanesimo nel secolo XIII: Atti del VII Convegno internazionale, Assisi, 11-13 ottobre 1979, 315-37.

This affirmation is also valid regarding Saint Angela of Foligno, the central figure of the present dissertation.

Issues of gender have become prominent in the study of mysticism since the 1980s. This is only partly a reflection of the attention to such issues within the study of religion as a whole. More significantly, it is because, within many mystical traditions, women are better represented and have made more distinctive contributions than in other religious contexts. Leaving aside the unbidden nature of mystical experience, environments and ways of life associated with mysticism (such as asceticism, monasticism, and writing) has also favoured women. Even in patriarchal societies these contexts have been less subject to restrictive customs of ordinary society. Acknowledging the presence and contributions of women mystics is only part of the story, however. There are also specifically feminist critiques of how the lives, writings, and influence of women mystics continue to be evaluated in ways that fail to do justice to their distinctive contributions. A number of French women thinkers have taken particular interest in how some women mystics have been able to work beyond the restricting oppositions dogging so much of Western culture (male–female, body–soul, reason–emotion etc.) To phrase it simply, in the context of emerging feminist critics, alternative forms and approaches to rationality and power were expected and found in the reflections on medieval mysticism (Jones 2005)

1.6.2. The legacy and future of mysticism

Scholars as well as practitioners have recognized mysticism not just as a constant motif within religions but as a key to what is most important in religion. As such, mysticism tends to figure prominently in revisionist global theologies, metaphysical system building, New Age thought, debates about the relationship between world religions, and interdisciplinary approaches to art, language, society and human consciousness (Jones 2005).

1.6.3. Weberian approach: The charismatic authority in progress

Inspired by the social theory of Max Weber, I attempt to ask in what senses medieval female mysticism was a charismatic authority. The principal inspiration for this study is Weber's opus magnum *Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft*, which is structured synchronically and analytically rather than diachronically as a grand narrative. This work is a kind of *Summa* of ideal types for the study of world history: they are meant to

be corrected against the complexities of past societies (D'Avray 2010). In this work Weber distinguishes four kinds of rationality: *value* (alias conviction) rationality, *instrumental* rationality, together with the concepts of *formal* and *substantive* rationality. Besides these four kind of rationalities, in this section I am oriented towards what we might call the dynamics of stability: powerful forces interacting in ways that reproduced existing structures, while incorporating new elements of strength. For Max Weber, new social structures can emerge under the influence of charismatic leaders, or rather of their followers, for his ideal type is quite different from the modern usage of the word meaning 'magnetism' (D'Avray 2010).

Weber defines charisma as follows:

"a quality, deemed to be extraordinary [...] of a personality, on account of which this person is judged to be endowed with supernatural or superhuman or at least specifically extraordinary powers or properties, which are not accessible to everyone else, or as sent by God, or as an outstanding model and consequently a 'Leader'" (Weber 1922, 140)

In the light of another definition:

"charisma is the great revolutionary power in epochs that are in the grip of tradition. By contrast with the no less revolutionary power of ratio [...] charisma can be a transformation from the inside, which, born of necessity or enthusiasm, means a fundamental change in the direction of central convictions and actions with a completely new orientation of all attitudes to all specific forms of life and 'to the World' generally." (Weber 1922, 658)

In the case of Weber, society is influenced by two big forces: a charismatic and a rational one. While charisma revolutionizes from the inside, the ratio does it from without. Charisma is a revolutionary force and will whose impacts can change the attitude to the world and the acting directions in societies. This revolutionary power from within creates a central *metanoia* in the followers' attitude. Charisma is a disrupting force in history, it breaks the power of rational and traditional rules, and, above all, "overturns all notions of sanctity" (Weber 1922, 658). Charisma does not know any kind of respect for the longstanding creations of society. That is why Weber argues for charisma as a "specifically creative revolutionary force of the history" (Weber 1922, 658). Charisma and all of its transformations are highly intense social powers which can always change the status quo (Weber 2013, 1116–1117).

The medieval period is not short of examples of movements started by 'charismatic' individuals, though they did not necessarily survive very long (Aldebert, Valdes, or Saint Francis of Assisi). "In the case of Francis we meet a charismatic person, but he seems to expect to be obeyed even though he holds no office. Statements about 'charisma' in Weber are statements about the image of the leader in the minds of the followers" (D'Avray 2010, 106). On the one hand, I argue exactly for the very strong interaction of charisma as one individual quality based on the particular experience with God or Jesus Christ, but, on the other hand, this private spiritual interaction becomes social through the strong effect among the direct followers, and further, in the form of different institutionalizations. That simply means that charisma is authority.

Weber distinguishes between three 'pure' types of legitimate authority. The validity of claims to legitimacy may be based on: (1) rational grounds – resting on a belief in the legality of enacted rules and the right of those elevated to authority under such rules to issue commands (legal-rational authority); (2) traditional grounds – resting on an established belief in the sanctity of immemorial traditions and the legitimacy of those exercising authority under them (traditional authority); and finally, (3) charismatic grounds – resting on devotion to the exceptional sanctity, heroism or exemplary character of an individual person, and of the normative patterns or order revealed or ordained by he (charismatic authority) (Weber 1922).

Weber's term "charisma" was differently interpreted and conceived during the last century. As Martin Riesebrodt argues in his study on "Charisma in Max Weber's *Sociology of Religion*", Weber's charisma has received diverse and contradictory interpretations. Riesebrodt's essay argues that this diversity is caused less by the inadequate readings of Weber than by inconsistencies in Weber's own conceptualization. Weber introduced his concept of charisma in two different contexts (political sociology and sociology of religion). In his political sociology he formulates the ideal type of charismatic authority informed by Rudolf Sohm's *Canon Law* (Sohm 1892).

"Here we are interested above all in the second of the three types: rule by virtue of devotion to the purely personal 'charisma' of the 'Leader' on the part of those who obey him. For this is where the idea of vocation (Beruf) in its highest form has its roots. Devotion to the charisma of the prophet or the war-lord or the exceptional demagogue in the ekklesia or in parliament

means that the leader is personally regarded as someone who is inwardly 'called' to the task of leading men, and that the led submit to him, not because of custom or statute, but because they believe in him.” (Weber 1994, 312)

Meanwhile, Weber connects it in his sociology of religion with the anthropological debate of the turn of the century on magic and religion, especially the debate on pre-animism initiated by R. R. Marett, and uses it as an alternative for concepts such as *mana* or *orenda* (Riesebrodt 1999).

“For example, not every stone can serve as a fetish, a source of magical power. Nor does every person have the capacity to achieve the ecstatic states which are viewed, accordance to rules of experience, as the preconditions for producing certain effects in meteorology, healing, divination, and telepathy. It is primarily, though not exclusively, these extraordinary powers that have been designated by such special terms as "Mana," "Orenda," and the Iranian "Maga" (the term from which our word "magic" is derived). We shall henceforth employ the term "charisma" for such extraordinary powers.” (Weber 1993, 2)

“Both conceptualizations of charisma are located on quite different levels of abstraction, which Weber has not sufficiently clarified and systematized. This leads to inconsistencies, contradictions, and overgeneralizations. His claim of a supposedly anti-traditionalist or even revolutionary character of charisma is especially problematic. The article argues that while this claim may apply to certain types of charisma under specific conditions, many types of charisma actually seem to be integral parts of institutionalized and traditionalized social orders.” (Riesebrodt 1999, 1)

If we now turn to the core question of mysticism, we should keep in mind the aforementioned different understandings of Weber’s famous term *charisma*.

1.6.4. Conclusion and outlook

I think we can arrive at two main benefits through the reflections on the fundamental correlation between medieval mysticism and Weber’s understanding of charismatic authority as alternative to constructive rationality and social power. The

first benefit I call diachronic, which means a new approach to medieval mysticism with the sociological tools of Weber's theory. In this way we will be able to consider medieval female mysticism from the prison of modern individualism and open up new spaces for understanding medieval societies as well. However, for a social scientist the second benefit would be more interesting. In the time after the fall of communism and after the new political and cultural matrix in the whole of Europe, one can observe insecurity concerning modern rationality and democratic power – not only in Central and Eastern Europe. Social sciences could have a chance to contribute to original approaches and visions in searching for new ways of thinking and using power.

After this introductory chapter which addressed the concept of mysticism, the Franciscans and women's movements, the manifold female presence in the Middle Ages, and feminist interest on the topic of medieval female mysticism. Lastly the perspective of the dissertation was outlined. The next chapter examines the life and context of Angela of Foligno.

CHAPTER 2

THE LIFE AND CONTEXT OF ANGELA

2.1. Introduction

In this chapter I attempt to argue for the current mystic – Angela of Foligno – could be seen as a representative of her epoch and simultaneously the medieval female mysticism in general. To verify this statement my specific scope is to find all traces in Angela's work which characterize the most the medieval female mysticism according to the scholarship. In this case my method is a way from factual to general analysis. In the following discussion the focus stresses exclusively Angela and the cultural context where she lived.

Is Angela a matter of interest in the 21st century? In the previous chapter the analysis showed the significance and topicality of the project. However, to give an adequate answer to this question we have to notice the fact Angela is an outstanding Franciscan mystic in the medieval period, secondly she is an emerging figure for the contemporary scholarship. She is in the center of the researches of philologist, theologian, clinical psychologist, historians, artist and she is a source of spiritual inspiration and guide for everyday people as well.

Analysing the life and context of Angela of Foligno, we have to constantly keep in mind the central aim of this doctoral dissertation: is it possible to understand in the framework of the medieval female mysticism the case of Angela of Foligno as a charismatic authority in Weberian sense? Considering this central goal, the following chapter takes into consideration the life and context of Angela of Foligno based on the summaries and investigations of those remarkable scholars who researched the biographical and contextual profile of her.

2.2. Life of Angela of Foligno (1248-1309)

2.2.1. Biographical profile

To create a proper biographical profile for Angela, I used Paul Lachance's (1993) research on the topic. Lachance consulted all leading scholarly works on the historical and biographical context of Angela. Consequently, Lachance seemed to be the most appropriate choice for reconstructing Angela's local, personal and historical background.

In using of Lachance's work on Angela as a guide for the discussion of her life, we should keep in mind the difference of the term and aim of history in a modern sense and in medieval times. In modern times historical research concentrates on facts based on original sources and analyses them in a critical way. In contrast to history, first of all, the history of saints and extraordinary religious personalities concentrates on the importance of the particular person and tries to show them heroes, as examples.. The latter approach is that of hagiography. The decision for Lachance is not only his clearly evidence based approach and his critical view concerning the hagiographic elements of the main sources of Angela's life story.

As Lachance starts his summary on the topic, in 1285 Angela reached a decisive point of her life, that of her conversion. Previous to 1285, her life was almost completely unknown. According to Ferré (1927, 1936) and the chronology established by him, Angela was born in 1248 in the city of Foligno, in the Umbrian valley of what is now Italy. According to local tradition, she is mostly referred as "Lella" and was born of well-to-do, possibly noble parents. Her house was located near the church of San Francesco administered by the Franciscans. Angela married at the age of 20 around 1270, her husband remains anonymous. From the *Liber* we know that she had several sons. Before her conversion, her husband, sons and mother died around 1288. Rich, proud and beautiful, Angela possessed a spirited and quick witted intelligence prone to irony and a rare sensibility. As her writings testify, she was exceptionally cultivated, however, there is no certainty about her reading and writing capacities¹² (Lachance 1993, 16).

¹² For further documentation on Angela's life, see Ludovico Jacobilli "Vita della B. Angela da Foligno" in *Vite dei SS. e BB. di Foligno* (Foligno 1628), 1624. M. Faloci Pulignani, *La Beata Angela da Foligno: Memorie e documenti* (Gubbio 1926); idem, *Miscellanea Francescana* 25 (1925): 75-80, 113-32, 26 (1926): 78-81 M. J. Ferré, *Le livre de l'expérience des vrais fidèles* (Paris: Editions E. Droz, 1927) S. Andreoli, "La Beata Angela era analfabeta?" *Gazzetta da Foligno*, 15 January 1975.

“Fiery, passionate, impetuous by temperament, Angela seems to have enjoyed the comforts and luxuries of the world before she entered the way of penance. After her conversion, she listed the following sins regarding her life prior to conversion: washing, combing, and perfuming one's hair in order to be admired by others; dressing in luxurious clothes, indulging in fancy foods; delighting in fine perfumes; coveting possessions; hearing empty conversations; maligning others; letting loose with fits of anger and pride, engaging in illicit caresses and seductive behavior; ‘offending God each of the senses of the body, and all of oneself’ – as she wrote.” (Lachance 1993, 17)

A local tradition suggests that Angela was unfaithful to her husband,¹³ however, there is no written document of her own time to prove this. In summary, concerning Angela's life prior to her conversion, it is clear she conducted a superficial, pleasure-seeking, and sinful life. So, how did this worldly woman embark on a life of mortification and penance? As her *Memorial* indicates, in 1285 she "wept bitterly" and "the fear of being damned to hell" lead her to go to a general confession. In this despair, Angela turned in prayer to St. Francis to find a confessor "who knows sin well". Afterwards, the saint appeared to her in a dream to designate the appropriate confessor to her. In the morning Angela went by chance to the cathedral of San Feliciano where a Franciscan friar, Father Arnaldo (Fr. Arnaldo in the following) was preaching, who happened to be a relative of hers and was also the chaplain of Berardo, the local bishop.¹⁴ Angela made full confession to Fr. Arnaldo and began her new life, embarking

¹³ Faloci Pulignani concludes that prior to her conversion “Angela’s life was not scandalous, at least not publicly so” (“*Memorie e documenti*”, 77); Ferré asserts that “her sin was of the flesh” (*Sainte Angele de Foligno: sa vie, ses oeuvres* (Paris: Librairie Plon, 1936, 3). For less substantiated opinions, see P. Leone, who claims that “she had forgotten the most holy obligations of wife and mother” (*Aureola Serafica*, vol. 1 (Quarachi, 1898, 769); R. P. Hostachy: “She lived with a man” (*Joie et sainteté* (Lille, 1924, 90); J. K. Huysmans: “Married, she practiced adultery. Lovers tumble from her bed in succession, and when spent, she sheds them like scales from her flesh.” (*En route* , Paris 1895, 109).

¹⁴ “Obscurity is the sign of Angela” according to the renowned scholar Giovanni Pozzi. The Liber does not tell us much about the spaces and the environment of Angela. A very important place of Angela's story, however, is definitely the church of San Feliciano in Foligno. The first part of the Liber is constructed by the Memorial, which begins with the description of Angela’s conversion. After her conversion begins her life dedicated to penitency. Her frater scriptor Arnaldus was probably Berardo Arnolti, the later archbishop of Osimo. Another highly important historical fact about Angela's life was a visit by Ubertino da Casale, which is documented in his *Arbor vitae crucifixae Jesu* “vigésimo quinto autem anno etatis mee et modo quem pretereo ad reverende matris et santissime Angele de Fulgineo vere angelice vite in terris me adduxit noticiam”.¹⁴ The Liber was approved by Cardinal Giacomo Colonna and after that by Boniface VIII around 1297. (Il Liber di Angela da Foligno e la mistica dei secoli XIII-XIV in rapporto alle nuove culture 2009, 257–311.; my translation)

on the way of penance, a time consuming and painful process. For five and a half years long, she made only small steps on the way of penance to grow more sensitive to the demands of her new calling. After her conversion, Angela had only one desire: to grow in the spiritual way, taking steps to become truly poor, as her model St. Francis did (Lachance 1993, 17-18).

Standing before the cross, Angela stripped herself of all her clothing and pledged to Christ, her newfound lover, perpetual chastity. She renounced her best garments, fine foods and toiletry. After the death of all members of her family, Angela sold her country villa, to give it to the poor. On the way to becoming perfectly poor, Angela encountered hostility from not only her family but her religious advisors as well. They thought she was sick or possessed by the devil. After this episode, on June 28, 1292, Angela decided to go to Rome to beseech the Pope to obtain the grace of becoming truly poor. Returning to Foligno, she gave all her possessions to the poor (Lachance 1993, 19).

In 1291, the Franciscans of San Francesco's in Foligno finally permitted her to take the habit and make her profession in the Third Order of St. Francis. In 1291 Angela decided to go on a pilgrimage to Assisi in order to pray to St. Francis so she might obtain the grace to feel Christ's presence in her soul. With a few well-chosen companions, she went to Assisi fully absorbed in prayer. At the crossroads beyond Spello, the group stopped at a small chapel dedicated to the Holy Trinity. At this very place Angela received an extraordinary manifestation of the Trinity which was promised her in a vision previously. Arriving at the Basilica of St. Francis in Assisi, Angela's glance fell on a stained glass window depicting St. Francis on the bosom of Christ and felt such a divine presence that she began to shriek with all her might, wanting to die: "Love still unknown, why? why? why?" than she lay on the ground by the threshold of the basilica letting out inarticulate shouts. The strange spectacle attracted the brothers' attention. Among them was her confessor, Brother Arnaldo who was so ashamed of the behaviour of his relative that he told Angela that she should never come back to Assisi (Lachance 1993, 18-19)

Angela returned from Assisi to Foligno transformed. She was filled with intimacy with God and peace. In 1292 Arnaldo was reassigned to the San Francesco friary in Foligno. Disturbed by Angela's state, he began to question her about the strange event in Assisi. Arnaldo was stupefied by Angela's narrative which was registered later on in the Memorial documenting Angela's inner journey. For four years

(1292-1296) they met in the church of San Francesco in Foligno where Arnaldo put down sometimes very hurriedly, and later translating into Latin, what Angela dictated in her Umbrian dialect (Lachance 1993, 20).

"Christ's faithful one," as Arnaldo habitually called Angela in his narrative, was on fire with God's love. In a famously striking episode, Angela and her companion went to serve the lepers on Holy Thursday, April 3, 1292, in Foligno. After washing the lepers, they drank of the water used for washing, feeling a "divine sweetness" and "having received communion". Angela's companion was a certain Masazuola who became Angela's spiritual companion and confidante. Masazuola was a holy woman, "a marvel of simplicity, purity and chastity" and beneficiary of special blessings and mystical graces, as the Memorial registered in numerous occasions (Lachance 1993, 20).

For two mysterious years, from 1294 to 1296 Angela experienced the deepest despair and abandonment, simultaneously with the closest union and intimacy with God. She describes agonies of soul and body, terrible temptations from the devil, a deep abyss she was plunged into, and the sublime visions of God in and beyond the divine darkness – the highest stages of her mystical ascent (Lachance 1993, 21).

From 1296 until her death, there is almost nothing reliable about Angela (except on the pilgrimage to Assisi in early August 1300). What is certainly known about Angela, registered in the second part of her Book, in the Instructions, is her role as spiritual mother. A small community gathered around her to listen to her teachings, and it is to her disciples and admirers, far and near, that a series of letters, reflections, and exhortations is addressed (Lachance 1993, 22).

From 1301 on, Angela's life was practically unknown. Giovanni Targarini Olorini (d. 1348) recorded in 1307, that Angela visited the poor Clares of Spello:

"The blessed Angela of Foligno, a tertiary of great sanctity and fame, passed through Spello with her companion, the blessed Pasqualina. She visited Sister Gregoria di Vanni, a very kind and spiritual woman of the monastery of Valle Gloria in Spello, they took the Renaro Road to Assisi to visit the holy places and sacred relics. On her return to Foligno she stopped at the Church of St. Mary of the Angels."¹⁵ (Lachance 1993, 22)

¹⁵ Faloci Pulignani "Memorie e documenti", 115

On January 4, 1309, Angela died gently in her sleep, which is registered in detail in Instruction 36. Angela's body was laid to rest in the church of San Francesco in Foligno and soon became an object of veneration and cult. According to Giovanni Olorini's chronicle, "many from Spello and the surrounding area came to revere her body". She was first given the title of "Blessed" by public acclaim, and long after recognized as such by a decree of Clement XI on July 11, 1701, with a proper Mass and Office. Finally, she was canonized by the church on October 9, 2013 (Lachance 1993, 23).

2.2.2. Women in the Middle Ages

The issue of women is one of the most striking questions of the contemporary scholars regarding female sainthood in the Middle Ages. Certainly, it is mostly a feminist viewpoint. However, it is impossible to not consider the fact Angela was a woman who lived in the Middle Ages.

"Her gender in itself made her position a difficult one, as the medieval church excluded women from the priesthood in part on the basis of scriptural passages such as Paul's comments in 1 Timothy 2: 12: "I do not permit a woman to teach or to have authority over a man". [...] Two hundred years after Angela's Book was first written, the Old Italian translator still felt a need, in his preface, to explain why God should choose to use Angela of Foligno, "although a woman (and therefore of the weaker sex)", as an instrument of his truth. The scriptural basis he gave was, of course, that God had "elected the weak to confound the strong" (BDC, xlii)." (Smith 1998, 15)

Lamprecht von Regensburg (1215-1250), a Franciscan biographer of Saint Francis (based on Celano's *Vita*) also discusses why so many women were chosen by God for mystical experiences in this period, also answering the question:

"It seems to me that thus it is a woman becomes good for God; in the simplicity of her understanding her gentle heart, her frailer mind are kindled more quickly within her, so that in her desire she understands better the wisdom from Heaven than does a hard man who is clumsy in these things." (Zum Brunn and Epiney-Burgard 1989, XIV)

2.2.3. Angela as a unique case

Christina Mazzoni, a renowned Italianist in the following quote is investigating the role of Angela's *Book*, accentuating the first part of it, the *Memoriale*, about what kind of impact it has on the leading French thinkers of the time, like Beauvoir and Bataille. Another important detail in Mazzoni's interpretation is attitude: how should we read Angela? Mazzoni's advice to read Angela with attention and not misusing her role as a female voice in the Middle Ages makes her interpretation acceptable for my own investigation as well:

"One must read the entire *Memoriale* – the first and most important part of her *Liber* – in order to better understand the kind of impact that it had through the centuries and recently on such diverse texts as *The Second Sex* (a feminist manifesto), *Powers of Horror* (a psychoanalytic essay), and *Guilty* (an experimental journal of World War Two). As is too often the case with mystical writings, any quick rendition of the *Memoriale* (which I will not even attempt here) inevitably falls into the danger of trivialization, and thus of reducing the activity of the spirit to bizarre quirks of 'feminine otherness'. Angela's erotic imagery for her frequent ecstasies, her harsh and painful imitation of Christ crucified, her self-abjection, and her odd relationship with food, for example, make her a 'privileged target for this kind of interpretation'." (Mazzoni 1991, 62)

2.2.4. Body-soul interconnection in Angela's *Liber*

A key topic in Angela's narrative is the body-soul interconnection. In this regard I have to limit myself – because detailing this subject would bring us far away from the original aim of this dissertation – however, the following quote by Smith (1998) may highlight this aspect in depth:

"The Hebraic concept of the body, rather than the disembodied intellect of Greek metaphysical thought, as the locus of the self, is integral to Augustinian theology. This concentration on the somatic was further developed in late medieval Christianity as more emphasis came to be laid on the humanity, the fleshliness of Christ. Angela's Book reflects this emphasis, containing descriptions of a Christ figure who was very much present in his body, and vulnerable to human experiences. 'He journeyed

throughout the villages, hamlets, and cities, enduring hunger and thirst, rain and heat and cold, sweating and weariness, and at last the torture of a bitter death' (BDC, 73). The account of Christ's death is graphic, describing the effects of crucifixion on the bones, sinews and joints (BDC, 79). It also suggests the way in which Angela, and many mystics of her period, saw soul and body as intrinsically linked, rather than as dichotomous elements of the person. Angela writes, 'so deeply did they torment the soul of Christ, that each particular pain in itself did likewise afflict the body' (BDC, 1)" (Smith 1998, 19).

2.3. Context

2.3.1. Foligno: The local, historical and religious context of Angela's life¹⁶

Foligno lies on a plain in Umbria, at the confluence of the rivers Topino and Menotre. During the Middle Ages the population was around 2,000 inhabitants. The community of Foligno was a turbulent commercial center because of its strategic location at the crossroads of trade routes linking Ancona, Florence, Pisa, and, thus, the hub of the traffic between the Adriatic and Tyrrhenian seas.

The period that followed Angela's conversion was not an easy time for Foligno. In April, 1279, an earthquake shook the community, then three years later a hailstorm was followed by a hurricane. In the periods of 1282-1283 and 1287-1289 Foligno was involved in a war with Perugia. Foligno was a Ghibelline city and Perugia was Guelph. What was at stake was the political and economic leadership of the Umbrian valley.

Foligno was not only an important economical center but a religious one as well, which is demonstrated by the number of churches, convents, and religious groups and personalities that emerged from it. Bishop Berardo ordered a census (1295-1296) to assess the wealth of church property in his diocese, which included the very rich monastery of San Sassovivo. It is not surprising that, in reaction, the mendicants and other reform groups were present in great numbers. The Franciscan presence predominated Foligno. St. Francis himself had passed through many times Foligno in his lifetime, so the remembrance of him was still vivid.

¹⁶ Cf. Lachance 1993, 42-46.

Also circling in Foligno's orbit were friars of the dissident wing of the Franciscan family, the Spirituals. Angelo of Clareno had several groups of followers in the region. Not far from Foligno lived Jacopone da Todi, the poet of the Spirituals. In his writings there are many affinities to Angela, however, there is no evidence that these two have ever met. The Augustinians, the Servites, and the Dominicans were the other male mendicants who were significant in Foligno during Angela's lifetime.

As Lachance (1993) continues, the presence of the women's penitential movement is more difficult to trace. According to the research of Mario Sensi (ÉV??), there were three communities or groups in Foligno similar to the Beguines of Northern Europe, but with different names. The three bizzocaggi, Santa Maria 'de charitate', Santa Caterina delle Vergini, Santa Maria 'de Caresta' were institutionalized during Angela's time and became part of the Order of the Damianites, or the poor Clares.

In the Umbrian valley other popular reform movements were also present such as the Flagellanti, the Fraticelli, and, most notably, the sect of the Spirit of Freedom.

In the complex web of spiritual currents and religious personalities circulating in Umbria and in Foligno in Angela's lifetime, the presence of male and female hermits or recluses living either in the cities or in the countryside was significant.

Finally, the Order of Penance, founded in 1270, was a fraternity of men and women attached to San Francesco. It was inspired by Franciscan convictions, as well as influenced by the current of the Spirituals and the Fraticelli. Angela was part of this fraternity and spiritual mother of this circle, as her Memorial declares.

To quote Mario Sensi's affirmation:

"How desirable it would be to know from Angela's text, or from other sources, the names and the roles of all those who were part of our beat's circle. Unfortunately, the available documentation on this underground Franciscanism, transparently obvious in almost every line of her Book, is especially deficient." (Lachance 1993, 46)

2.3.2. Myticism is a public discourse in the Middle Ages

The following quote by Smith (1998) is about the flourishing of individuality (thanks to the popularity of mendicant orders) and public personae in the same period. To understand where mystical experiences in medieval times should be situated, it is

important to note that such experiences counted as a public discourse, which was communal, dialogic and active.

"The existence of an expanding climate of individuality, evidenced by the above movements, must however be carefully interpreted. It is all too easy to read modern preoccupations back into medieval texts. Mystical writing may present itself as a concentration on the individual self but it is, at the same time, purposively concerned with the transcending of self in favour of a heightened awareness of God and service to others. As Finke points out, a twentieth-century reaction to mystical experience emphasizes the private and personal, the psychological elements, whereas 'for the Middle Ages, mysticism was a public discourse. It was neither private nor passive, but communal, dialogic, and active' (1993, 35)" (Smith 1998, 9)

Furthermore, significant characteristics of the period are escapism from the ecclesiastical framework, reform of the *vita apostolica*. All these characteristics favoured the rise of a new kind of mysticism.

2.3.3. A new turn in mysticism

To understand in detail this period, it is important to examine the new turn in mysticism. As the outstanding scholar Bernard McGinn (1996) describes, significant new forms of religious life were created around the year 1200. Three very important groups characterised this period: Franciscans, Dominicans and the Beguines, the independent groups of women. In this study McGinn (1996) talks about a New Mysticism between 1200-1600, whose essential characteristics were the following: (1) new attitudes toward the relation between world and cloister, (2) a new relationship between men and women in the mystical path, and (3) new forms of language and modes of representation of mystical consciousness.

Before the New Mysticism there was a first great tradition of Monastic Mysticism. It was created in most part by a religious elite who fled from the world in order to find in the cloister a model of the Heavenly Jerusalem of contemplation on earth (significant figures of this tradition were Ambrose, Augustine, and Gregory the Great).

The first major shift in late medieval mysticism can be observed in Western Christianity by democratization, secularization and *vita apostolica*, which meant God

can be found anywhere and by anyone if the proper dispositions were present and the grace was given.

The second major shift involved gender. Only after 1200 did women begin to take a prominent place in the mystical tradition. The great age of women's theology begins in 1200. Certainly, the new role of women raised a number of issues: the most important question to consider is whether there is a distinctive women's mysticism. There are two maxims by McGinn (1996) to take into consideration: the first is avoiding overgeneralization and the second is avoiding privileging the present, as Caroline Bynum-Walker warned as well.

McGinn (1996) distinguishes three types of theologies: monastic, scholastic and vernacular. The theologies have two goals: deepening the understanding of faith (*intellectus fidei*) and enkindling charity (*experientia charitas*) to reach the understanding of love (*intelligentia amoris*).

McGinn later in this study details the genres of the theologies as well. The genres of monastical theology are the following: biblical commentary, letter treatise, and written rhetorical sermons. Genres of scholastical theology are lectio, quaestio, disputatio, and summa. Genres of the new vernacular theology are hagiography (saints vitae), visionary compendium, prose or poetic versions of courtly dialogues, mystical poems, brief treatises, letters, and vernacular sermons.

Another crucial point and issue of the time was the question of teaching. In 1290 in Paris Henry of Ghent disputed a question "Whether a woman can be a doctor of theology?" According to him, there are two answers to this question: the first *ex officio* (by ecclesiastical approbation) women cannot be doctor of theology but *ex beneficio* (by grace) certainly yes.

Finally, the most important characteristic of late medieval mysticism was the fervent dialogue between man and woman, which opened up a new era in Western Christianity (McGinn 1996).

2.3.4. Characterizing the 13th century

As the writings of Michel de Certeau have pointed out, mystics often appear in moments of cultural crisis and breakdown"¹⁷ (Lachance 1993, 2.) In the first part of the

¹⁷ "Mysticism" Encyclopedia Universalis, vol. 1 (1868, 521-526).

13th century one can face a confusion of the terminology which surrounds “mysticism”. The so called mendicant orders (Dominicans and Franciscans) aim to return to the gospel pointing out the humanity of Christ. With the appearance of Saint Francis of Assisi the mystique and exaltation of poverty was something totally new in the history of Western spirituality. Meanwhile, the Dominicans, with the outstanding figure of Saint Thomas Aquinas created a coherent incorporation of Aristotle into a new powerful synthesis. Franciscans felt the necessity of cultivating knowledge without forsaking the spirit of prayer and devotion brought about a fusion of speculative and affective theology; St. Bonaventure attempted to give it theological grounding (St. Augustine, Pseudo-Dionysius, Victorines, St. Bernard) (Lachance 1993, 25-26)

In the second part of the 13th century, new emphases can be noted, which resulted in the widening credibility gap between the institutional church and the conscience of the faithful.

“From 1240 onwards, churchmen and clerical schoolmen seemed unable to deal with an emerging and educated laity. The acceleration of political, social, and cultural transformations brought about a deep crisis which had profound repercussions on the spiritual climate of the time.” (Lachance 1993, 28)

A significant marker was apocalypticism, which characterized this new model of radical reform, led by Calabrian Joachim of Fiore. According to his viewpoints, the Church would become corrupt, but two new religious orders living in apostolic poverty would inaugurate a new era in which there would be no need for authoritative institutions, since men and women would now live according to the Spirit of God – he was widely read in this period (Lachance 1993, 29).

The expectation that the world would soon come to an end definitely filled the air. This was also what led Boniface VIII to declare 1300 a year of Jubilee in Rome guaranteeing salvation. Extreme groups such as the Flagellanti (Perugia) arose in response, as did heretical movements (Lachance 1993, 29). Furthermore, mysticism flourished especially among women as has already been discussed in connection with McGinn’s investigation.

2.4. Conclusion and outlook

"One of the most striking aspects of the new mysticism is the explosion of accounts of such experiences, what German scholars call *Erlebnismystik* or sometimes *Erfahrungsmystik*. Aspects of this stress on experience, especially of a visionary kind, had already appeared in the twelfth century." (McGinn 1996, 212)

As we could see from the current analysis, Angela of Foligno played an important role in medieval female mysticism at the time of a cultural, political and religious transformation. The scholarly remembrance concerning Angela is mostly dominated by spiritual, philological and theological approaches. *Sed contram*, I would like to add a socio-dimensional analysis in the case of Angela which could bring new insights on the sociological dimension of mysticism. This is the reason why the following chapter will present the sociodimensional model, namely, Max Weber's attempt to elaborate on charisma and charismatic authority.

CHAPTER 3

CHARISMA BETWEEN INSTITUTION AND EXCITEMENT

“It is primarily because of Max Weber that the concept of charisma has become part of the vocabulary of the social scientist and has entered into popular discourse. That the concept is widely used in both scholarly and non-scholarly circles is no guarantee that it is fully understood and correctly used. Indeed, it is a rather problematic notion.” (Adair-Toteff 2015, 131)

It is well-known in scholarly circles that the systematically elaborated sociological theory of charisma is labelled by the life work of Max Weber. However, in non-scholarly circles, in a wide range of domains in our everyday life the concept of charisma is also preferred and frequently used. The question is how to understand it correctly in a scholarly context to avoid overgeneralizing and misunderstanding Weber’s original base lines. This is the aim of the following investigation which is based on a text centered analysis of the Weberian theory of charisma.

3.1. General introduction

3.1.1. Overview

To be honest, not being a scholar trained in sociology, I decided to use an explanatory text analytical method to show and analyze Weber’s key terms charisma and charismatic authority. Based on the online version of all Weber’s works – provided and accessible through the Library of the University of Vienna – I collected and examined each occurrence of the mentioned terms in Weber’s entire works. As a result I received 425 occurrences which helped me to construct a three-dimensional model. This model might seem to be as an already familiar content for those who are experts in the field of sociology, but for me the results of the analysis brought novelty.

Many well-known scholars have already analysed the special term of charisma and charismatic authority in the Weberian sense, including but not limited to scholars like Wolfgang Mommsen, M. Rainer Lepsius, Talcott Parsons, etc. However, for my

own concerns, authors like Stephen P. Turner, Christopher Adair-Totef, and Martin Riesebrodt played a crucial role, since their analyses encouraged me to introduce my own interpretation of the Weberian theory of charisma.

In this chapter, first of all I present the short history of the Weberian charisma, the leading statements of the above cited scholars (Turner, Adair-Totef, Riesebrodt), then I am going to describe my sample and methods evidencing in it the three resulting dimensions.

According to Weber's own definition, charisma is “specifically extraordinary force that breaks rules and traditions. "It is written but I say unto You" (Weber 1922, 140) It is something extraordinarily new (*Die ewig Neue, Ausserwerktägliche*). Charisma is announced as a new command. It is a revelation, inner task, message, calling.” As we will see from the upcoming analyses as well, Weber frequently compares the charismatic leader to the magician. The success of the leader is the success of charisma. The belief in charisma is "the dedication to the extraordinary" (Adair-Totef 2015, 144-145).

Furthermore, charisma is a gift of grace, as it will be discussed more precisely in the following sections. Charisma is a specifically extraordinary social relation. According to Weber (2013), charismatic leaders come during times of crises. As Weber points out in his investigation, extraordinary problems call for leaders with extraordinary power. In his sociology of authority Weber (2013) describes charismatic authority as personal, meanwhile legal and bureaucratic authorities as impersonal (Adair-Totef 2015, 144).

3.1.2. The predecessors: Rudolph Sohm and Karl Holl impacts on the evolution of the Weberian charisma

As Adair-Totef investigates, the very origin of Weberian charisma in his outstanding work *Fundamental concepts in Weber's sociology of religion* (2015) finds two canon lawyers of great impact upon Weber, namely, Rudolph Sohm and Karl Holl. "The early Church was not led by canon law, but by charisma. Charisma was the God-given power to lead and the community was led by charismatic leaders and not by some legal hierarchy" (Sohm 1912, 50-56). Weber begins to be interested in charisma in 1910, as is proven by a letter sent to Dora Jellinek in which Weber discussed the role that charisma played in Stefan George's circle (Kroll 2001, 50). After the Sohm–

Harnack debate Weber begins the investigation of the concept of charisma. First of all, he examines Sohm's *Kirchenrecht I*, which was written in 1892. Sohm's leading research question was the following: How was the "Ekklesia" organised? Answering this question he argues that the power of the Ekklesia resides in the name of Christ.

"If Christ is the head of the Ekklesia then the actual community is the body, and the body responds to the word of Christ. This holy word is sufficient for the organization of the 'Ekklesia', it is a moral imperative. In this case there is no need for canon law. The Ekklesia is no legal organization, but, rather, a charismatic organization (Sohm 1923, 26). It is a charismatic organisation because its members are called to service, and it is the power of charisma that demands recognition. This demand is not based on laws and duties, but on love and free obedience" (Adair-Totef 2015, 144-145)

As Adair-Totef describes in his work:

"many of these points will be found in varying degrees in Weber's explanation of charisma. For Sohm, charisma was a mean to explain how Roman Catholicism, with its canon law, was a radical departure from the beliefs of the early Christians. Weber exceeded Sohm's specific theological preoccupations on charisma, mainly because for Weber, charisma was one of the three components of his sociology of authority" (=Herrschaftssoziologie) (Adair-Totef 2015, 144-150)

3.1.3. The very original source of Weber's charisma

Where does charisma come from?

The charisma holder may lose his charismatic authority if the happiness of the followers is constantly missing. In this case a big role is played by the original meaning of charisma, namely, as a gift of grace. This expression refers to the grace of the gifts of the Holy Spirit. Weber applies the expression of charisma with the very first time upon the already referred work of Rudolph Sohm's *Canon Law I*. Sohm's expression was inspired, however, by the Holy Bible. Concerning spiritual gifts Rudolph Sohm refers to the first Epistle to the Corinthians:

"Now about the gifts of the Spirit, brothers and sisters, I do not want you to be uninformed. You know that when you were pagans, somehow or

other you were influenced and led astray to mute idols. Therefore I want you to know that no one who is speaking by the Spirit of God says, “Jesus be cursed,” and no one can say, “Jesus is Lord,” except by the Holy Spirit. There are different kinds of gifts, but the same Spirit distributes them. There are different kinds of service, but the same Lord. There are different kinds of working, but in all of them and in everyone it is the same God at work. Now to each one the manifestation of the Spirit is given for the common good. To one there is given through the Spirit a message of wisdom, to another a message of knowledge by means of the same Spirit, to another faith by the same Spirit, to another gifts of healing by that one Spirit, to another miraculous powers, to another prophecy, to another distinguishing between spirits, to another speaking in different kinds of tongues, and to still another the interpretation of tongues. All these are the work of one and the same Spirit, and he distributes them to each one, just as he determines” (1 Cor. 12:1-11)

"Now eagerly desire the greater gifts" (1 Cor. 12:31). And this most excellent way will be love.

3.1.4. How to approach the diversity of the Weberian charisma?

Many scholars have already tried to define the diversity of the Weberian charisma, such as Stephen Turner, Martin Riesebrodt and Christopher Adair-Totef. Among them the most recent and, for my own interpretation, the most valuable study is by Christopher Adair-Totef. Each scholar with a different approach to the same manifold concept to understand charisma. In the following section I will describe some interpretations before I come to my own.

3.1.5. The function of charismatic authority based on Martin Riesebrodt's notion

To understand what the real function of charismatic authority is, the following questions are necessary to ask. What is exactly a charismatic authority? Basically or substantially, what did Weber mean by charisma?

"Weber's charisma has received diverse and contradictory interpretations. Riesebrodt argues that this diversity is caused by inadequate readings of Weber than by inconsistencies in Weber's own conceptualization. Weber

introduced his concept of charisma in two different contexts: his political sociology and his sociology of religion. In his political sociology he formulates the ideal type of charismatic authority informed by Rudolf Sohm's Canon Law. Meanwhile, in his sociology of religion Weber connects it with the anthropological debate of the turn of the century on magic and religion, especially the debate on pre-animism initiated by R. R. Marett, and uses it as an alternative for concepts like mana or orenda. Both conceptualizations of charisma are located on quite different levels of abstraction, which Weber has not sufficiently clarified and systematized. This leads to inconsistencies, contradictions, and overgeneralizations. Especially problematic is his claim of a supposedly anti-traditionalist or even revolutionary character of charisma. In his study, *Charisma in Max Weber's Sociology of Religion*, he argues that while this claim may apply to certain types of charisma under specific conditions, many types of charisma actually seem to be integral parts of institutionalized and traditionalized social orders." (Riesebrodt 1999, 1)

3.1.6. Charismatic authority and the question of legitimacy in Weber's work

As Adair-Totef (2015) states, Weber referred to authority as one of the most important elements of societal interactions. According to his definition, *Herrschaft* equals authority is the likelihood that a specific person will obey an order concerning a specific content. Adair-Totef examines also the numerous possible translations of the German word *Herrschaft* into English. For instance, *Herrschaft* can mean "domination, rule, leadership, authority". Each translation captures one certain aspect of *Herrschaft*. "Among these words domination is a central tenet of Weber's thinking: 'the rule of man over man is an inescapable fact of human existence'" (Adair-Totef 2015, 139). Another important task in Weber's *Herrschaftssoziologie* is what he means by "legitimate". As Adair-Totef cites Andreas Anter's notions on the topic: "legitimacy, it is the Archimedean point of his sociology of authority". Weber sometimes distinguishes between "domination" by force or by threat of force. According to him every state was founded upon force" (Adair-Totef 2015, 139).

3.1.7. Stephen Turner's notion of charisma

"As Stephen Turner pointed out, Max Weber turned charisma from an obscure theological concept into an important sociological one. However, Turner added that Weber himself had differing concepts of charisma and had never resolved the conflicts in these approaches (Turner 2003: 6–7, 9, 14). One major obstacle is that Weber often moved from one conception of charisma to another, without ever discussing the shift." (Adair-Totef 2015, 132)

To understand Weberian charisma, scholars from all over the world face the same problem. Namely, the diversity and the differing concept of Weberian charisma itself. As Stephen Turner affirmed, the concept in itself is problematic. Departing from the field of theology, charisma becomes a sociological term in Weber's work. However, the biggest problem is that Weber uses such a variety of different charismas in his works that after some time one can feel insecurity and chaos in the conceptualizational process (Adair-Totef 2015, 132).

3.1.8. Systematizational process of charisma based on Adair-Totef

Adair-Totef divides the great variety of Weberian charisma into two big groups, according to its concerns. The first group is called 'charismatic' where he refers the pure charismatic concerns of Weber. The second group he named 'noncharismatic', which refers to economy, law etc., which does not cover pure charisma in the Weberian theory of charisma. The following two quotations aim to explain this core statement based on the selection of Adair-Totef:

"One major obstacle is that Weber often moved from one conception of charisma to another, without ever discussing the shift. Specifically, Weber frequently writes of charisma in what we may call its "pure" form. "Pure charisma" is the type of charisma that is indifferent but more frequently antithetical to noncharismatic concerns. These noncharismatic concerns include economic, social, and political considerations." (Adair-Totef 2015, 132)

"Then there is Weber's second type of charisma, which I will call 'mixed charisma.' 'Mixed charisma' is always associated with one, two, or even more noncharismatic concerns. In cases of "mixed charisma," economic

and/or other types of concerns impact the role and importance of charisma." (Adair-Toteff 2015, 132)

3.1.9. Specific introduction to the individual investigation

After reviewing all occurrences of the term charisma and charismatic authority throughout the whole Weberian work, I came to the conclusion that Weber in his opus magnum *Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft* elaborated with further precision his theory of charisma, which has already been finely but partially elaborated in his works on world religions, with special regards on the transcendental dimension of charisma. The following systematization concerns those dimensions which are permanently included in the Weberian discussion of charisma. The systematic division amongst these dimensions aims at a deeper understanding of the subject, certainly never denying the real interconnections in Weber's own conceptualization.

3.1.10. Sample and methods

I examined in Weber's collected works (*Gesamtausgabe von Werke von Max Weber*) the occurrence of the expressions *charisma* and *charismatic authority*. As a result I received 425 occurrences. After an in-depth analysis I found specific Weberian keywords connected to charisma. At the base of these striking keywords I distinguished three possible dimensions of interpretation. These dimensions are the following:

1. Intensity (high vs. kenotic character)
2. Magical vs. immanent legitimacy
3. Person vs. institution (routinization)

Describing the first dimension, namely, the dimension of 'intensity', I am going to present an excitement based explanation of charisma and charismatic authority. In the spotlight of this dimension there is the overwhelming presence of emotion which cannot be neglected analysing Weber's theory of charisma, albeit this notion has not found a common place among the Weber scholars yet.

In the second dimension called 'magical vs. immanent legitimacy' I attempt to understand and investigate what the source of legitimacy of the Weberian theory of charisma is. The magical legitimacy of the charisma results quite clearly from the fact that charisma originally was an obscure theological term – as the already cited notion

by Turner (2003) pointed it out. Weber could not and did not want to deny the fact that charisma was a theological notion, although he also wanted to give a sociological interpretation of the term. This interpretation culminated in the understanding of charisma as a key element and root of immanent legitimacy building.

Finally, in the third dimension called 'person vs. institution' is the traditional way to approach the Weberian theory of charisma, dividing it into person oriented and institution oriented interpretations.

3.1.11. Preview of the variety of charisma

To give a preview of Weberian charisma I set out those key elements which can be never missing at its construction. The following elements are important to understand fully Weber's charisma making theory. The seven elements listed below form the essence of Weberian charisma and charismatic authority from birth until its transformation into an institution. However, it is also important to note that this process is dynamic and always presented in a cyclical, interconnected fashion in societies.

- (1) magical source
- (2) leader
- (3) extraordinary qualities
- (4) has to be proved and confirmed by the followers
- (5) the easy to loose quality of the obtained charismatic quality
- (6) the question of succession
- (7) institution building.

Finally, after analysing the Weberian theory of charisma, I have come to the conclusion that the world does not suffer from disenchantment as Weber argued at the beginning of his career in *The Protestant ethic and the spirit of capitalism* (1905). However, with the refreshing presence of charisma the world is refilled with enchantment again and again – so re-enchantment is underway (Joas 2017).

3.1.12. Transition

After this brief overview of the history of Weberian charisma, in the following section I will present the results of my individual investigation on the topic. Each presentation of the various dimensions is structured in the same way: a short

introduction, then, on the basis of the selected keywords comes the reconstruction of the possible subdimension. Each subdimension is supported by many direct quotations of Weber's texts and interpretations of them.

3.2. Dimension of high intensity vs. kenotic character

3.2.1. Introduction

In this subsection I discuss the dimension of high intensity vs. kenotic character of the Weberian theory of charisma. Starting with a statement about the hidden nature of Weberian charisma, I will talk about charisma in a value free way. Then, I will proceed to demonstrate what I mean by high intensity in connection with charisma: what the great revolutionary form and nature of it is, how it can be understood that charismatic authority is an antithesis of the other two kinds of authority in Weber's work, what the power of charisma is, and how a charismatic community is built on the basis of an emotional form of communal relationship.

As a result of the in-depth analysis of charisma in Weber's texts, I have generated the following keywords connected to the dimension of what I call "high intensity vs. kenotic character": irrational, extraordinary, authority, extraordinary force (*mana, orenda*), magical-secret gift, saint, virtuoso religiosity, instable, ecstatical charisma, revolutionary, loss of charisma, "it is written but I say unto You".

According to my carefully worked out hypothesis Weberian charisma is an emotion based term and phenomenon and, as such, it fits into the discipline of the sociology of emotions. Moreover, when Weber is talking about charisma and charismatic authority, he uses expressions of high or low intensity (what I prefer to call "kenotic character"). For instance: collective excitement, extra-ordinary quality, turbulently emotional, great revolutionary force, specifically creative revolutionary force of history. In this way, intensity and emotion are the hidden nature of Weberian charisma.

The following quotations may highlight this hypothesis.

"The term 'charisma' will be applied to a certain quality of an individual personality by virtue of which he is considered extraordinary and treated as endowed with supernatural, superhuman, or at least specifically exceptional powers or qualities. These are such as are not accessible to the

ordinary person, but are regarded as of divine origin or as exemplary, and on the basis of them the individual concerned is treated as a 'leader' [...] What is alone important 'is how the individual is actually regarded by those subject to charismatic authority, by his 'followers' or 'disciples'." (Weber 2013, 241–242)

This introductory definition of charisma in a value free sense highlights and proves the extraordinary nature and quality of charisma and its effects on the followers. Charisma is not accessible for ordinary people. It is always something new, unheard of and revolutionary. It always creates an overwhelming presence of the charisma holder, which the followers answer.

3.2.2. High intensity

Weber speaks about a high grade of intensity when emphasizing charisma as a foreign force. Furthermore, he connects charisma with the expression of strong, overwhelming emotions like revolutionary and extraordinary.

"In traditionalist periods, charisma is the great revolutionary force. The likewise revolutionary force of 'reason' works from without: by altering the situations of life and hence its problems, finally in this way changing men's attitudes toward them; or it intellectualizes the individual. Charisma, on the other hand, may effect a subjective or internal reorientation born out of suffering, conflicts, or enthusiasm. It may then result in a radical alteration of the central attitudes and directions of action with a completely new orientation of all attitudes toward the different problems of the 'world'. In prerationalistic periods, tradition and charisma between them have almost exhausted the whole of the orientation of action." (Weber 2013, 345)

In this quotation charisma appeared in association with the following expressions: great revolutionary force, internal reorientation, suffering, conflicts, enthusiasm, radical alteration, and new orientation of all attitudes. All the above mentioned expressions describe high intensity. Here we can also see Weber's historical division theory into prerationalistic and rationalistic periods.

"Since it is 'extra-ordinary', charismatic authority is sharply opposed to rational and particularly bureaucratic authority, and to traditional

authority, whether in its patriarchal, patrimonial, or estate variants, all of which are everyday forms of domination; while the charismatic type is the direct antithesis of this. Bureaucratic authority is specifically rational in the sense of being bound to intellectually analysable rules; while charismatic authority is specifically irrational in the sense of being foreign to all rules." (Weber 2013, 244)

Weber in this case is talking about charismatic authority, defining it as an extra-ordinary one and sharply differentiating it from the other two kinds of authorities. Charismatic authority is an antithesis of the other two. Moreover, this special kind of authority is specifically irrational in a highly new sense with respect to the other authorities. Charismatic authority is foreign to all rules, an authority alien to all rules. This means that one has to do with a new, highly intense, revolutionary power. This quotation enforces the dimension of high intensity as well:

"Charismatic rulership in the typical sense described above always results from unusual, especially political or economic situations, or from extraordinary psychic, particularly religious states, or from both together. It arises from collective excitement produced by extraordinary events and from surrender to heroism of any kind. This alone is sufficient to warrant the conclusion that the faith of the leader himself and of his disciples in his charisma - be it of a prophetic or any other kind - is undiminished, consistent and effective only in statu nascendi, just as is true of the faithful devotion to him and his mission on the part of those to whom he considers himself sent." (Weber 2013, 1121)

Weber describes charismatic rulership as a result of an unusual state. However, it is more important how this charismatic rulership arises. Weber describes this process with the expression of collective excitement which is produced by extraordinary events and heroism. As has been proven, I am exactly arguing that charismatic rulership is an emotion-based term, risking also to say that Weberian charisma is connected to erotism as well. Collective excitement expresses high intensity.

"The mere fact of recognizing the personal mission of a charismatic master establishes his power. Whether it is more active or passive, this recognition derives from the surrender of the faithful to the extraordinary and unheard-of, to what is alien to all regulation and tradition and therefore is viewed as divine-surrender which arises from distress or

enthusiasm. Because of this mode of legitimation genuine charismatic domination knows no abstract laws and regulations and no formal adjudication. Its 'objective' law flows from the highly personal experience of divine grace and god-like heroic strength and rejects all external order solely for the sake of glorifying genuine prophetic and heroic ethos. Hence, in a revolutionary and sovereign manner, charismatic domination transforms all values and breaks all traditional and rational norms:

'It has been written..., but I say unto you...'" (Weber 2013, 1115)

The recognition of the charismatic master derives from the faithful of the followers to the extraordinary and the unheard. Weber talks about how the followers arise using expressions of high intensity like distress and enthusiasm. A charismatic master is alien to all regulations and tradition, so he is a rule-breaker and anti-traditionalist messenger of God. Describing the charismatic domination, he affirms in this case how one can face a transformative, rule-breaker force which influence and change all values, all traditional and all rational norms. That is why he refers to the biblical formula of 'It is written but I say unto you'. This also highlights the highly intense, revolutionary nature of Weberian charisma.

"Every charisma is on the road from a turbulently emotional life that knows no economic rationality to a slow death by suffocation under the weight of material interests: every hour of its existence brings it nearer to this end" (Weber 2013, 1120).

Carefully observing this quotation we can say that all charisma begins its career with a "turbulently emotional life" state and can also die a rapid death. A turbulently emotional quality of charisma reflects high intensity as well.

"By contrast, the power of charisma rests upon the belief in revelation and heroes, upon the conviction that certain manifestations-whether they be of a religious, ethical; artistic, scientific, political or other kind-are important and valuable; it rests upon "heroism" of an ascetic, military, judicial, magical or whichever kind. Charismatic belief revolutionizes men 'from within' and shapes material and social conditions according to its revolutionary will. Of course, this contrast must be correctly understood. In spite of vast differences, 'ideas' have essentially the same psychological roots whether they are religious, artistic, ethical, scientific or whatever else; this also applies to ideas about political and social organization. It is a time - bound, subjective value - judgment which

would like to attribute some of these ideas to "reason" and others to 'intuition' (or whatever other distinctions may be used). [...] The decisive difference - and this is important for understanding the meaning of 'rationalism' - is not inherent in the creator of ideas or of 'works', or in his inner experience; rather, the difference is rooted in the manner in which the ruled and led experience and internalize these ideas. [...] This is meant when we say that rationalization and rational organization revolutionize 'from the outside,' whereas charisma, if it has any specific effects at all, manifests its revolutionary power from within, from a central metanoia [change] of the followers' attitudes. The bureaucratic order merely replaces the belief in the sanctity of traditional norms by compliance with rationally detennined rules and by the knowledge that these rules can be superseded by others, if one has the necessary power, and hence are not sacred. But charisma, in its most potent forms, disrupts rational rule as well as tradition altogether and overturns all notions of sanctity. Instead of reverence for customs that are ancient and hence sacred, it enforces the inner subjection to the unprecedented and absolutely unique and therefore Divine. In this purely empirical and value-free sense charisma is indeed the specifically creative revolutionary force of history." (Weber 2013, 1116–1117)

In Weber's view, society is influenced by two big forces: a charismatic and a rational one. While charisma revolutionizes from the inside, reason does it from without. Charisma is a revolutionary force and will whose impacts can change the attitude to the world and the acting directions in societies. This revolutionary power from within creates a central metanoia in the followers' attitude. Charisma is a disrupting force in history, it breakes the power of rational and traditional rules, and, above all, "overturns all notions of sanctity"(Weber 1922, 658). Charisma does not know any kind of respect to the longstanding creations of the society. That is why Weber argues charisma as a "specifically creative revolutionary force of the history" (Weber 2013, 1117). Charisma and all of its transformations are highly intense social powers which can always change the status quo in the most surprising ways.

"An organized group subject to charismatic authority will be called a charismatic community (*Gemeinde*). It is based on an emotional form of communal relationship (*Vergemeinschaftung*)" (Weber 2013, 243).

Charismatic authority is such kind of authority which is foreign to rules, irrational, not a realisable power in patterns of everyday life. Charismatic authority is *sui generis* foreign to all rules, and sharply opposed to the patterns of everydayness, it is an irrational, emotion-based community.

It has been proven that after 1910 Weber's scholarly interest turned to charisma and mysticism as well (Adair-Toteff 2015, 153). This new interest led him to analyse all major religious traditions in his life work with special regard to charisma. In his volumes, *The religion of China: Confucianism and Taoism* (1951), *The religion of India* (1958), and *Ancient Judaism* (2010) charisma is often accompanied by attributes like mystical, ecstatic, prophetic, and mystical-prophetic.

3.2.3. Kenotic character

In the case of Weberian charisma high intensity is key, as was demonstrated by the previous quotations; however, there is no low intensity charisma. Low intensity is missing because, in contrast to high intensity, in the case of charisma there is emptiness. Emptiness is what I would rather call *kenotic character* of the Weberian charisma, characterized by keywords like unstable, and the possibility to lose charismatic qualities. The following quotation aims to highlight this core statement:

"If proof and success elude the leader for long, if he appears deserted by his god or his magical or heroic powers, above all, if his leadership fails to benefit his followers, it is likely that his charismatic authority will disappear. This is the genuine meaning of the divine right of kings (*Gottesgnadentum*)." (Weber 2013, 242)

In this case we have to do with low intensity as the following keywords show: unstable, easy-to-lose quality of charisma. Charismatic authority is naturally unstable. This instability derives from the nature of charisma and especially from the nature of charismatic authority. In the spotlight of this instability is the wellbeing, happiness and benefit of the followers. If the charismatic person is unable to satisfy his followers' needs, he or she fails. Moreover, Weber refers to the instability of charismatic authority in the case of India and China as well.

"Charismatic authority is naturally unstable. The holder may lose his charisma, he may feel 'forsaken by his God', as Jesus did on the cross; it may appear to his followers that 'his powers have left him'. Then his

mission comes to an end, and hope expects and searches for a new bearer; his followers abandon him, for pure charisma does not recognize any legitimacy other than one which flows from personal strength proven time and again.[...] Most of all, his divine mission must prove itself by bringing wellbeing to his faithful followers; if they do not fare well, he obviously is not the god-sent master.” (Weber 2013, 1114)

The instability of charismatic authority takes part *ab ovo* of the nature of charisma. This instability underlines my hypothesis, namely, that only an irrational phenomenon can be unstable.

3.2.4. Summary

After introducing this very first dimension, namely, the dimension of 'intensity', I aimed to present the excitement based explanation of charisma and charismatic authority. In the spotlight of this dimension – as the manifold quotations highlighted – there was the overwhelming presence of emotion and also the lack of emotion (kenotic character). The investigation attempted to bring a bold new approach to the understanding of the hidden nature of the Weberian charisma (this intensity and emotion based nature of it), in order to offer a new interpretation in the field.

3.3. Dimension of magical vs. immanent legitimacy

3.3.1. Introduction

In this second dimension called 'magical vs. immanent legitimacy' I attempt to understand and investigate what the source of legitimacy of the Weberian theory of charisma is. The magical legitimacy of the charisma results quite clearly from the fact that charisma originally was conceived as an obscure theological term. Weber could not and did not want to deny its side, although he also wanted to give a sociological interpretation of the term itself. This interpretation culminated in the understanding of charisma as a key element and root of immanent legitimacy building and the routinizational process of charisma in the social action.

After the in-depth analysis of charisma in the Weberian texts, I found the following keywords connected to the dimension "immanent vs. magical legitimacy". Magical legitimacy is characterized by keywords like grace of gift, prophetic

charisma, supernatural, charisma of magic, charisma of mystics, pure charisma, religious charisma, tao charisma, and magical charisma. Meanwhile immanent legitimacy is characterized by keywords like routinization, succession, institutionalization, rationalisation, tradition, legitimacy, political charisma, genuine charisma, and economy.

In the investigation on immanent legitimacy it has to be repeated that the question of legitimacy in Weber's *Herrschaftssoziologie* is the Archimedean point. For a deeper understanding we have to tackle the following question: Does legitimacy have a transcendent or immanent source? This dimension aims to present these very two types in the basis of Weber's charisma and charismatic authority.

3.3.2. Magical legitimacy

Weber interprets, with the help of a basic element, magic, the various historical appearances of the various cultural religions of the world. He generally talks about charisma as the leading and basic element of religious processes. The basic element is always the magic. The Weberian theory of charisma is inconceivable without the explanation of its magical root. The following quotes underline in a great number this statement.

In the case of magical charisma we have to deal with concatenations of other charismas, too, like lineage charisma and hereditary charisma. Magical charisma (including the ancient forces of *mana*, *orenda* and *maga*) is used as a point of departure for Weber in his theory of charisma. He opens with the origin of magical charisma of the wizard. Magical charisma played a crucial role at the beginning of the religious tradition of India, where the miraculous guru was a magical charisma holder as well. Magical charisma via hereditary succession became the basis for the cast generating process. In every case of hereditary charisma we can find the germ of an originally magical charisma which creates transcendent legitimacy in societies.

"In China, as discussed above, some fundamental prehistoric events, themselves probably co-determined by the great significance of river regulation, caused imperial authority to emerge from magical charisma. Secular and spiritual authority were combined in one hand, the spiritual strongly predominating. To be sure, the emperor had to prove his magical charisma through military success or at least he had to avoid striking

failures. Above all, he had to secure good weather for harvest and guarantee the peaceful internal order of the realm. However the personal qualities which were necessary to the charismatic image of the emperor were turned into ritualism and then into ethics by the ritualists and philosophers." (Weber 1951, 31)

In the case of China, imperial authority emerges from magical charisma. Secular and spiritual authority was in one hand. However, spiritual authority was predominant. Reading carefully this quotation makes it clear that the origin of any kind of ritualism and ethics is rooted in charismatic image (Weber 1951, 31). Regarding this charismatic image and its effect on the followers there is another notion by D'Avray, however, in connection with Saint Francis: "In the case of Francis we meet a charismatic person, but he seems to expect to be obeyed even though he holds no office. Statements about 'charisma' in Weber are statements about the image of the leader in the minds of the followers" (D'Avray, 2010, 106). On the one hand, I am exactly arguing for the very strong interaction of charisma as one individual quality based on the particular experience with God or Jesus Christ, but, on the other hand, this private spiritual interaction becomes social through the strong effect among the direct followers and further in form of different institutionalizations. That simply means: charisma is authority.

"Thus, the Chinese monarch remained primarily a pontifex; he was the old rainmaker of magical religion translated into ethics. Since the ethically rationalized 'Heaven guarded eternal order, the charisma of the monarch depended on his virtues" (Weber 1951, 31).

There is a strong interconnection between charisma and virtue. The above quotation is another example which may highlight the magical legitimacy of the Chinese Pontifex.

"It has been thought to compete with the exclusive significance of the emperor's *Tao* charisma for the course of government" (Weber 1951, 150).

Another example of magical charisma in the case of China is that the presence of *Tao* charisma is needed for the course of government.

"Naturally, once this set of notions has developed, various objects or persons may be endowed with the quality of taboo by means of magical manipulations invoked by persons possessing magical charisma; thereupon, contact with the new possessor of taboo will work evil magic

for his taboo may be transmitted. This charismatic power to transfer taboo underwent considerable systematic development, especially in Indonesia and the South Sea area." (Weber 2013, 432)

The charismatic power to transfer taboo requires the persistent being of magical charisma. Weber evidences and underlines the fact that taboo is transmissible via magical manipulation.

Pure charisma in a Weberian sense is equal to the grace of gift in the biblical sense. And such as it is, it is foreign to economic consideration. Weber defines it as a vocation, mission or duty.

"Pure charisma is specifically foreign to economic considerations. Wherever it appears, it constitutes a call in the most emphatic sense of the word, a "mission" or a "spiritual duty." In the pure type it disdains and repudiates economic exploitation of the gifts of grace as a source of income, though, to be sure, this often remains more an ideal than a fact. It is not that charisma always demands a renunciation of property or even of acquisition, as under certain circumstances prophets and their disciples do." (Weber 2013, 244)

By pure charisma Weber intended *Beruf*, vocation, mission and spiritual duty. Originally the term *Beruf* in Catholicism referred to the clerical vocation. Only from Luther on is it applied to all human beings (Adair-Totef 2015, 22).

"This value followed from what was generally presupposed as the charismatic vocation of the ruler. For Lao-tzu, too, the good of man ultimately depended upon the qualities of the ruler. From this the mystic concluded that the ruler ought to have the charisma of one mystically united with the *Tao*, and further, that mystic redemption was to be imparted to all subjects as 'gift of grace' through the charismatic efficacy of the ruler's qualities." (Weber 1951, 196)

The ruler's qualities are defining for the good of man. As a starting point in *Economy and society*, Weber defines 'charisma' as follows:

"a quality, deemed to be extraordinary [...] of a personality, on account of which this person is judged to be endowed with supernatural or superhuman or at least specifically extraordinary powers or properties, which are not accessible to everyone else, or as sent by God, or as an outstanding model and consequently a 'Leader'" (Weber 1922, 140)

In this case we see the charismatic vocation of the ruler which is always connected to the religious dimension, namely, "mystically united with Tao".

"It is recognition on the part of those subject to authority which is decisive for the validity of charisma. This recognition is freely given and guaranteed by what is held to be a proof, originally always a miracle, and consists in devotion to the corresponding revelation, hero worship, or absolute trust in the leader. But where charisma is genuine, it is not this which is the basis of the claim to legitimacy. This basis lies rather in the conception that it is the duty of those subject to charismatic authority to recognize its genuineness and to act accordingly. Psychologically this recognition is a matter of complete personal devotion to the possessor of the quality, arising out of enthusiasm, or of despair and hope." (Weber 2013, 242)

Where does the validity of charisma come from? The recognition is always based on something magical. We might say miracle is a triggering factor in charisma building.

There is a social dimension which has been built upon everyday economic routines satisfying all extraordinary needs, always acting on a charismatic basis. "All extraordinary needs, i.e., those which transcend the sphere of everyday economic routines, have always been satisfied in an entirely heterogeneous manner: on a charismatic basis" (Weber 2013, 1111).

"The administrative staff of a charismatic leader does not consist of "officials"; least of all are its members technically trained. It is not chosen on the basis of social privilege nor from the point of view of domestic or personal dependency. It is rather chosen in terms of the charismatic qualities of its members. The prophet has his disciples; the warlord his bodyguard; the leader, generally, his agents (*Vertrauensmänner*). There is no such thing as appointment or dismissal, no career, no promotion. There is only a call at the instance of the leader on the basis of the charismatic qualification of those he summons. There is no hierarchy; the leader merely intervenes in general or in individual cases when he considers the members of his staff lacking in charismatic qualification for a given task. There is no such thing as a bailiwick or definite sphere of competence, and no appropriation of official powers on the basis of social privileges. There

may, however, be territorial or functional limits to charismatic powers and to the individual's mission. There is no such thing as a salary or a benefice. [...] Disciples or followers tend to live primarily in a communistic relationship with their leader on means which have been provided by voluntary gift. There are no established administrative organs. In their place are agents who have been provided with charismatic authority by their chief or who possess charisma of their own. There is no system of formal rules, of abstract legal principles, and hence no process of rational judicial decision oriented to them. But equally there is no legal wisdom oriented to judicial precedent. Formally concrete judgments are newly created from case to case and are originally regarded as divine judgments and revelations. From a substantive point of view, every charismatic authority would have to subscribe to the proposition, 'It is written . . . but I say unto you . . .'" (Weber 2013, 243)

As has already been discussed, the question of legitimacy according to Andreas Anther is the Archimedean point in Weber's *Herrschaftssoziologie*. The legitimacy of charismatic authority is always connected to the proof of the charisma itself, and it is in progress until the followers obey it. The recognition of charisma requires a stable and constant verification. Charismatic quality has to be permanently proven.

3.3.3. Succession of magical power

The transmission of charisma can be summarized in six forms which are given below. The transmission of charisma creates social relationships, so it is an important element of society making. Why do we have to speak about the transmission of charisma?

The disappearance of a personal charismatic leader causes the problem of succession in the charismatic community if it continues. Succession may vary along the following lines: (1) the charismatic community searches for distinguishing characteristics in a person; (2) revelation may show the next charismatic leader (oracle, judgements); (3) designation by the original charismatic leader of his own successor and their recognition by the followers (dictator in the Roman Empire); (4) designation of a successor by the charismatically qualified administrative staff and recognition by the community; (5) charisma is a quality transmitted by heredity (hereditary charisma, like

in China); and (6) charisma may be transmitted by ritual means – originally it was the magical charisma, it may become the charisma of office (Weber 2013, 246–249)

In the above list we can see the five ways of transmission of charisma which create social relationships and which originate always in the succession of magic.

"This suggests the probability that the long house, the most ancient form of organization, can be deduced from the routinization of hereditary charisma of the prince and his war following" (Weber 1951, 87).

In the case of China the charisma was coming from the routinization of hereditary charisma of the prince.

"Eventually this created tension since it is an equally basic Confucian view that the material and ethical welfare of the individual and the whole people is ultimately determined by the charismatic qualities of the ruler who is legitimated by Heaven and by the welfare policy of his officials. This very doctrine, however, led Taoism to its own conclusions." (Weber 1951, 212)

As the above quotation demonstrates, the welfare of the followers is indispensable in the case of the proof of charismatic quality of the ruler.

3.3.4. Immanent legitimacy: Economy, politics, and charismatic leadership

"For charismatic leadership, too, if it wants to transform itself into a perennial institution, the first basic problem is that of finding a successor to the prophet, hero, teacher or party leader. This problem inescapably channels charisma into the direction of legal regulation and tradition. Given the nature of charisma, a free election of a successor is originally not possible, only the acknowledgment that the pretender actually has charisma. Hence the followers may have to wait for the epiphany of a personally qualified successor, temporal representative or prophet." (Weber 2013, 1123)

How to pass on charismatic leadership? Weber describes the way: in the process of building a perennial institution on merely charismatic leadership the most important key figure is the successor (prophet, hero, teacher, or party leader). According to Weber, this institutionalizational process immediately turns charismatic leadership into the way of legal regulation and tradition.

"Since all emotional mass appeals have certain charismatic features, the bureaucratization of the parties and of electioneering may at its very height suddenly be forced into the service of charismatic hero worship" (Weber 2013, 1130).

The bureaucratization of parties also contains some charismatic elements as well. The whole bureaucratizational process may turn into charismatic hero worship. This quotation also highlights the fine borderline between charismatic and legal/rational authority.

"Almost all parties originate as a charismatic following of legitimate or caesarist pretenders, of demagogues in the style of Pericles, Cleon or Lassalle" (Weber 2013, 1131). All parties are based on somehow charismatic leaders and elements.

3.3.5. Transition between magical and immanent legitimacy

"The charismatically dominated masses, in turn, become tax-paying subjects. Dues paying members of a church, sect, party or club (Verein), soldiers who are systematically impressed, drilled and disciplined, or law-abiding "citizens." Even though the apostle admonishes the followers to maintain the purity of the spirit, the charismatic message inevitably becomes dogma, doctrine, theory, regulation, law or petrified tradition.

In this process the two basically antagonistic forces of charisma and tradition regularly merge with one another. [...] The transition is fluid. As soon as charismatic domination loses its personal foundation and the acutely emotional faith which distinguishes it from the traditional mold of everyday life, its alliance with tradition is the most obvious and often the only alternative, especially in periods in which the rationalization of organizational techniques (*Lebenstechnik*) is still incipient." (Weber 2013, 1122)

The quotation clearly highlights the merging of the two basically antagonistic forces of charisma and tradition. Both have a religious aura. The transition between charisma and tradition is fluid.

"As these examples show, charismatic domination is by no means limited to primitive stages of development, and the three basic types of domination cannot be placed into a simple evolutionary line: they in fact appear together in the most diverse combinations. It is the fate of

charisma, however, to recede with the development of permanent institutional structures. As far as we know the early stages of social life, every concerted action that transcends the traditional mode of satisfying economic needs in the household has a charismatic structure." (Weber 2013, 1133)

From this quotation we can see two important things: first, the three types of dominations are always interconnected among each other. Second, in the case of permanent institutionalization charisma suffers receding.

"The emperor's personal position, as we have seen, was based exclusively on his charisma as the plenipotentiary ('Son') of Heaven where his ancestors resided. But the veneration and significance of the individual deities were still subject to the charismatic principle of success, just like a Neapolitan driver's or a boatman's Saint. This charismatic character of the religion suited officialdom's interest in self-preservation." (Weber 1951, 143)

The immanent legitimacy of the Chinese Emperor is based on his magical charisma. This quotation is an excellent example of the transition between immanent and magical legitimacy.

"Tradition displaced charisma" (Weber 1951, 113). In the case of China we can see that tradition appears as an enemy of charisma. If tradition solidifies, charisma disappears. However, this notion is valid for all societies where tradition rules.

In this section I want to repeat that charisma has always had some magical germs and origin. Weberian charisma cannot be understood without an emphasis of this magical root. All of the following quotations are to present the above mentioned statement on charisma and charismatic authority.

"Beside the unbroken character of magic in general and the power of the sib appears the impregnability of charisma in its oldest form: as a pure magical power. These determined the typical course of the Asiatic social order" (Weber 1958, 335). In Asiatic social order charisma always appears as a pure magical power.

"In keeping with the principle of charismatic authority, the emperor, of course, fared similarly. The whole construction, after all, issued from this political habituation. The emperor had to prove his charismatic authority, which had been tempered by hereditary succession. Charisma was always an extraordinary force (maga, orenda) and was revealed in sorcery

and heroism. The charismatic qualification of the novice was tested by trials in magical asceticism, or, given different ideas, it was acquired in the form of a 'new soul'. But originally the charismatic quality could be lost; the hero or magician could be 'forsaken' by his spirit or God. Charisma seemed to be guaranteed only so long as it was confirmed by recurrent miracles and heroic feats. In any case, the magician or hero must not expose himself and his following to obvious failure. Originally, heroic strength was considered quite as much a magical quality as 'magical force' in the narrower sense, for instance rainmaking, magical healing or extraordinary craftsmanship. For cultural evolution the decisive question was whether or not the military charisma of the warlord and the pacifist charisma of the (usually meteorological) sorcerer were united in the same hand. If they lay in the hand of the war lord-the case of Caesar-papism the question was: "what charismatic source served as the basis for the evolution of princely power?" (Weber 1951, 30)

Once again on the extraordinary force of charisma and its magical origin.

"Even in the oldest tradition the ancient scriptures were considered magical objects, and the men conversant with them were considered holders of a magical charisma. As we shall see, these have been persistent facts in China" (Weber 1951, 109). Those who can read the meaning of ancient scriptures are magical charisma holders.

"High mandarins were considered magically qualified. They could always become objects of a cult, after their death as well as during their lifetime, provided that their charisma was 'proved'" (Weber 1951, 135).

In the case of China, where the high mandarin order was responsible for the bureaucratic order of the State, the high mandarins were magically qualified. Weber describes deeply this magical qualification process.

"The miracle in terms of its meaning always appears as the act of some sort of rational, world-linked, godly-gift of grace, seen and practiced, thus inwardly motivated as a spell; in terms of its sense it stands as a manifestation of magical potencies manipulated by irrational, operational arts and by charismatically qualified beings. However, such manipulation occurs in terms of the particular free will behind nature, human or super-human, stored up through asceticism or contemplative performance. The

rose miracle of holy Elizabeth appears meaningful to us. The universality of the spell breaks through every meaningful interrelation of events." (Weber 1958, 335–336)

A miracle always has some rational sides as well. Reason is an important element in a miracle, according to Weber's notion. This is the very first time among the quotations of a mention of rationality. Commonly magic and religion build one side and rationality the other. Weber is well known for his theory on the rationalization of action and in this case, on the rationalization of religion. From the quotation above we can see how it works. As he confirms, magic is a rational, world-linked, godly gift of grace.

3.3.6. Summary

The description of this subdimension aimed to discuss magical legitimacy, the succession of magical power and the transition between magical and immanent legitimacy making. In the case of purely magical legitimacy the example of China, the tao charisma, taboo and pure charisma were mentioned. The succession of magical power included the transmission of charisma, charismatic leadership, legal regulation, and the question of tradition. Finally, the transition between magical and immanent legitimacy describes the question of how charisma merges with tradition.

3.4. Dimension of person vs. institution

3.4.1. Introduction

In the third dimension called 'person vs. institution', I will introduce the traditional way to approach Weber's theory of charisma, dividing it into person oriented and institution oriented interpretations. Why is it important to divide it this way? Basically, because Weber lists a significant number of charismas where the personal and institutional factors are highlighted. First, the personal will be introduced, then the institution related ones.

Weberian social thinking is inherently Janus-faced. On the one hand, Weberian charisma expresses an extraordinary quality strictly connected to a person, and, on the other hand, it expresses an impersonal charismatic quality which is a leading element of institution building. Considering this fact, we have to face the striking factor of Weberian social thought and its dual nature, which is interconnected and in that way

effects and influences various levels and dimensions of the entire society. However, now we ought to focus first on its person oriented face. As it has already been discussed, the original source of Weberian charisma was coming from the term like *mana*, *orenda*, and *maga*, which referred to a supernatural, superhuman magical force. Later on, however, it became a quality deemed to be the extraordinary ability of a person. At this very point there is a comparison of the biblical concepts of the Gifts of the Soul referred to by Saint Paul in the 1 Corinthian Epistle and Weber's Charisma as a personal quality.

Secondly, in the center of Weber's scholarly interest there is the interpretation of social transformation by which he gave a special function to the term charisma. Therefore, we should collect every important finding regarding the institutional dimensions of charisma.

Finally, considering all results of the analysis, it will be possible gain a deeper understanding of the interconnectedness of person and institution in the Weberian concept.

3.4.2. Person

After the in-depth analysis of charisma in the Weberian texts, I found the following keywords connected to the dimension of "Person": vocation, duty, magician vs. lay person, magical asceticism, charismatic artist, charismatic warlord, charismatic responsibility, proof and confirmation of charisma, proclamation, and prophecy.

In this part I am trying to describe and present the dimension of the person which ends up in the line of the dimension of the institution. In the following quotations we will see Weber uses different terms to express the same religious dimension. Expressions like genuine charisma, magical, divine, religious. However, this expressions refer not only to a religious dimension but also to a strictly personal quality of charisma which is legitimated by the followers, foreign to economic considerations and free of worldly attachments.

"Charisma was always an extraordinary force (*maga*, *orenda*) and was revealed in sorcery and heroism. The charismatic qualification of the novice was tested by trials in magical asceticism, or, given different ideas, it was acquired in the form of a "new soul." But originally the charismatic quality could be lost; the hero or magician could be "forsaken" by his spirit or God. Charisma seemed to be guaranteed only so

long as it was confirmed by recurrent miracles and heroic feats. In any case, the magician or hero must not expose himself and his following to obvious failure. Originally, heroic strength was considered quite as much a magical quality as "magical force" in the narrower sense, for instance rainmaking, magical healing or extraordinary craftsmanship." (Weber 1951, 30)

Above all, the most important expression in this quotation is the very fact that charisma has always an aboriginal, magical element strictly connected to the person, namely to the holder of charisma. Another important information is charisma can be lost. This quality requires the constant confirmation by miracles and heroic feats which keep alive the charismatic 'aura' of the charisma holder.

“Since the ethically rationalized "Heaven" guarded eternal order, the charisma of the monarch depended on his virtues. Like all genuinely charismatic rulers he was a monarch by divine right, and not in the comfortable manner of modern sovereigns who, by the grace of God, claim to be responsible to Him only for their blunders. The latter are de facto irresponsible, but the Chinese emperor ruled in the old genuine sense of charismatic authority. He had to prove himself as the "Son of Heaven" and as the lord approved by Heaven insofar as the people fared well under him.” (Weber 1951, 31)

Charisma in the old genuine sense is a divine right just later on in the case of modern sovereign becomes a grace of God. In the case of China we can see that the original magical (mana, orenda, maga) element of the person related charisma is also a divine charisma. China's Emperor is a legitimised "Son of the Heaven" via his divine charisma. In this ancient time charismatic authority meant responsibility also.

"In its pure form charisma is never a source of private income; it is neither utilized for the exchange of services nor is it exercised for pay, and it does not know orderly taxation to meet the material demands of its mission; rather, if it has a peaceful purpose, it receives the requisite means through sponsors or through honorific gifts, dues and other voluntary 'contributions of its own following. [...] In order to live up to their mission the master as well as his disciples and immediate following must be free of the ordinary worldly attachments and duties of occupational and family life. Those who have a share in charisma must inevitably turn away from the world: witness the statute of the Jesuit order forbidding members to

'hold ecclesiastic offices; the prohibitions for members of other orders to own property, or for the order itself, as in the original rule of Saint Francis; the celibacy of priests and knights of an order; the actual adherence to the rule of celibacy on the part of numerous holders of prophetic or artistic charisma." (Weber 2013, 1113–1114)

The turn away from the world is a common core in the Weberian charisma of those of who share it: charisma holder=master and the disciples=followers are free from worldly attachments, and are foreign to economic considerations as well.

"All of them, however, made use of the prestige which their prophetic charisma, as opposed to the technicians of the routine cults, had gained for them among the laity" (Weber 2013, 457).

The prestige of charisma is served to proof the variety of person related charismas in Weber's life work. This prestige is mostly coming from the prophetic charisma and it is used widely by the holders.

"Artistic skill of the parament artisan then was considered a divine charisma" (Weber 2010, 157). Another interesting element on the colourful scene of the weberian theory of charisma is the artistic skill which is held part of divine charisma.

3.4.3 Charisma as individual divine energy in different religious traditions

Weber describes charisma - first in his works on the sociology of world religions¹⁸ - as a personal energy, prophetic and extatical enthusiasm which is evidenced by the successes and happiness of the disciples and followers. The variety of the following quotes aim to demonstrate this diversity.

"To be sure, the emperor had to prove his magical charisma through military success or at least he had to avoid striking failures" (Weber 1951, 31).

Another highly important element of the Weberian charisma is that charisma has to be proved by the followers (Weber 1951, 31; Weber 2013, 241-242; 243; 1116-1117).

"The king has to prove his charisma, that he is thus qualified, by bringing joy to the people (as in China and wherever genuine conceptions of charisma prevail)" (Weber 2010, 231).

¹⁸ See Weber 1951, Weber 1958, Weber 2010.

Any kind of genuine charisma has to positively effect on the life of its followers.

“In any case, for a long time charisma was no longer attached strictly to the individual but to his sib, a typical phenomenon as we shall find in our discussion of India” (Weber 1951, 34).

With the following quotation I would like to highlight the shift between person connected charisma to hereditary charisma (the case of the sib). Certainly, its process was not only the characteristics of India. Hereditary charisma in Europe reaches its apex in the kingship.

Prophetic charisma appears in the Weberian work mostly in connection with Ancient Judaism. However, he also uses it in connection with his Sociology of Religion, namely in the case of Zoroastrianism, Muhammad, Jesus and Buddha.

In the case of Ancient Judaism Weber affirms that this very kind of charisma has rational and irrational elements as well. The irrational elements are magical forces and magical powers expressed by outspoken words. The relation of the "charismatic" prophet and the educated, literate rabbi is intense and strained. Meanwhile the rabbi influences via his education in written and oral forms as well, the prophet influences via his magics. Prophetic charisma in Weber requires always the presence of a personal charisma. The following seven quotes can prove this statement.

"We shall understand 'prophet' to mean a purely individual bearer of charisma, who by virtue of his mission proclaims a religious doctrine or divine commandment. [...] But the prophet, like the magician, exerts his power simply by virtue of his personal gifts. Unlike the magician, however, the prophet claims definite revelations, and the core of his mission is doctrine or commandment, not magic. [...] On the other hand, it was only under very unusual circumstances that a prophet succeeded in establishing his authority without charismatic authentication, which in practice meant magic. At least the bearers of new doctrine practically always needed such validation. It must not be forgotten for an instant that the entire basis of Jesus' own legitimation, as well as his claim that he and only he knew the Father and that the way to God led through faith in him alone, was the magical charisma he felt within himself." (Weber 2013, 439–440)

From this quote can be read the proper definition of the prophet who is a purely individual charisma holder. Being a prophet is such a personal gift like the magician's. It's a purely personal charisma, like it was in the case of Jesus as well. Certainly, transitions can be noticed between prophet and magician.

"However, if the prophetic charisma first means the ability rationally to understand Yahwe, it nevertheless contains quite different irrational potentialities. The first of these is magical power" (Weber 2010, 297). Magical power takes part of the irrational side of prophetic charisma. Furthermore, prophetic charisma has rational and irrational abilities as well.

"The rabbis worked through teaching as speakers and writers, the mystagogues through magic; the rabbis' authority rested on knowledge and intellectual schooling, not on magical charisma. [...] For the rest Judaism, including Pharisaism, did not deny the charisma of the miracle." (Weber 2010, 394)

This quotation highlights the tension between the educated rabbi and bearer of magical charisma. However, Weber presents Phariseism as well who recognise and accept magical charisma. Notwithstanding that rabbis worked on rational and intellectual ground, Ancient Judaism could not exclude and deny the possibility and presence of magical charisma.

"The charisma of ecstatic prophecy lived on among Jewry" (Weber 2010, 380). A new element on the scene: the charisma of ecstatic prophecy. Weber refers to this very charisma only in connection with Ancient Judaism.

"Moreover, *ruach* is the special divine force, which corresponding to *mana* and *orenda*, finds expression as charisma of extraordinary accomplishments in heroes, prophets, artists and, reversely as demonic possession in grave affects and unusual psychic states." (Weber 2010, 140)

The Jewish *ruach* is equal to *mana* and *orenda*, it derives from magical source as well. As such as is, Weber calls it as a charisma with extraordinary accomplishments.

"The *pneuma*, as charisma and indicative proof of an exemplary state of grace, was indeed no strange concept to Jewry, nor to the teaching of Pharisaism. The 'spirit of Yahwe' as berserk-charisma came over the hero (Samson) and king (as a fierce wrath over Saul), and particularly as the

charisma of vision and prophetic pronouncement, possibly of miracles over the seers, prophets, and miracle-workers." (Weber 2010, 411)

Pneuma as a state of grace is also a certain charisma in the case of Ancient Judaism.

"As the quality of Brahmanical gnosis increases by steps, so Jain charisma is graded, according to the Kalpa Sutra into seven statuses according to the stages of knowledge: from knowledge of the writings and holy traditions to the stage of enlightenment concerning the things of this world (avadhi), the first stage of supernatural knowledge; then the ability to have visions (Helssehens); then to the possession of magical powers and the ability of self-transformation; then (fifth step) to knowledge of the thoughts of all living beings (manahparyaya, the second stage of supernatural wisdom); and, therewith, finally, (seventh step) to certainty of the 'last birth'." (Weber 1958, 195)

Jain charisma of Brahmanical gnosis is a personal journey which can be easily related to the western european medieval mystical ways as well (path of the mystic's seven steps in the case of Saint Angela of Foligno).

3.4.4. Questions to the personal dimension

Weber described charisma as a personal energy, prophetic, ecstatic enthusiasm in his work on sociology of world religions, which is a testimony of the disciple and followers as a result of success and happiness. Are the above listed characteristics accessible in Angela's person? Is it possible to prove her charismatic personal energy, the ecstatic enthusiasm? What kind of testimony via the success and happiness of the disciples and followers results clear from Angela's text?

3.4.5. Institution

After the in-depth analysis of charisma in the Weberian texts, I found the following keywords connected to the dimension of "Institution".

Political and hierocratical power, ecclesiastical power, charismatic education, love based communistic community, knowledge and professional knowledge, rational, traditional and charismatic authority are interconnecting in the field of the routinization of charisma. Office charisma. democracy. Church. Charismatic principate. Charisma of

the priest. Directoral group, group of monks, virtue charisma. When charismatic qualification becomes impersonal we have to face the process of its institutionalization

When the purely personal quality of charisma disappears it opens up the way of its institutionalization. This institutionalization may vary in time and space as well and this very fact will lead in the routinization of charisma.

In this part I am trying to describe and present the institutional dimension which ends up in the line of the dimension of the person.

3.4.6. Institution building

However, I think we should think about person and institution in a consecutive way. First, the person – with its charismatic qualities, and after that the institution with other kind of charismatic dimensions. It seems to be, Weber tries to understand the very dynamic of the society and he uses the personal dimension and the institutional dimension for its interpretation. In this dynamical logic – which seems to be more appropriate to Weber's own theory – not only pure charismatic authority exists only in *statu nascendi*, but the whole dynamism of societal transformation has different statui. At the beginning pure and then later on less pure stages.

"In its pure form charismatic authority has a character specifically, foreign to everyday routine structures. The social relationships directly involved are strictly personal, based on the validity and practice of charismatic personal qualities. If this is not to remain a purely transitory phenomenon, but to take on the character of a permanent relationship, a 'community' of disciples or followers or a party organization or any sort of political or hierocratic organization, it is necessary for the character of charismatic authority to become radically changed. Indeed, in its pure form charismatic authority may be said to exist only in *statu nascendi*. It cannot remain stable, but becomes either traditionalized or rationalized, or a combination of both. The following are the principal motives underlying this transformation: (a) The ideal and also the material interests of the followers in the continuation and the continual reactivation of the community, (b) the still stronger ideal and also stronger material interests of the members of the administrative staff, the disciples, the party workers, or others in continuing their relationship." (Weber 2013, 246)

If the strongly personal character of charismatic authority becomes a permanent relationship with its followers, there is a necessity of a radical change of the charismatic authority itself. This necessity may come from the high material interest of the followers, from their vivid, and lasting interest of making alive the charismatic community. This transformation opens up the way of the routinization of charisma and the institution building of the charismatic authority.

"Whatever we have said until now about the possible consequences of the routinization of charisma has not affected its strictly personal quality. However, we will now turn to phenomena whose common feature is a peculiar depersonalization of charisma. From a unique gift of grace charisma may be transformed into a quality that is either' (a) transferable or (b) personally acquirable or (c) attached to the incumbent of an office or to an institutional structure regardless of the persons involved." (Weber 2013, 1135)

As it has already been mentioned and cited charisma originally was conceived as a gift of grace. And as such a thing its personal character is indiscussable. However, it may transform into other qualities as well. The result of this transformation is triplex. It can become a transferable, personally acquirable quality and it can be attached also to an office or to an institutional structure regardless of the persons involved opening up to the way of institution building. In the case of this depersonalization process we can observe a certain evolution of the Weberian charisma. Every charisma starts its career as a strictly person related charisma, than later on this pure charismatic quality steps on the way of routinization. After the routinization comes the depersonalization of the charismatic quality which ends up in the institution building.

3.4.7. The beginning of the institutionalizational process

"When the tide that lifted a charismatically led group out of everyday life flows back into the channels of workaday routines, at least the 'pure' form of charismatic domination will wane and turn into an 'institution' [...]" (Weber 2013, 1121).

When the "pure" form of charismatic domination wanes it turns into an "institution". However, this turn necessities the presence of a workaday routine caused

by the weight of material interest of the charismatically led group. This is also the very moment when economic rationality appears in the charismatic authority.

“The government on the whole pursued only fiscal and mercantilist interests, if one disregards emergency situations which, considering the charismatic nature of authority, were always politically dangerous” (Weber 1951, 147).

The charismatic nature of authority always has revolutionary, changing impacts as well. That is why it has always been considered as politically dangerous.

"Officialdom, the pillar of public order and the state, was held to partake of charisma too" (Weber 1951, 32).

It is highly important to underline that charisma is a constructive element of bureaucracy and power-making (Weber 1951, 32). Weber often underlines the fact that the three types of domination are presented simultaneously, they appear separately only when he describes them in an idealtypical way.

"Every kind of training, whether for magical charisma or for heroism, may become the concern of a small circle of professional associates out of which may develop secret priestly fraternities or exclusive aristocratic clubs. The number of variations is great, ranging from systematic domination to occasional plundering by the political or magic brotherhood, which especially in West Africa was often a secret society. All those groups that developed into clubs and brotherhoods, whether they originated in a voluntary military following or in the levy of all able-bodied men, share the tendency to replace charismatic capacities increasingly with purely economic qualifications." (Weber 2013, 1145)

The plutocratic acquisition of charisma results in secret societies building where charismatic capacities are replaced with purely economic qualification.

3.4.8. Office charisma: Church

Weber dedicates a significant number of quotes regarding office charisma, which is a special case of institution building. The following quotations are to present and underline its significance.

"The radical demands of the revolutionary and almost always eschatological charisma can never be realized within those religious organizations that insist upon compromises with the economic and other

mundane power interests and the withdrawal from the world - from marriage, occupation, office, property, political and any other community - is only the consequence of this state of affairs. Originally, in all religions the successful ascetic, accomplishing the extraordinary, acquires the charismatic ability of forcing God's hands and of working of miracles. Of course, such personal charisma is ultimately irreconcilable with the hierocratic claims of an institution of salvation (Heilsanstalt) that seeks to monopolise the way to God -extra ecclesiam nulla salus is the motto of all churches." (Weber 2013, 1166–1167)

Every kind of religious organisation suffers from the economic and mundane power interests which are radically opposite of any kind of personal charisma. As Weber argues this so called personal charisma is irreconcilable with the hierocratic claims of any kind of institution of salvation (of every church). Office charisma is always tends to monopolise the way to God, meanwhile the personal charisma creates it for itself.

However, this opposition is so sharp and rigid that cannot be other than revolutionary.

"The Catholic theory of the priest's character indelebilis with its strict distinction between the charisma of office and the worthiness of the person constitutes the polar opposite of the Puritan rejection of office charisma. Here we encounter the most radical form of depersonalization of charisma and of its transformation into a qualification that is inherent in everybody who has become a member of the office hierarchy through a magic act, and that sanctifies official acts." (Weber 2013, 1141)

The depersonalization process of charisma reaches its highest and most radical form in the case of the Catholic priest and its character indelebilis. The priest, as a person via the magic act becomes holder of a qualification which makes him part of office hierarchy and sanctifies him for all official acts.

"The bureaucratization of the church was possible only if the priest could be absolutely depraved without endangering thereby his charismatic qualification; only then could the institutional charisma of the church be protected against all personal contingencies." (Weber 2013, 1141)

Due to sheer existence of the Church cannot demand obedience from everyone only to believers, so the state will become the alter ego of the Church. Claiming for himself the same authority as the Church, but with different legitimacy. The personal

charisma shifts into office charisma. Personal charisma has a transcendent source (irrational) and a specific knowledge. Inspired by duty, the followers obey by collective excitement to the charisma holder. This obedience requirement is maintained between the needs and streamlined bureaucratic relations, but there is not the source of the charismatic inspiration, but also the power of reason and the state bureaucracy.

In the following I continue to present office charisma: a charisma which neglects all personally charismatic qualities. Furthermore, in the case of church we can observe the process of separation of charisma from the person.

"Four features characterize the emergence of a church out of a hierocracy; 1) the rise of a professional priesthood removed from the "world," with salaries, promotions, professional duties, and a distinctive way of life; 2) claims to universal domination; that means, hierocracy must at least have overcome household, sib and tribal ties, and of a church in the full sense of the word we speak only when ethnic and national barriers have been eliminated, hence after the levelling of all non-religious distinctions; 3) dogma and rites (Kultus) must have been rationalized, recorded in holy scriptures, provided with commentaries, and turned into objects of a systematic education, as distinct from: mere training in technical skills; 4) all of these features must occur in some kind of compulsory organization. For the decisive fact is the separation of charisma from the person and its linkage with the institution and, particularly, with the office; from this fact derive all the above features, which we find developed in different degrees of 'typicality.[...] In one word, the church is the bearer and trustee of an office charisma, not a community of personally charismatic individuals, like the sect." (Weber 2013, 1164)

In this quote Weber describes the birth of a church from any kind of hierocracy. This process is characterized by four steps: (1) professional priesthood removes itself from worldly attachments, (2) claims for universal domination, (3) the rationalization of dogma and rites, and (4) the above listed characteristics must appear in an organisation. Considering these facts, Weber argues church is not a community of personally charismatic individuals, but a trustee of office charisma.

The sharp tension between mystical charisma (which is a strictly personal charisma in Weber's terminology) and office charisma comes primarily from the fact that the Church wants to monopolise the way to Salvation by its office charisma

maintaining the dignity of the organization. While mystical charisma, experiencing a direct way to God, crushes the leveling and monopolising power of the Church. Of course, the big churches were forced to conclude a separate peace with their religious orders and separately negotiate with their mystical saints. Therefore, we can see, as Weber states, that charisma reaches its liveliest point in the order of Saint Francis, meanwhile in the case of the Jesuit Order the gradual rationalization of asceticism results in the pronouncement of the charisma of office. The last three quotes of this section are to verify this statement.

"Hence fully developed office charisma inevitably becomes the most uncompromising foe of all genuinely personal charisma, which propagates and preaches its own way to God and is prophetic, mystic and ecstatic. Office charisma must oppose it, in order to preserve the - dignity of the organization. Whoever works miracles on his own, without an office, is suspect as a heretic or magician." (Weber 2013, 1165)

In this quotation we can see that office charisma appears as an enemy of every genuine personal charisma, whether to be mystical, extatical or prophetic. Furthermore, office charisma is a preserving force, serving to protect the dignity of the institution.

"The gradual rationalization of asceticism into an exclusively disciplinary method reached its apex in the Jesuit order. Gone were the individual charismatic propagation and dispensation of salvation, whose elimination from the old orders, especially the Franciscan, had been so, difficult for the church which was bound to view such efforts as a threat to its office charisma. Gone, too, was every irrational meaning of asceticism as an individual search for salvation-another dubious idea, from the viewpoint of office charisma." (Weber 2013, 1172)

Gradual rationalization of the Jesuit Order was a core element of reaffirmation of office charisma of the Church and triumphed over the individual search for salvation.

"No other church rationalized asceticism, and used it for hierocratic purposes, as the Occidental church has done, most consistently through the Jesuit order" (Weber 2013, 1173). This is another example which sheds light on the rationalizing force of asceticism in the Jesuit Order.

3.4.9. Charismatic education as an institution building force

"Once charismatic qualification has become an impersonal quality, which can be transmitted through various and at first purely magic means, it has begun its transformation from a personal gift that can be tested and proven but not transmitted and acquired, into a capacity that, in principle, can be taught and learned. Thus charismatic qualification can become an object of education, even though at first not in the form of rational or empirical instruction, since heroic and magical capacities, are regarded as inborn; only if they are latent can they be activated through a regeneration of the whole personality. Therefore, the real purpose of charismatic education is regeneration, hence the development of the charismatic quality, and the testing, confirmation and selection of the qualified person.[...] In the course of these transformations charismatic education may become a state or ecclesiastic institution, or it may be left to the formally free initiative of organized interest groups." (Weber 2013, 1143–1144)

Another Weberian example for the impersonalization of charisma is charismatic education. It happens when the charismatic qualification becomes an object of education. Via this transformation, charismatic education may become a state institution, an ecclesiastical institution or an organised interest group.

"At the root of the oldest and most universally diffused magical system of education is the animistic assumption that just as the magician himself requires rebirth and the possession of a new soul for his art, so heroism rests on a charisma which must be aroused, tested, and instilled into the hero by magical manipulations. In this way, therefore, the warrior is reborn into heroism. Charismatic education in this sense, with its novitiates, trials of courage, tortures, gradations of holiness and honor, initiation of youths, and preparation for battle, is an almost universal institution of all societies which have experienced warfare." (Weber 2013, 458)

Charismatic education is a universal institution building force of all societies which have experienced warfare. The hero making elements of charismatic education are the following: trials of courage, tortures, gradations of holiness and honor, the initiation of youths, and preparation for battle.

"It is the fate of charisma to recede before the powers of tradition or of rational association after it has entered the permanent structures of social action. This waning of charisma generally indicates the diminishing importance of individual action. In this respect, the most irresistible force is rational discipline, which eradicates not only personal charisma but also stratification by status groups, or at least transforms them in a rationalizing direction." (Weber 2013, 1149)

Rational discipline implicates the presence of personal charisma and stratification by status groups.

"Historically, the two polar opposites in the field of educational ends are: to awaken charisma, that is, heroic qualities or magical gifts; and, to impart specialized expert training. The first type corresponds to the charismatic structure of domination; the latter type corresponds to the *rational* and bureaucratic (modern) structure of domination." (Weber 1951, 130)

There are two educational ends in history: the first is the charismatic one, the second is the rational-bureaucratic one.

"For cultural evolution the decisive question was whether or not the military charisma of the warlord and the pacifist charisma of the (usually meteorological) sorcerer were united in the same hand. If they lay in the hand of the warlord - the case of Caesarism - the question was: what charismatic source served as the basis for the evolution of princely power?" (Weber 1951, 30)

Weber makes observations on military charisma of the warlord and the pacifist charisma of the sorcerer as well in his writings on charisma.

3.4.10. Research questions

The research question the present dissertation seeks to answer are as follows.

(1) What elements and processes can be found in Angela's text that point to the turn/shift of her personal charisma into the institutional dimension? (Any remembrance of her personal charisma – depersonalization of her personal charisma, the destruction of Angela's personal charisma may be part of it.)

(2) What statements, rites or symbols are expressed by Angela in her text in connection with the charismatic legitimacy of the institutions (Church)?

(3) Is it possible to transmit charismatic education? All the topics regarding Angela's understanding the world are of particular importance. The question of communicability of Angela's mystical message to her followers. (During the mystical experience mystics do not become unable to speak, they communicate their message, the problem is the perception of the message by those around.)

3.4.11. Summary

Finally, from the analysis of the dimension 'person vs. institution' we could see that Weber describes charisma as a personal energy, prophetic and ecstatic enthusiasm, which is evidenced by the successes and happiness of the disciples and followers. So, in the case of personal charisma an important role is played by the demonstration of the magical and religious roots of charisma as well as by the introduction of charisma as an individual divine energy in the various religious traditions. In the case of institution, the highlight was on the presentation of the institution building (the loss of pure form of charismatic authority, depersonalization of charisma, the beginning of institutionalization, and the striking questions of authority); then the detailed introduction of office charisma as the special kind of charisma of the Church was underlined as was the gradual rationalization of asceticism. The section concludes with the discussion of charismatic education as an institution building force.

3.5. Chapter summary

As a summary we can say that Weber discussed charisma around three focal points: (a) an intense field of force, (b) separating immanent legitimacy from magical and religious legitimacy, and (c) dividing it into personal and institutional dimensions.

In the next chapter I analyse Angela's phenomenon and work. The analysis aims to confront the Weberian statements to Angela's text, the *Liber*. As a result, I attempt to bring a bold new approach to Angela's interpretation. In doing so, first I focus on the person related statements of charisma as they appear in Weber's theory, secondly, on the institution related statements, referring to the social aspects of Angela's work. Regarding both dimensions, intensity and magical/religious character are going to define the quality of charisma.

According to the findings of my own research regarding the Weberian theory of charisma, as a result I found the following notions. Weberian charisma – as was clear from the quotes included in the text – is a live, creative and multi-faced term. Above all, charisma is principally seizable as a social relation. It is an inherent element of any kind of society building which has been demonstrated by the various quotes departing from ancient times to modernity. In my own understanding, charisma is a societal leitmotif. It is present everywhere where communities arise.

Charisma is also the pillar of Weberian sociology: without studying it thoroughly, it is impossible to evaluate Weber's work as one of the classics of the field. Weber described himself as a religiously unmusical scholar, though he dedicated a lifetime to understanding and describing world religions. It is my hypothesis that Weber tried to create a what could be called a sociology of world creation. To prove this statement, it is enough to take a look at Weber's own work from the perspective of economy and society. There were three mega-systems which were in the constant center of his scholarly interest: economy, society and religion, and the common link between these systems was the already familiar, revolutionary term, charisma.

As has been demonstrated by research, Weberian charisma is a continuously revolutionary force of history, described always as an intensive, dynamic, renewing, revolutionary term. Why is it so important to underline and emphasize this? If charisma were static, it would not be able to present the dynamism and evolution of economy, society, and religion. Finally, in turn it would not be able to describe the ever interconnected social life and its transformation.

CHAPTER 4

DETOUR: THE AFTERMATH OF WEBER'S THEORY OF CHARISMA

4.1. Introduction

The present chapter discusses the Weberian reception of charisma using three different approaches, by Philippe Rieff, Ulrich Oevermann and Zygmund Baumann.¹⁹ Although the purpose of the thesis is to discuss Angela's person and work in the framework of Weber's theory of charisma, some further considerations of Weber's concept of charisma is an integral part of this endeavor. In this regard I think three meaningful conceptualizations are necessary to take. Before doing so, biographical considerations regarding Max Weber and ideas on charismatic authority elaborated by George P. Boss and Hok-Lam Chan will be introduced.

Several scholars mention that the Weberian theory of charisma is complex, only partially elaborated, and contradictory at times. They highlight that during his life, Weber dealt with charisma in multiple stages and approached it from several angles, which explains why it is not possible, in fact, to pinpoint in a clearly definable way what he meant by it.

In this section I will primarily focus on those questions raised that lead the train of thought further and seem expressly suitable for the further exploitation of Weber's theory of charisma. In the first step I assess the interaction between charisma, institution and institutionalization. There are two reasons why discussing charisma after Weber should be started with that.

On the one hand, we should refine the general opinion that charisma gets lost in institutionalization, and its re-emergence will be manifested in opposition to the existing institutions. On the other hand, it should also be pointed out that Weber himself called various dimensions of the institution charismatic, and often spoke about office charisma. In the following two steps I discuss the derailing of the theory of charisma in a certain sense, which was intended by Weber as more or less value-free. One is the narrowing of the personal charisma to therapy, which disregards the responsibility of

¹⁹ The chapter was inspired by András Máté-Tóth's work, *Intézmény és karizma az Egyházban 2.0.* (2017) Szent István Társulat, Budapest.

society to the community. The other is the historical and contemporaneous experience of the charismatic leader and the fanatic follower's behaviour displayed to him. Both of these aspects powerfully warn that Weber's theory of charisma does not entitle us to assign a clearly positive value to charisma. Last but not least, I will discuss the postmodern ways of interpretation of the concept of charisma, which will reveal that perhaps charisma is not an extraordinary phenomenon opposed to institutional order, but, instead, the other way around, institutionalization means an extreme case of it.

4.1.1. Biographical background

On the wide scale of the reception of Weber's concept of charisma, in addition to the multiple approaches taken to this concept, many authors emphasize that through the concept of charisma Weber attempted to describe a kind of magical dimension and resource, in order to enable the interpretation of conditions ruling society. This choice probably also has a personal background, which was developed by Radkau in his biography of Weber published in 2009.

4.1.2. Understanding the animal-erotic dimension of charisma by virtue of Weber's personality

In Radkau's biography of Weber of over eleven hundred pages, the author explores Weber's personal life in detail, in order to enable the understanding of Weber's scientific work, based on resources that have not been thoroughly processed so far, and demonstrates the tension that has released so much productive energy between Weber's personal life and his role in society and science. He considers the concept of charisma one of Weber's truly original innovations, which was placed in the centre of his theory not by the study of the contemporary professional literature, rather from the inside, so to say, deriving from his struggle with himself. It is the theory of charisma that connects Weber's religious and authority sociology.

Weber struggled with impotence and suffered from insomnia, while approaching, with strong eroticism, his disciple, Else von Richthofen, who was also his lover. Radkau (2009) attributes the passionate characteristic of Weber's concept of charisma from this internal dissonance, which is born from this concept even though Weber made efforts to write about it without values and emotions. Charisma is a primal force, it means magical energies in the person who is so much attached to nature that he

can ignore the logic of culture, economy and politics. Radkau warns that we should not interpret the Weber's concept of charisma as a concept of a sociologist focused too much on the social dimension, instead, he relies on personal and private life sources, and puts the characteristics of the charismatic personality in focus.

Weber himself was inclined to total submission, which he could live in his private life in the relationship with Else, and which he established in the followers concerning the bearer of the charisma. The motif and value of submission is also present in the way Weber writes about dogs and elephants, which serve their masters with total devotion. He calls Else a domina of slaves, who smells of the strong fragrance of soil, who puts a dog's collar on Weber's neck and strips him of any independence (Radkau 2006, 797). During fights in India the drugs used by warriors and war animals were also intended to ensure full devotion and heroism, and although this statement was disproven by later research, it still enables a deeper understanding of extent and the way in which characteristics of charismatic personality and authority are different in Weber's concept from traditional and legal-rational authority. The stupor that confers such an irresistible efficiency on the bearer of the charisma derives from natural-magical-erotic sources, according to Weber. It cannot be denied, writes Radkau, "that the concept of charismatic authority in the concept of Weber is accompanied by gaiety, and partly by spectacularly beautiful associations, which do not deny erotic inspirations" (Radkau 2006, 559).

4.2. Authority

Regarding the question of authority, George P. Boss attempted to develop a certain style of communication for social communication, which he called charismatic. When formulating his study, this concept came to be used more and more often in the public discourse, spurring the author not only to synthesize the relevant literature, but to develop his own model. Accordingly, the speech act and speech situation that complies with all of the following nine criteria can be considered charismatic communication.

4.2.1. Nine characteristics of the charismatic leader according to Boss's classification

(1) the "gift of grace" (i.e. the "divine gift"), meaning an extraordinary personal magnetism in profane parlance (the author refers to Weber and Mommsen), while in a religious context it indicates a transcendent source.

(2) the concept of the "leader–communicator"; when the leader speaks, it is not simply the communication of some kind of content, rather it is about such an energetic speech that is suitable to elicit respect, mesmerize the audience, and inspire idolatrous followers.

(3) the "inspiring message": the charismatic orator does not communicate information but, instead, messages, quite often to the entire world, and does this not only verbally but by using several symbols that he makes available through the means of communication of the given age to large masses.

(4) the "idolatrous follower": the orator is accompanied by a group of admirers, in which the plenipotentiary followers who emerged from the crowd play an important role, those who try to express their devotion for the orator by spreading and implementing the message.

(5) a shared history: the relationships among the followers around the charismatic orator are tighter than in average situations of communication, and often this tight togetherness is based on shared cultural values and has such essential components as shared history, use of terminology, symbols, etc.

(6) high status: the charismatic orator emerges from among his tighter and even more from his more remote followers, which status is guaranteed for him by several legal and symbolic means.

(7) the concept of "mission": the charismatic leader is on a mission and enthuses and obliges his followers to accomplish that mission. The followers participate in the implementation of a cause of extraordinary content and significance through him, and thereby they also become a community that is believed to be special.

(8) an important crisis: the charismatic leader goes on stage in a period of social and human crisis, he can make this crisis the subject of public discourse and induces a relevant concept, mission and movement.

(9) successful (i.e., positive) results: the mission must be successful, at least without success the charismatic leader loses his special status and effect (Boss 1976, 301–12).

4.2.2. The legendary authority of Liu Chi: A possible parallel for Angela

In Chan's (1974) study, the legendary charismatic authority of Liu Chi was based on the constant and powerfully mythologization of this person for several

decades, both among the elite and the masses of people. The sources of his myth were, on the one hand, his high intellectual skills, and, on the other hand, his efficient role as a councillor in the establishment of the Ming dynasty. The legend that made him a mesmerizing and noble personality is based on the combination of these two characteristics. Knowledge of secret sciences was an essential part of the areas of his skills, which were close to magic according to the popular myths. A wealth of anecdotes is available about Liu Chi, which is constantly spreading and expanding. At a certain opportune moment it was based on this charismatic authority that the national consciousness of the Han Chinese people was developed, which strongly relied on Liu Chi as a legendary popular hero (Chan 1974, 364)

In this section the characteristics of the charismatic authority of a person who is partly a historical figure and partly a demigod have been recalled, and in a creative way they can be considered as parallel with the historical and hagiographic characteristics of Angela's personality. Both persons lived in the Middle Ages, and the success of the Weberian concept applied to the interpretation of the Chinese personality supports that Weber's method of analysis regarding charisma can also be successfully applied to Angela.

4.3. Therapy

In the present section I address the criticism of Weber by Philip Rieff, who disapproves of the value-free criteria of Weber's theory of charisma. Philip Rieff was born in Chicago in 1922, as the son of a Jewish family that escaped from Lithuania. He graduated from the University of Chicago, later he also obtained his PhD degree from that university. Later he worked as a lecturer at Brandeis University, at Berkeley, and, finally, at the University of Pennsylvania, where he was a university professor for three decades until his retirement. In professional circles Philip Rieff's name is usually associated with Freud and psychoanalysis, since posterity considers him as one of the greatest interpreters of Freud, and not without good reason, since in most of his writings he focuses on Freud and the criticism of his heritage.

Rieff published his book titled *The triumph of the therapeutic: Uses of faith after Freud* in 1966, by which Rieff became finally established as one of the greatest interpreters of Freud. Later he published two major papers: "Fellow teachers" (1973) and "The feeling intellect" (1990), but after that he chose to remain deeply silent. His

books titled *My life among the deathworks: Illustrations of the aesthetics of authority* (2006) and *Charisma: The gift of grace and how it has been taken from us* (2007) were published after his death. These two latter books can also be considered as the extended conclusions of his first two works.

In Rieff's opinion, charisma underwent a fundamental change: from the gift of grace it became the gift of evil. In the past Jesus Christ was the prototype of charismatic authority, as opposed to modern-day charisma, which was detached from ethical considerations and degraded to a "mere political animal" or an aesthetic action or performance. In his works he tries to place the concept of charisma into what he believes is the original reference system and clean it of the errors of modernity, of which Weber and Freud are the primary representatives. He said to his disciples that he intended to write such theology (!) that does not reject modernity but can be revived in the theoretical framework of modern sociology (Rieff 2007, X). What kind of role does religion play in Rieff's theory? His viewpoint is clear, religion is therapy that is both controlling and releasing:

"Religion presents two easily recognisable and related alternatives: the therapy that controls everyday life, and the therapy that brings relief from the same control. On the one hand, religion a kind of doctrine, which gets internalised and counters the instincts regarding its function. On the other hand, faith may be ecstatic or erotic as well; in this interpretation faith lacks the internalization of faith doctrines, instead, religion gives an opportunity for the instincts to be expressed much more indirectly – for example, in religious orgies or by such a mystical state of mind that relieves the individual of traditional authority." (Rieff 2007, 136)

Furthermore, the following ideas of Rieff's may highlight the positive and negative communities in the pre-modern and modern times which are necessary to understand his theory construction:

"In *The triumph of the therapeutic* Rieff uses the expression "mystical participation" to describe how the social and the cultural order was connected in the pre-modern era. In participation in the primary cultural processes, the man of pre-modernity internalized the symbolic manifestations of redemption, his emotional stability and social inclusion were based on this. This mystical participation is a characteristic feature of communities called positive by Rieff, one of the bases of which was guilt.

[...] This guilt also served as the engine for identification with the dominant character ideal. This is because in the positive communities of pre-modernity, people believed that identification with the redeeming character in itself will bring redemption.” (Rieff 2007, 138)

In Rieff’s volume titled *Charisma*, published after his death, he tried to administer a lethal blow to Max Weber’s charisma doctrine in a way that was meant to summarize and also to radicalize his theory of culture. The statement that it would have been better for today’s culture if Weber had not published anything is a good example of how determined and radical he was (Rieff 2007, 138). According to Rieff, modern culture, which he calls therapeutic culture, is characterized by efforts to become free of ideas and religious norms. “Therefore, for Rieff therapy means both the alignment of the individual and the social order (as it was interpreted by the cultural dynamism of pre-modernity), and the temporary release of the individual from the needs and expectations of society.” (Zondervan 2016, 72–73). Modern culture is faithless, on the other hand, by virtue of its original essence, charisma cannot exist without faith. However, the concept of charisma as elaborated by Weber does contradict this existential concept of charisma. This is the reason why Weber creates the meaning of political religion, according to Rieff’s interpretation. “The notion of ‘political religions’ derives from the Catholic doctrine of structural charisma, from which Weber derived his concept of office charisma. This theory belongs to the analysis of how charismatic authority is transformed into organizational controls of the sacramental form” (Rieff 2007, 189).

Weber’s ideal-typical charisma, claims Rieff, does not require a connection with the sacred, it is not aimed to elevate the individual and society into the rites and mystics of communion with the sacred. Weber interpreted charisma outside the existential framework, and by the theory of routinization he denied the permanence of charisma and excluded the possibility of charisma being or remaining the vital soul of the institution.

It is a consequence of this concept of charisma that for Weber the church became nothing else than a bureaucratic system of power. This happened even though charisma, by definition, is outside the secular processes of institutionalization.

Weber dealt with topics related to charisma in the system of reference of power and legitimacy, and, in contrast, Rieff claims that power does not create a social order,

only personal authority does. Power only creates a system of desire for more and more power, which cannot be stopped or restricted by reference to truths or values.

Rieff confronts Weber's concept of charisma with his own concept of charisma, considering the former a product and marker of special significance of therapeutic culture. By therapy one learns techniques of how to redeem oneself.

"The essence of modern therapy is reflected the best in the process of psychotherapy, in which the individual is temporarily released from social expectations, to provide space for the psychotherapeutic processes. Therapy becomes a technique by which the individual can acquire an analytical mindset and accomplish his own redemption." (Zondervan 2016, 77)

Since Weber detached charisma from faith and stripped it of its original significance, therefore he can reduce such personalities as Jesus and Paul to a common denominator with other figures of authority of ancient times. Jesus was not a therapist, Rieff emphasizes, but a charismatic figure in the sense defined by his own use of terminology (Rieff 2007, 47). The charisma of Jesus is the charisma of obedience, this is the only charisma that deserves its name in the full sense of the word, and it is totally opposed to every humanistic and value ethics (Rieff 2007, 70).

In Rieff's interpretation, charisma belongs to the culture of faith/sin, the logic of which is diametrically opposed to therapeutic culture, where it (i.e. the aim to be accomplished by Freudian analysis) is not returning to the justice of faith and turning away from sin, instead it makes a compromise with the state of faithlessness, furthermore – at least in order to initiate and ensure the success of the therapeutic process – the suspension of moral principles. Therapeutic culture eliminates sin, but the culture of grace and faith preserves the weight of sin while providing an alternative for it by faith.

Various persons receive charisma in many ways and forms, but each has one single aim and accomplishment, i.e. to serve the church, the community of faith (Turner 2011, 62).

"However, the development of such communities became impossible in modernity. In fact, the individual learns social behaviour in entirely new ways, related to entirely new dynamics. We no longer look at guilt as the basis of culture, rather as a fundamental problem of culture and as such a neurotic influence that actually derives from outdated, obsolete cultural

norms and values. The basis of psychological wholeness and the new social order is exactly in emancipation from this impression. The individuals living together that way create the communities called negative by Rieff." (Zondervan 2016, 74–75)

The therapeutic and the charismatic are anti-ideal-types that are opposed to each other.

In his book titled *Charisma* Reiff reiterates his basic position presented in detail in *Triumph*, that “the therapeutic and the charismatic are ideal anti-types” (Reiff 2007, OLDAL??). It is an essential element of understanding the therapeutic that this is the anti-type of the charismatic, and, as such, the opposite follower of the charismatic, who follows his own concept of life and lives on the hope that it is possible for a society to exist without a normative order. It is my view of the charismatic as one that can really restore the ambivalences of our lives by the introduction of interdictions. And the therapist is the one who suspends the interdictions, who is a transgressive (temporary) figure (Reiff 2007, 4–5).

Therefore, in his own way Reiff (2007) redefined the concepts of charisma and therapy, and in this process he unilaterally radicalized Weber’s concept of charisma (removing the dimension of magic from it) and Freud’s concept of therapy (identifying it with releasing from morals). And in a positive approach, he confronted these two ideal-types in such a manner that enabled him to point out the limits of the theories of both Weber and Freud, and could make an attempt to introduce a sociological concept of charisma inspired by theology.

4.4. The postmodern state

In the early 20th century society meant some kind of a whole for Weber and other system creating sociologists: a framework of thoughts, emotions, passions and actions, which had a more or less coherent operating logic, something that could be observed, understood and described as part of a system. This is the effort and the paradigm in which sociology as a standalone discipline was born, and this paradigm is also its legacy from philosophy and theology. This framework of thought can be called a modernity paradigm, which retained its relevance until the end of the 20th century. The increasingly wider acceptance of the truisms of globalization or globality, the philosophical and social science impulses arriving from the former colonies and the

network revolution - to mention only a few aspects - have cracked the paradigms of modernity, and for this reason, from the 21st century at the latest we should now think in terms of new philosophical, social science and theological paradigms, which have been called, for lack of a better term, postmodern, a term that has been constantly disputed since the 1960s. Michel Foucault, Jean-François Lyotard, Jacques Derrida, Roland Barthes, Jacques Lacan - apparently mainly French thinkers - and many others have questioned and deconstructed the truisms of modernity, which means a profound, fundamental challenge and task for social science and theology.

Because of this turn, the theories and models of the classical works of sociology have reached the boundaries of their interpretive capabilities, and they can be considered suitable for the understanding of today's society and culture to a very limited extent only. The towering task for today's social science is whether it is capable of exceeding the paradigm applied by the classical authors for a hundred years and considered universal, and whether it is capable of interiorizing and routinizing the postmodern paradigm.

4.4.1. The postmodern possibilities of charisma

Weber applied charisma to describe certain social processes inspired by the Bible, the canon law of Sohm, disputes of Protestant theology, and the personalities and élan of sects of his time. However, since this term can be considered somewhat ageless, and since it is used in the Bible, it is quite suitable for us to make an attempt based on the postmodern paradigm to understand today's social conditions as well. What Weber could not yet have raised within the framework of the modern paradigm about charisma can be raised related to this paradigm. Weber assumed that in its default state society is traditional and rational, and raised charismatic authority against this as a third state, remaining within the framework of thinking about society as comprehensive reality.

The postmodern movement deconstructed this comprehensive reality and rationality as well, and replaced it by talking about communities of experiences and memories, fluid concepts, imagery and performativity, and from this angle such dimensions of the ageless concept of charisma came to the front that are different from earlier ones.

According to Weber, in pre-modern society charismatic legitimacy existed side-by-side with traditional authority legitimacy (tradition), in which the bearer of the

charisma creates a non-traditional community of his followers. However, after that – as a feature of the disenchantment of the world – personal charisma becomes impersonal, it gets detached from its original bearer and becomes institutionalized. Transcendental legitimacy remains, but it is no longer personal. In Weber's opinion, this is one of the key happenings of modern society, its most important feature. Continuing this logic, in the logic of legitimacy of the postmodern society, personal experience is in focus, and the rationally-ethically driven paradigm turns into one that is emotionally-aesthetically driven. While being charismatic in the Weberian sense is built on a source that points beyond itself, postmodern charisma refers to a dimension located on the other side of itself – it points deep down, as opposed to high up.²⁰

According to Weber, art and religion are related inasmuch as both enable a particular creativity and also attachment to the tradition. However, everything is intellectualized as part of the general process of traditionalisation; it loses its magical dimensions and displays rationally understandable values that explain themselves. Lyotard (1961) also shares Weber's observation, and as the explanation of the process, he also finds that the former state of aesthetics and religion was lost owing to the loss of sensitivity to the sacred.²¹ Carrying on this process of change, religion and the creation of works of art used to connect the consumer with a magical and traditional sphere earlier, then to values that can be rationally captured in the modern era, but in the postmodern era both religion and works of art find meaning in the emotional experience and private enjoyment of the consumer, it is from this perspective that it gets filled up with consumer-dependent sense and meaning.

One of the key concepts of Weber's social theory is disenchantment, during which the magical powers and mystical explanations impacting society get replaced by rationality, which process was called disenchantment by him, as a comprehensive term. Charisma and charismatic authority are replaced by rational decision making and the bureaucratic organizational model. (The author does not reflect on the charismatic dimensions of institutions and gives a one-sided presentation regarding Weber in this respect). The postmodern authors, namely Lyotard, Foucault and Baudrillard, also attached significance to rationalization and market processes in their theoretical topics, processes that turned something that was called charismatic by Weber into something that is now disenchanted. Lyotard (1961) also talks about some kind of historical

²⁰ Cf. Rieff 1987.

²¹ Cf. Gane 2002, 104.

decline, in which art and works of art lose the religious type function that they used to have earlier in social formations, because culture has lost its sensitivity to religion. Art is no longer connected to magic, to the ritual, instead it becomes part of the rational discourse of aesthetics. Similarly to Weber, Baudrillard (1993) represents the opinion that in the world of science pure reason could not fully dispel or displace the irrationality or irrationality of the magical world view. Both of these thinkers let us know that the existing world and culture are vulnerable, and they cannot be fully disassociated from symbolic irrationality (Gane 2002, 83–151).

In Weber's sociology of religion it is important to make a distinction between the religion of the masses and religious virtuosos. Weber assigned the masses to the church type, while religious virtuosos can be found instead in the medium of sects and through persons with charismatic authority. At the same time, the masses need the special charisma of virtuosos in order to strengthen their own religious traditions, which creates a temptation to corrupt charisma. The theory of the religious market displays a close relationship between religious demand and supply. For bearers of charisma, in Weber's theory justification means being accepted by the followers.

In the conceptual system of the theory of religious market this can be described by a synchronous relationship between demand and supply. While in Weber's theory religious virtuosos were considered individual and rare phenomena (in contrast with the everyday nature of the masses), in postmodern conditions charismatic, Pentecostal movements provide the most dynamically expanding and growing religious masses. While in modern conditions the bearers of charisma live off worship of a reality that was perceived by them as sacred, the postmodern religious trends instead indicate that masses worship worshipping itself. While according to the Weberian concept, charisma meant a revolution or contrast compared to the traditional and rational order, in postmodern conditions charisma is rather a phenomenon that maintains the system of needs for experiences, a kind of new fundamentalism.

4.4.2. The interpretation of charisma in the postmodern condition

If we take the fluid modernity theory of Zygmund Baumann (2013) for the definition of the postmodern system of conditions, what differentiates postmodern from modern is that in the latter we could start from order, compared to which crises emerged, and order was restored after the resolution of these crises, even though in a

modified form, the most characteristic feature of the postmodern condition is a permanent crisis, and flexibility is necessary to get oriented in it. In the Weberian approach to charisma, and after that according to several interpretations, charisma is the extraordinary, the non-everyday, the non-conformant state and provocation, which is against order and irritates it into transformation, and as soon as it has completed this role, which can also be considered revolutionary, the modified routine will re-emerge. However, taking the postmodern conditions as a starting point, the permanent transition and crisis, i.e. the charismatic condition, is considered fundamental, and the routine becoming everyday means that the process got stuck. We find that Ulrich Oevermann (2016) had the same concept, although he did not refer to postmodern conditions, but he considered the charismatic state as the default and order as an extreme state.

4.4.3. Weber's concept of charisma according to Oevermann

Weberian charisma is a characteristic feature not of exceptionality but of normality, compared to which routine is the extreme case, if we interpret society in a dynamic model.

“It applies to both the universal-historical rationalization process of Weber and to the enlightenment of Horkheimer and Adorno that, on the one hand, they diagnose the universal historical process not merely as a change aimed at self-sustenance, rather by formal rationality, material rationality, and by the iron structure of obedience and as growth against instrumental sense, on the other hand, they originated this orientation not from teleology arising from history philosophical necessity, rather they assume non-everyday crisis type eruptions for this process of routinization and becoming non-everyday, in which the resolution of crises by charismatisation forces the birth of something that is new and not foreseeable.” (Oevermann 2016, 87)

Charisma and the charismatic person are an accessory of the crisis, in that the charismatic person senses the crisis of a transition or creates an awareness of crisis. In this process s/he will get her/his followers around herself/himself relying on her/his extraordinary talents, who will be willing to suspend their usual activities if requested to do so by her/him, since talents are attributed to her/him for finding their way out of the crisis. If the charismatic solution is capable of being implemented in the long term, then

it will become a routine. It is important in this process that the charismatic does not lack tradition and special authority, as was claimed in error by several interpreters of Weber (Oevermann 2016, 86–87). It is exactly the decisive moment in charismatisation that although the person regarded as charismatic by the followers does not have the system of arguments applying to the resolution of the crisis, he only refers to his own charismatic talents and the source of charisma that exceeds his own talents, to which he is also submitted, and he must make his followers submit to it as well (Oevermann 2016, 89).

4.4.4. Summary

The above examples – which undoubtedly have been selected somewhat arbitrarily – show that the Weberian concept of charisma is a theory developed in the framework of modern society, and if we omit this wide paradigm of the interpretation of society, then the Weberian concept of charisma will serve to throw light on other contemporaneous relations.

The detour encouraged and reinforced me in my original idea to use Weber's central notion "charismatic authority" for the analysis of a medieval mystic. The very original interpretations of this term by all of the three above discussed scholars demonstrated, on the one hand, how powerful the Weberian concept of charisma is, and, on the other hand, what function can be fulfilled by this special kind of authority in the understanding of a person who is basically very far from Weber's culture, thinking, and world.

Now I will turn to Angela's person and work after the discussion of Weber's concept of charisma. I strongly hope that through the investigation of Weber's theory I will be able not only to offer a genuine insight in Angela's life, soul and influence, but, in the mirror of Angela's work, a kind of hermeneutical feedback for the original theory, too.

CHAPTER 5

ANGELA'S WORK

5.1. Introduction

5.1.1. Angela's work: Why?

As a starting point one question needs to be asked. Why is Angela's Book in the center of the present analysis? As far as it has been demonstrated in the literature, Saint Angela of Foligno had only one written work, the book called *Liber*, or, in English translation, the Book. In an overview of the great medieval mystical women authors, Angela's work stands out from among all the others due to personal and institutional dimensions discussed above. In her work one can observe both the personal and the institutional dimension of charisma in the same place, in the *Liber*. This is the reason why this book became the object of my scholarly interest and made it possible for me to follow a Weberian investigation of charismatic authority.

5.1.2. The scholarship on Angela

Angela up to this day is a dominant figure in the scholarship. Angela's unique voice and presence is an everlasting source of investigation for scholars from all fields. *Quod erat demonstrandum*, many scholars from various fields have already discussed Angela of Foligno as a mystic and as the author of the *Liber*. In the following list I attempt to report the most outstanding scholars and works regarding the research of the Folignante.

The variety of scholarship about Angela of Foligno²²:

Text editions: Le livre de la bienheureuse Angèle de Foligno. Documents édites par le Père Paul Donsur avec la concours de Mgs. Faloci Pulignani. Texte latin. Paris-Toulouse, 1925 (Bibliothèque d'ascétique et de mystique 2.) - Saint Angèle de Foligno: Le livre de l'expérience des vraies fidèles. Texte latin publié d'après le manuscrit d'Assise, traduit avec la collaboration de L. Baudry par Martin Jean Ferré. Paris, 1927. - L'autobiografia e gli scritti della Beata Angela da Foligno. Pubblicati e

²² Cf.:Ruh, Kurt (1990): Geschichte der abendländischen Mystik: Bd. Frauenmystik und Franziskanische Mystik der Frühzeit. (vol. 2). CH Beck.

annotati da un codice sublacense per cura di Michele Faloci Pulignani, tradotti da Maria Castiglione Humani con prefazione di Giovanni Joergersen, Città de Castello, 1932. Ludger Thier OFM - Abele Calufetti OFM: Il libro della beata Angela da Foligno (edizione critica) Grottaferrata, 1985 (Editiones Collegii S. Bonaventura ad Claras Aquas) - Il "Liber" della Beata Angela da Foligno edizione in fac simile e trascrizione del ms. 342 della Biblioteca Comunale di Assisi, con quattro studi a cura di Enrico Menestó, Fondazione Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, Spoleto 2009.

Selected translations:

Angela da Foligno: Il libro dell'esperienza. A cura di Giovanni Pozzi. Milano, 1992 (Piccola Biblioteca Adelphi 290.) Angela von Foligno: Zwischen den Abgründen. Ausgewählt, übertragen und eingeleitet von Berthe Widmer. Einsiedeln, 1955 /Sigillum 5/ - Angela da Foligno: Memoriale, edizione critica e introduzione a cura di Enrico Menestó; Traduzione, apparati e indici a cura di Emore Paoli, Fondazione Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, Spoleto 2015 - Lachance, Paul (1993): Angela of Foligno. Complete works / translated, with an introduction by Paul Lachance; preface by Romana Guarnieri. New York: Paulist Press (The Classics of Western spirituality).

Scholarly literature:

Martin Jean Ferré: La spiritualité de Sainte Angèle de Foligno. Paris, 1927. - Antonio Blasucci OFM: Il cristocentrismo nella vita spirituale secondo la B. Angela da Foligno. Misc. Franc. 39 (1939), 79-108., 287-317., 495-528., 593-634. Antonio Blasucci: La B. Angela da Foligno "Magistra theologorum". Misc. Franc. 48 (1948), 171-190. - Tommaso Biondi: Angela da Foligno. Gemma del misticismo umbro nel secolo XIII. Foligno, 1950. - Paul Lachance OFM: The Spiritual Journey of the Blessed Angela of Foligno according to the Memorial of Frater A. Roma, 1948 (Studia Antoniana 29.) - Paul Lachance: Il percorso spirituale di Angela da Foligno. Milano, 1991 (Fonti e ricerche. Biblioteca Franciscana P.S. Angelo). - Vita e spiritualità della Beata Angela da Foligno. A cura di Clément Schmitt OFM. Atti del Convegno di studi per il VII centenario della conversione della beata Angela da Foligno, Foligno 11-14 dic. 1985. Perugia, 1987 - Kurt Ruh: Angela von Foligno. Deutsche Vierteljahrschrift für Literaturwissenschaft und Geistesgeschichte 61 (1987), 35-49 - Ulrich Köpf: Angela von Foligno. Ein Beitrag zur franziskanischen Frauenbewegung um 1300. In Peter Dinzelbacher - Dieter Bauer (ed): Religiöse Frauenbewegung und mystische Frömmigkeit im Mittelalter. Wien, 1988, 227-250. (Beihefte zum Archiv für Kulturgeschichte 28.) -Il Liber di Angela da Foligno e la mistica dei secoli XIII-XIV in

rapporto alle nuove culture, Atti del convegno internazionale Todi, 12-15 ottobre 2008, Fondazione Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, Spoleto 2009 - Il Liber di Angela da Foligno: Temi spirituali e mistici a cura di Domenico Alfonsi e Massimo Vedova, Fondazione Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, Spoleto 2010

5.1.3. An individual approach to analyze Angela's Book

However, in my research I seek to focus on a sociodimensional approach. This analysis attempts to delineate all the specificities regarding Angela's mysticism according to the literature. In this case she will be presented as an original case in the light of the Weberian theory of charisma. As a result, I will outline the basic structure of Angela's female mysticism: what the key concepts are, and whether there are any interconnections amongst them. In addition, I intend to offer my own view of her mysticism.

5.2. *Liber Sororis Lelle*

Angela's Book, *Liber*²³, is a treasury of an intimate mystical journey experienced by Angela. Furthermore, it is a collection of exhortations to Angela's followers. Below I will discuss the structure of the *Liber*, which consists of two major parts, the *Memorials* and the *Instructions*. However, before doing so, I want to highlight the cultural context of Angela's *Liber* with a quotation by Ruth Smith.

"Any attempt to situate Angela of Foligno's Book within its cultural context, to examine its relation to the dominant medieval literary influences, those of the classics and scripture, must inevitably lead to a consideration of the writer's gender. A constellation of issues regarding language and authority can be seen to revolve around the fact that the 'self' being presented here is a female one. As Laurie Finke notes, 'medieval 'high' culture was Latin, male, and extremely homogeneous, including such discourses as philosophy, theology, canon law and liturgy' (Smith 1998, 37).

²³ For all quotes from the *Liber*, please consult the English translation by Paul Lachance: Lachance, Paul (1993): *Angela of Foligno: Complete works*. New York: Paulist Press (The Classics of Western Spirituality).

As a woman, Angela was culturally "illiterate" in the sense that she did not have access to a classical education, with all its philosophical and literary ramifications. More crucially, she could not use the language of culture, Latin, and, therefore, on a purely functional level, needed male help in recording her experiences (McNamara 1993, 10). The fact that the text was, in its original form, spoken, and in the Umbrian vernacular rather than in Latin, inevitably had an effect on the style of the finished book. As Bynum-Walker (1992) observes, women's writing (or in this case, dictation) in their own first language, in this period, was characterized by a "more open, experiential style" than that of scholastic Latin. It was the genres of romance and love poetry which had developed in the vernacular milieu, and use of the vernacular, therefore, pushed in the direction of what Bynum-Walker calls "a vocabulary of feelings" (Bynum-Walker 1992, 196) (Smith 1998, 14).

As Ruth Smith argues, it is impossible to not take into consideration the fact Angela was a woman writer in the Medieval Period. The question of the language was of particular importance. Instead of using classical, eloquent Latin, Angela spoke her Umbrian dialect. Another question regarding the method of registering her text was the method of dictation. Angela was illiterate, so she decided to dictate her messages in the vernacular to Fr. Arnald, who registered the message in the clerical Latin of the time. As it has already been noticed, the original text was a free, fluent, spoken one. As a 21st century's reader of Angela we can still observe her touching style, the atmosphere of the new wind in her message, which sounds modern. All of these affirmations are possible by means of the folk speech which leads Angela to a more experimental, open-minded language style. In general it has to be noticed that the use of the vernacular favoured the exploration of "the vocabulary of feelings".

5.2.1. The structure of the *Liber*

In this introductory part I want to limit myself to providing a brief overview of the structure of the *Liber*. My aim is to demonstrate in Angela's *Liber* the previously reported Weberian key indicators for a fine analysis of charisma and charismatic authority. Thus, I will discuss only the most important points concerning how this book was written.

The approbation of Fr. Arnald is a testimony to the veracity and holy content of Angela's *Liber*. As can be seen, the approbation was made by a group of high

reverend ecclesiastical officers. Cardinal James of Colonna, eight friar minors, three lectors and plenty of other men stated that there is no false teaching in Angela's *Liber*. Moreover, it is a kind of holy book according to them. First of all, it should be noted that the approbation was needed in the religious and political climate of the time because of investigations by the Holy Office of Inquisition.

"Anyone who reads or sees this book, which was written with utmost care and devotion by a certain trustworthy Friar Minor to whom it was dictated by a certain follower of Christ, should be fully aware of the fact that it was seen and read by the Cardinal-deacon James of Colonna before he suffered disgrace at the hands of the sovereign pontiff, as well as by eight well-known lectors of the Order of Friars Minor, of whom one was a lector for many years in the convent in Milan, where the house of studies is located; four held the post of minister in the administration of the Province of St. Francis; two others were inquisitors for many years in this said Province and another was custodian in various custodies. Moreover, three other friars, capable and intelligent enough to be lectors, examined it, as well as many other trustworthy friars, men known for their modesty and spiritual life. None of these saw any sign of false teachings in this book—on the contrary, they treat it with a humble reverence, and cherish it most dearly, like a holy book." (Lachance 1993, 123)

5.2.2. Memorial

To better understand the first part of Angela's *Liber*, the *Memorial*, I need to focus on the fact that she enumerates three basic transformations that God operates in the soul: (1) imitation of the works of the suffering God-man in whom God's will is manifested; (2) union with God accompanied by powerful feelings and consolation which, nonetheless, can find expression in words and thoughts; and (3) a most perfect union with God in which the soul feels and tastes God's presence in such a sublime way that it is beyond words and conception (Lachance 1993, 55). In her *Memorial* she specifies the changes that take place in her life at each step of the way, which makes the *Memorial* a coherent whole.

"Those who are truly faithful know what it is to probe, perceive, and touch the Incarnate Word of Life as he himself affirms in the gospel: "If anyone

loves me, he will keep my word, and my Father will love him, and we shall come to him and make our dwelling place with him." And, "He who loves me, I will reveal myself to him." God himself enables his faithful ones to fully verify this experience and the teaching about such an experience. Recently, he has once again revealed something of this experience and this teaching, through one of his faithful, to increase the devotion of his people. In the pages that follow, there is an incomplete, very weak and abridged, but nonetheless true description of it. Why and how I, unworthy scribe, was compelled to write—as I sincerely believe—by God, and how the said faithful servant of Christ was likewise altogether compelled to speak about her experience will be explained later in its proper place, that is, at the moment when I first learned of it and began to write about it (Lachance 1993, 123–124)

5.2.3. Instructions

In the *Instructions* Angela emerges as a spiritual mother, a "great teacher in the discipline that leads God" as one of her disciple noted (Lachance 2007, 352). As Lachance (2007, 352) reports, this statement was written by the anonymous author of the epilogue. A recent tradition gives Angela the honorific title of "Magistra Theologorum".

What remains a mystery is the question to whom the *Instructions* were addressed. Angela took seriously her role as a spiritual mother, so she addressed her letters to "her sons" and sometimes "her daughters". They probably belonged to the Franciscan First and Third Orders. Six letters are addressed to individuals (8, 10, 12, 15, 17) and six to groups (7, 9, 11, 13, 14, 35), one to Fr. Arnald, and another one to Ubertino of Casale (which is quite problematic from a philological point of view).

Angela was a spiritual leader in the eyes of her followers, she was able to engender and lead others in the path of radical conformity to the suffering God-man and spiritual transformation.

5.3. The key structure of Angela's mysticism based on the Weberian analysis

5.3.1. General introduction: Angela of Foligno and Max Weber

In my opinion, Angela's work can be analyzed in both the personal and institutional dimensions through Max Weber's theory of charisma. In the following section one can observe both the personal and institutional indicators of Weber correlated with the quotations from Angela's work. Why is it necessary to do so? Because Angela has not yet been analyzed with this method. The current analysis aims to bring something deeper and a better understanding of her phenomenon through the analysis. Furthermore, Weber's theory of charisma has not been used for this type of investigation. If this new method will be applied successfully, others may try to examine other remarkable saints, for instance, Saint Francis or other female mystics.

5.3.2. Introduction

In order to understand the essence of Angela's mysticism it is important to study her Instruction IV, where she is on pilgrimage to Assisi and receives extraordinary revelations and graces, in other words, divine charismas. This very instruction is significant because it includes the most important recurring topics and motives of the *Liber*. Namely, Angela's Christ centrism, her pauperism, the intimate mystical dialogues with God, Christ, the Virgin Mary, and Saint Francis; and her continuous attention to the spiritual sons. Angela was venerated already in her lifetime with the title of *Magistra Theologorum*. Thanks to the intellectual circle of her followers among whom emerges the leader of the Spirituels, the nobleman Ubertino of Casale. He mentions his meeting with the Blessed mother and teacher of spiritual life in his Prologue to *Arbor Vitae Crucifixae Jesu*.²⁴

In the core chapter concerning Weber's theory of charismatic authority I attempted to elaborate on the central characteristics of a charismatic personality according to the said theory. Now through this method it should be possible to analyze Angela's person and work. Weber lists a significant number of charismas whereas the personal and institutional factors are highlighted. For a fine analysis, in the following

²⁴ Ubertinus de Casale: *Arbor Vitae Crucifixae Jesu*, ed. Charles T. Davis (1485 edition reprinted in Torino, 1961).

part I am going to present these dimensions in Angela's work with the desire to achieve the key structure of Angela's mysticism.

The upcoming text centered analysis aims to confront the Weberian statements about Angela's *Liber*. As a result, I attempt to bring a new approach to Angela's interpretation. In doing so, first I will focus on the person related statements of charisma, rather than on the institution related statements, pointing out the socio-dimensional aspects of Angela's work.

5.3.3. Personal dimension

Weber described charisma as a personal energy, a prophetic and ecstatic enthusiasm in his work on the sociology of world religions. An important testimony of charisma is whether the disciples and followers can find success and happiness in life. Are the above listed characteristics to be found in Angela's person? Is it possible to prove her charismatic personal energy, the ecstatic enthusiasm? What kind of testimony do we find in Angela's text about the success and happiness of the disciples and followers?

As a basic method for the analysis of Angela's *Liber* I used explorative content analysis as described in Philip Mayring's²⁵ methodological work. The main aim is to describe the content of the mentioned text by using systematically collected and analyzed ideas as variables. In the following subsections I will demonstrate that every text passage taken from Angela's *Liber* is in correspondence with the questions summarized above and then I comment on them from the Weberian perspective.

5.3.3.1. The first twenty steps of Blessed Angela on the way to penance and spiritual perfection

“Charisma was always an extraordinary force (maga, orenda) and was revealed in sorcery and heroism. The charismatic qualification of the novice was tested by trials in magical asceticism, or, given different ideas, it was acquired in the form of a ‘new soul.’ Furthermore, the charismatic quality can be lost, it has to be guaranteed by miracles, heroic feats keeping alive the charismatic aura of the charisma holder” (Weber 1951, 30)

²⁵ Mayring, P. (2010). Qualitative inhaltsanalyse. In Handbuch qualitative Forschung in der Psychologie (pp.601-613). VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften.

– like here in the case of Angela. Above all, the most important expression in this Weberian logic is the very fact that charisma has always an indigenous, magical element which is strictly connected to the person. Charisma is an extraordinary, transformative quality of a person which has a sharp impact on others. Another important piece of information is the special nature of charisma which can be lost. This quality requires the constant confirmation by miracles and heroic feats which keep alive the charismatic 'aura' of the charisma holder.

Through the following twenty steps Angela reaches to feel God vividly and to reach the state of perfect joy. Angela's experience had a great impact on Fr. Arnald who organized and divided this experience into twenty steps.

"The first step is the awareness of one's sinfulness, in which the soul greatly fears being damned to hell. [...] The second step is the confession of sins. [...] The third step is the penance the soul performs in satisfaction to, God for its sins, and it is still grief-stricken. [...] The fourth step is the growing awareness of divine mercy, which granted the soul the aforesaid forgiveness and snatched it from hell. [...] The fifth step is the knowledge of self. [...] The sixth step consists of a certain illumination through which my soul was graced with a deeper awareness of all my sins. [...] In the seventh step I was given the grace of beginning to look at the cross on which I saw Christ who had died for us. [...] In the eighth step, while looking at the cross, I was given an even greater perception of the way the Son of God had died for our sins. [...] In the ninth step, it was given to me to seek the way of the cross, that I too might stand at the foot of the cross where all sinners find refuge. [...] In the tenth step, while I was asking God what I could do to please him more, in his mercy, he appeared to me many times, both while I was asleep and awake, crucified on the cross. [...] In the eleventh step, for the aforesaid reasons, I was moved to perform even harsher penance. [...] In the twelfth step, as it did not seem to me that there was any penance harsh enough to meet my need to break away from the world, I resolved then and there to give up absolutely everything and really do the kind of penance I felt called to do and come to the cross as God had inspired me. [...] In the thirteenth step, I entered into the sorrow over the passion suffered by the mother of Christ and St. John. [...] In the fourteenth step, while I was standing in prayer, Christ on the cross

appeared more clearly to me while I was awake, that is to say, he gave me an even greater awareness of himself than before. [...] In the fifteenth step, I fixed my attention on St. John and on the mother of God, meditating on their sorrow and praying them to obtain for me the grace of always feeling something of the sorrow of Christ's passion or at least something of their own sorrow. [...] In the sixteenth step, one time I had gone to church and prayed God to grant me a grace of some kind. [...] Afterward, in the seventeenth step, it was shown to me that the Blessed Virgin had obtained for me the grace of a faith different from the one I had before. [...] After this, in the eighteenth step, I felt God so vividly and found such delight in prayer that I even forgot to eat. [...] In the nineteenth step, during the period when I was letting out these screams, and after the wonderful illumination and consolation which I had received while reciting the Our Father, I was consoled by the first great sensation of God's sweetness. [...] Following this, in the twentieth step, I went to the church of St. Francis in Assisi and it was on the way there that the preceding promise was fulfilled, just as I told you. [...]" (Lachance 1993, 124–132)

In the old genuine sense of charisma, in its purest form, it is always foreign to economic considerations. This quotation refers exactly to this turn away from the world, both Angela and her followers becoming free from worldly attachments, because pure charisma can never be the source of private income (Weber 2013, 1113-1114). The following quotation from Angela's text expresses this clearly. The following two excerpts present the wonderful and decisive events of Angela's pilgrimages to Rome (1290/1291) and to Assisi (1291). Perfect poverty, i.e. pauperism was one of the states most desired by Angela.

"She so desired to attain a state of perfect poverty that for this purpose she had gone to Rome to ask the blessed Peter to obtain this grace for her from Christ. When I, brother scribe, who had been listening, read this part of my redaction to Christ's faithful one, she affirmed that the aforesaid things were true, even though she said the writing was very defective." (Lachance 1993, 139–140)

The following excerpt describes the charismatic quality of Angela as an example of her chosen status. The quote is talking about the meeting of Angela with the Holy Spirit on the way to Assisi during a pilgrimage.

"Afterward he added: 'Ask whatever grace you wish for yourself, for your companions, and for whomever you wish. Prepare yourself to receive it, for I am much more prepared to give than you are to receive.' Upon hearing these words my soul cried out: 'I don't want to ask for anything for I am not worthy.' Once again all my sins surged back into my memory. Then my soul added: 'If you were the Holy Spirit, you would not say such lofty things to me. For if you were indeed the one speaking, my joy would be so great that my soul ought not be able to sustain it.' To this he replied: 'Nothing can exist or be made to exist unless I will it. For now I have decided not to grant you a greater joy than this one. In the past, I have said less to others, yet one to whom I spoke upon hearing my words fell to the ground, lost his senses, and, became blind. I do not bestow on you a greater feeling of my presence for now, because I do not want your companions to know about it'." (Lachance 1993, 140–141)

As has already been noted in the introductory part of this chapter, in the case of Angela one has to deal with a cross centered mysticism. The Cross and feeling the Cross *intra animam* is a focal point in Angela's mystical journey. Furthermore, the following quotation is a sign of the emotion based face of charisma in the Weberian sense.

"During my return by way of this St. Francis road, he told me among other things: 'I give you this sign that I am the one who is speaking and who has spoken to you. You will experience the cross and the love of God within you. This sign will be with you for eternity.' And immediately I felt that cross and that love in the depths of my soul, and even the bodily repercussions of the presence of the cross; and feeling all this, my soul melted in the love of God." (Lachance 1993, 142)

Following the Weberian analysis of the text, this time one has to deal with charisma as individual divine energy. In the next excerpt Angela appears in the role of Christ's spouse, which is another verification of her personal charismatic quality.

"He then said to me: 'You are holding the ring of my love. From now on you are engaged to me and you will never leave me. May the blessing of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit be upon you and your companion.' He said this at the moment of departure because I had asked him for a special grace for my companion. In response to this request he simply

said: 'The grace I will give to your companion will be a different one from yours.' I must add that when he said: 'You shall never leave me again,' my soul cried out: 'Oh, that I may never sin mortally.' To this he replied: 'These are your words, not mine.'" (Lachance 1993, 143)

In this case one clearly sees that charisma is personal energy, prophetic and ecstatic enthusiasm, which is evidenced by the success and happiness of the followers. This story takes place after Angela's pilgrimage to Assisi: during time of her weakness Angela is given divine secrets and becomes a magical charismatic individual.

"While she was lying in bed after her return from Assisi—as it was related above—her companion, a marvel of simplicity, purity, and chastity, heard a voice telling her three times: 'The Holy Spirit is within Lella.' Upon hearing these words she immediately went to her and began to question her: 'Tell me what is going on, for this is what I've just been told three times.' To this Christ's faithful one answered: 'If this was told to you, it pleases me'; and she gave her approval to what she had said. From then on Christ's faithful one communicated many divine secrets to her companion. Later, this same companion told me, brother scribe, that on one occasion when Christ's faithful one was lying on her side in a state of ecstasy, she saw something like a splendid, magnificent star shining with a wonderful and countless variety of colors. Rays of astonishing beauty, some thick, others slender, radiated from Christ's faithful one. Emanating from her breast while she was lying on her side, the rays unfolded or coiled as they ascended upward toward heaven. She saw this with her bodily eyes while she was wide awake, near the third hour. The star was not very big." (Lachance 1993, 144)

In the following excerpt Angela is meditating on the dual nature of Christ, namely, on his humanity and divinity. Angela's Eucharistic centered mysticism can be also detected. What is also striking is Christ on the throne and holding dominion. This is the first time where the power of Christ is reflected in Angela's written mysticism.

"On another occasion she said she had seen the Christ Child in the host. He appeared to her as someone tall and very lordly, as one holding dominion. He also seemed to hold something in his hand as a sign of his dominion, and he sat on a throne. But I cannot say what he was holding in his hands. I saw this with my bodily eyes, as I did everything I ever saw of

the host. When this vision occurred I did not kneel down like the others and I cannot recall whether I ran right up to the altar or whether I was unable to move because I was in such a delightful contemplative state. I know that I was also very upset because the priest put down the host on the altar too quickly. Christ was so beautiful and so magnificently adorned." (Lachance 1993, 147)

In the following mystical experience Angela is tangible in the "newness" of charisma, namely, "It is written but I say unto You". It is something extraordinarily new. Charisma in this case is announced as a new command. It is a revelation, an inner task, a message, a calling. The success of the leader indicates the success of charisma. The belief in charisma is "the dedication to the extraordinary". Pure charisma in a Weberian sense is equal to the gifts of grace in the biblical sense. And as such, it is foreign to economic consideration. Weber defines it as a vocation, mission or duty. It is exactly Angela's mission and influence that can be detected in the upcoming quote.

"Again, on that road to Assisi, he had also told me: 'I will do great things in you in the sight of the nations. Through you, I shall be known and my name will be praised by many nations'" (Lachance 1993, 148).

Once again, Angela's charismatic quality has the power of charisma as a specifically creative and revolutionary force. Charisma manifests its revolutionary power from within, meaning, from the central metanoia of the followers' attitudes. Furthermore, it is important to note that the recognition of the charismatic master derives from the faithfulness of the followers to the extraordinary. Weber described the charismatic domination which affirms that one can face a transformative, rule-breaking force which influences and changes all values, all traditional and all rational norms (Weber 2013, 1115). In Angela's case these qualities are tangible, which is made clear by the following quotation. Furthermore, Angela appears as a role model for the followers.

"God almighty has deposited much love in you, more than in any woman of this city. He takes delight in you and is fully satisfied with you and your companion. Try to see to it that your lives are a light for all those who wish to look upon them. A harsh judgment awaits those who look at your lives but do not act accordingly." (Lachance 1993, 148)

Based on Rudolph Sohm's investigations, Weber considers charisma as a gift of grace. Regarding Angela, the unction of God appears as a special charisma which

refers to her chosen status. Furthermore, this special quality makes her a possessor of charisma. The extraordinary nature and quality of charisma is highlighted in the next excerpt from the text.

"Behold I now anoint you with a fragrant ointment, one with which a saint called St. Syricus was often anointed, as well as many other saints. I felt this unction immediately upon receiving it, and it had such a sweet effect on me that I desired to die and desired my death to be accompanied by all manner of bodily torment. [...] In this unction, then, I felt within and without a delight such as I have never experienced at any other time nor in any other circumstance, but I cannot say much—or even little—about it."
(Lachance 1993, 150)

In the following excerpt, Angela expresses her dissatisfaction. She feels that what she said has nothing to do with what she experienced in the mystical act. She believes her words are defective and so are the writings of Fr. Arnold. However, she receives confirmation of the content. This feeling of dissatisfaction with the expressed reality in regard to the experience is often found in all mystics. "Unio mystica" as an experience is ineffable. Words are not able to describe such an encounter. This is the exact reason for Angela's dissatisfaction. Moreover, the following quotation indicates that the divine voice removes the doubt regarding the veracity of what was written.

"'All the things which are written here are true and there is nothing whatsoever which is said falsely; but what was said was much more complete or had much more meaning. What I said is defective, and the scribe's version of it is also weak and defective.' And he then showed me how I had this certainty of God's love. He also added: 'God is present in all those things which you are writing and stands there with you'"
(Lachance 1993, 154)

The next excerpt is the most popular and contains the best-known quote from Angela's *Liber* in the scholarship.²⁶ Much can be observed in it, but we will follow the Weberian analysis of the text. What is striking here? Weber says the following:

"But charisma, in its most potent forms, disrupts rational rule as well as tradition altogether and overturns all notions of sanctity. Instead of reverence for customs that are ancient and hence sacred, it enforces the

²⁶ Underhill

inner subjection to the unprecedented and absolutely unique and therefore Divine. In this purely empirical and value-free sense charisma is indeed the specifically creative revolutionary force of history." (Weber 2013, 1117)

Angela and her companion went to the leprosarium²⁷ (possibly in San Lazzaro di Corsiano, located outside the walls of Foligno)²⁸ to find Christ among those affected by this lethal illness:

"This is what she told me: On Maundy Thursday, I suggested to my companion that we go out to find Christ: 'Let's go,' I told her, 'to the hospital and perhaps we will be able to find Christ there among the poor, the suffering, and the afflicted.' We brought with us all the head veils that we could carry, for we had nothing else. We told Giliola, the servant at that hospital, to sell them and from the sale to buy some food for those in the hospital to eat. And, although initially she strongly resisted our request, and said we were trying to shame her, nonetheless, because of our repeated insistence, she went ahead and sold our small head veils and from the sale bought some fish. We had also brought with us all the bread which had been given to us to live on. And after we had distributed all that we had, we washed the feet of the women and the hands of the men, and

²⁷ "Eyewitnesses report a similar gesture in the life of St. Francis. The *Legend of Perugia* records that his brothers saw him, as an act of penance, eat from the same bowl as a leper ("my Christian brother"), whose fingers were so ulcerated that when he dipped them in the bowl to eat, blood dripped from them (*Omnibus of Sources*, 22, 998-99); see also *The Mirror of Perfection* 58, *ibid.*, 1183-84; 1 Celano 17, *ibid.*, 242; 2 Celano 9, *ibid.*, 638-39; *Legenda minor*, chap. 1, *ibid.*, 797-98. Concerning experience with the lepers, St. Francis wrote in his *Testament*: "While I was in sin, it seemed very bitter to me to see lepers. And the Lord himself led me among them, and I had mercy upon them. And when I left them, that which seemed bitter to me was changed into sweetness of soul and body; and afterward I lingered a little and left the world" (Armstrong and Brady, *Francis and Clare*, 154). As Caroline Walker Bynum notes, beside St. Francis and Angela, "there were several other Italian saints who ate pus or lice from poor or sick bodies, thus incorporating into themselves the illness and misfortune of others" (e.g., St. Catherine of Siena, St. Catherine of Genoa) ("The Female Body and Religious Practice in the Later Middle Ages," in *Fragments for a History of the Human Body*, 163, and n. 12). The followers of the sect of the "Spirit of Freedom" were known to drink vermin-ridden water and eat rotten meat (see Guarnieri, "Il movimento del Libero Spirito," 368)" (Lachance 1993, 373-374).

²⁸ Mario Sensi "Angela nel contesto religioso folignate", 74.

especially those of one of the lepers which were festering and in an advanced stage of decomposition. Then we drank the very water with which we had washed him. And the drink was so sweet that, all the way home, we tasted its sweetness and it was as if we had received Holy Communion. As a small scale of the leper's sores was stuck in my throat, I tried to swallow it. My conscience would not let me spit it out, just as if I had received Holy Communion. I really did not want to spit it out but simply to detach it from my throat." (Lachance 1993, 162–163)

In this section, Angela, speaking from her own experience, mentions seven ways of increasing intensity in which God comes into the soul. It can be interpreted that these seven ways are the *Memorial* in the miniature inasmuch as the ways correspond to different stages in Angela's mystical ascension. The seven ways described in the *Memorial* are similar to the Jain charisma of Brahmanical gnosis described by Weber. Jain charisma is a personal journey which can be easily related to western European medieval mystical ways as well. Weber describes the increasing steps of Brahmanical gnosis from knowledge of the writings and holy traditions to the stage of enlightenment concerning the things of this world (Weber 1958, 195). Angela is speaking about seven ways in which God comes into the soul revealing his presence, meanwhile Jain charisma in Weber's theory is composed of seven steps.

"The first way: God comes into the soul as an unexpected gift of grace, but the soul is still unaware that it is God himself who is present. [...] The second way: The soul experiences God's coming into it when it mysteriously hears divine words which make it secure in the knowledge that God is present. [...] The third way: The soul experiences God's coming into it when it receives the grace to want God perfectly and God becomes the soul's companion. [...] The fourth way: The soul experiences God coming into it when it sees itself informed with his great fullness. [...] The fifth way: The soul experiences God coming into it when it is renewed by divine unctions and thus understands that God is within it. In the sixth way, God's love embraces the soul so tenderly that it produces bodily effects which are related by Angela's companion. [...] The seventh way: The soul experiences God coming into it when it grants hospitality in itself to him as the Pilgrim, and this is the greatest and most indescribable experience of the goodness of God." (Lachance 1993, 187–191)

The question of *visio Dei*, both in the medieval period and in the case of Angela. In this section I deal with the medieval concept of the mystical. Pseudo-Dionysios, the most notable source for understanding this period uses two fundamental ways of speaking of God. On the one hand, there is *kataphatic* or affirmative theology, which speaks of God in terms of positive attributes, for instance, God is good, God is love. On the other hand, there is *apophatic* or negative theology, which takes seriously the mysterious and indescribable nature of the divine, namely, mystical theology.

"We would be like sculptors who set out to carve a statue. They remove every obstacle to the pure view of the hidden image, and simply by this act of clearing aside they show up the beauty which is hidden."²⁹ In the following quote clearly the Dionysian apophatic way is in the background. The series of negations of the attributes of affirmative theology are inadequate to express the inaffable.³⁰ The *via negativa* will be discussed more detailed in the following section, on the question of emptiness/nothingness. The next quotation from Angela tells her *visio Dei* experience:

"This is why I see the All Good accompanied with darkness: because it surpasses every good. All else, in comparison, is but darkness. No matter how far the soul or heart expands itself, all that expanse is less than this good. What I related until now;—that is, when the soul sees all creation overflowing with God's presence, when it sees the divine power or the divine wisdom (all of which Christ's faithful had said she had already seen in such a marvelous and indescribable way) - all this is inferior to this most secret good, because this good which I see with darkness is the whole, and all other things are but parts." (Lachance 1993, 203)

When Weber talks about charisma as a great revolutionary force, he writes as follows: "Charisma, on the other hand, may effect a subjective or internal reorientation born out of suffering, conflicts, or enthusiasm. It may then result in a radical alteration of the central attitudes toward the different problems of 'the world'" (Weber 2013, 345).

In this quotation from the *Liber* the Weberian radical alteration can be observed, as well as the internal reorientation caused by the special personal charisma of Angela.

"I was not ashamed, however, to confess in front of everyone all the sins I had committed. I even enjoyed imagining how I could make public my

²⁹ *Mystical Theology* Ch. 2, Pseudo-Dionysius, 1987: 138.

³⁰ *Mystical Theology* Ch. 2, Pseudo-Dionysius, 1987:140-41.

iniquities, hypocrisies, and sins. I wanted to parade naked through towns and public squares with pieces of meat and fish hanging from my neck and to proclaim: 'Behold the lowest of women, full of malice and deceit, stinking with every vice and evil.' I observed Lent enclosed in my cell to impress people and win esteem. Whenever anyone invited us, I made sure they were told: 'I do not eat flesh or fish.' But in reality, I fancied fine foods and was full of gluttony; I was a great eater and a guzzler. I pretended I wanted only what was necessary for me, but I had things put away for another day. I affected outward poverty and feigned to sleep on hard surfaces, but what I really wanted was to stay in bed and sleep all day; and what I did in fact was sleep under many blankets which were removed in the morning so that no one could see them. See what a devil I am and what malice is in my heart! Listen to how proud I am, hypocritical and an abomination before God. While I pretended to be a daughter of prayer, I was a daughter of wrath, pride, and of the devil. And while I pretended to possess God in my soul and receive divine consolations while I was in my cell, in fact, it was the devil who was in my soul and in my cell. Know that, during all my life, I studied how I could be admired and honored and enjoy a reputation for sanctity. Know also that because of the malice, lies, and hypocrisy hidden in my heart, many were deceived. I am responsible for the death of many souls, including my own." (Lachance 1993, 219–220)

The next part deals with eroticism, intimacy in Angela and Weber's conception. Weber speaks about a high grade of intensity when he emphasizes charisma as a foreign force. Furthermore, he connects charisma with the expression of strong, overwhelming emotions like the revolutionary and the extraordinary. In the case of Angela the high grade of intensity is traceable in her passionate love affair with the God Man. Her wonderful and joyful experiences in ecstasies show clearly the erotic nature of women's religious discourse in the Middle Ages. Eroticism is not an allegory of medieval female mystics but a reality. Words like *erotic*, *passion*, *pain*, *suffering*, and *joy* mostly go together in the narratives of female voices of the period. In a similar fashion, Cristina Mazzoni argues that women mystics consistently and repeatedly discuss their experiences of sexuality and the divine. And, Angela of Foligno is the main example of Mazzoni's thesis (Miller 1999, 46)

Eroticism³¹ can be considered in the light of another definition as well:

"Scholars of women's religious history and spirituality readily agree that medieval and early modern women mystics utilized the vocabulary and imagery of sexual love to describe their often intense and passionate relationships with the divine. Although this use of erotic imagery is unique neither to the medieval period nor to women nor even to mystics, what is unique about this discourse-or, more accurately, about feminist interpretations of it-is that it is not thought to be merely allegorical. Rather, the religious experience of medieval and early modern women mystics is often regarded as intrinsically erotic; moreover, the erotic is often considered to be an inherently positive, stable, and self-explanatory category." (Miller 1999, 25)

I am exactly arguing for charismatic rulership being an emotion-based term, risking also to say that Weberian charisma is connected to erotism as well. In this passionate love affair of Angela's with Christ the erotism connected with the theory of charisma is tangible.

"On Holy Saturday, after what has just being related, Christ's faithful one told me the wonderful and joy-filled experiences of God which were now hers. Among other things, she related to me, brother scribe, that on that very day, in a state of ecstasy, she found herself in the sepulcher with Christ. She said she had first of all kissed Christ's breast —and saw that he lay dead, with his eyes closed—then she kissed his mouth, from which,

³¹ Selected sources on erotism of medieval woman mystics are as follows: Elizabeth Petroff, *Body and Soul: Essays on Medieval Women and Mysticism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994); Caroline Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1982), *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1987), and *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York: Zone Books, 1991); Cristina Mazzoni, *Saint Hysteria: Neurosis, Mysticism, and Gender in European Culture* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1996); Frances Beer, *Women and Mystical Experience in the Middle Ages* (Rochester, N.Y.: Boydell, 1992); Grace Jantzen, *Power, Gender, and Christian Mysticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995); and Karma Lochrie, *Margery Kempe and Translations of the Flesh* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1991). (Miller 1999, 25)

she added, a delightful fragrance emanated, one impossible to describe. This moment lasted only a short while. Afterward, she placed her cheek on Christ's own and he, in turn, placed his hand on her other cheek, pressing her closely to him. At that moment, Christ's faithful one heard him telling her: 'Before I was laid in the sepulcher, I held you this tightly to me.' Even though she understood that it was Christ telling her this, nonetheless she saw him lying there with eyes closed, lips motionless, exactly as he was when he lay dead in the sepulcher. Her joy was immense and indescribable." (Lachance 1993, 182)

"By contrast, the power of charisma rests upon the belief in revelation and heroes, upon the conviction that certain manifestations - whether they be of a religious, ethical, artistic, scientific, political or other kind - are important and valuable; it rests upon "heroism" of an ascetic, military, judicial, magical or whichever kind. Charismatic belief revolutionizes men 'from within' and shapes material and social conditions according to its revolutionary will." (Weber 2013, 1116)

The love between Christ and Angela is radical. It is not a hoax, i.e. not a joke. Angela's modern vocabulary may seem to be surprising for today's readers. Although, it only strenghtens her novel linguistic style. The following message of Angela claims the power of charisma.

"Suddenly, while I was engrossed in this effort and desire, a divine word sounded in my soul: 'My love for you has not been a hoax.' These words struck me a mortal blow. For immediately the eyes of my soul were opened and I saw that what he had said was true. I saw his acts of love, everything that the Son of God had done, all that he had endured in life and in death—this suffering God-man—because of his inexpressible and visceral love. Seeing in him all the deeds of true love, I understood the perfect truth of what he had said, that 'his love for me had not been a hoax,' but that he had loved me with a most perfect and visceral love. I saw, on the other hand, the exact opposite in myself, because my love for him had never been anything but playing games, never true. Being made aware of this was a mortal blow and caused such intolerable pain that I thought I would die." (Lachance 1993, 280)

In Weber's theory of charisma, it appears as the intimate, emotionally-based love with God and that it is regarded as something revolutionary, which turns upside down all notions of sanctity. In Angela's text, this intimacy is expressed by words like *peaceful, quiet, divine sweetness*, as well as by the notions of being a great burden and the desire to die. Filled with divine sweetness, Angela spends eight days in bed. This is also a sign of *passivity* of her mystical experience. Such experience tends to render the subject immobile in the face of an overwhelming presence or sense of the unity of all things. In William James' own words:

"Although the oncoming of mystical states may be facilitated by preliminary voluntary operations, as by fixing the attention, or going through certain bodily performances, or in other ways which manuals of mysticism prescribe; yet when the characteristic sort of consciousness once has set in, the mystic feels as if his own will were in abeyance, and indeed sometimes as if he were grasped and held by a superior power." (James 1902, 370)

This is exactly what we see in the following quotation:

"Once I was back home, I felt so peaceful and was so filled with divine sweetness that I find no words to express my experience; and there was also in me a desire to die. The thought that I had to go on living was a great burden because of that inexpressible sweetness, quiet, peace, and delight which I felt; and because I wanted to attain the source of this experience and not lose it—that is why I wanted to leave this world. The thought of continuing to live was a greater burden for me to bear than the pain and sorrow I had felt over the death of my mother and my sons, and beyond any pain that I could imagine. I lay at home enthralled, by this great consolation and in a state of languor for eight days. [...] I lay in bed for eight days hardly able to speak, say the Our Father, or get up to move around. He had also told me on the road to Assisi: 'I was with the apostles many times, and they saw me with their bodily eyes but they did not feel what you feel. You do not see me but you feel me'." (Lachance 1993, 142–143)

What is the charismatic rulership in Weber, and how can it be reached the *Liber*?

According to Weber:

"Charismatic rulership in the typical sense described above always results from unusual, especially political or economic situations, or from extraordinary psychic, particularly religious states, or from both together. It arises from collective excitement produced by extraordinary events and from surrender to heroism of any kind. This alone is sufficient to warrant the conclusion that the faith of the leader himself and of his disciples in his charisma - be it of a prophetic or any other kind - is undiminished, consistent and effective only in statu nascendi, just as is true of the faithful devotion to him and his mission on the part of those to whom he considers himself sent." (Weber 2013, 1121)

Angela is in a particular religious state in the Weberian sense, and, more precisely, it is a mystical one. The following quotes tell more about the relationship between God, Angela and the followers. This triangle does not lack the vocabulary of feelings.

Max Weber discusses the issue of miracles in his theory of charisma and notes the following:

"The miracle in terms of its meaning always appears as the act of some sort of rational, world-linked, godly-gift of grace, seen and practiced, thus inwardly motivated as a spell; in terms of its sense it stands as a manifestation of magical potencies manipulated by irrational, operational arts and by charismatically qualified beings. However, such manipulation occurs in terms of the particular free will behind nature, human or super-human, stored up through asceticism or contemplative performance. The rose miracle of holy Elizabeth appears meaningful to us. The universality of the spell breaks through every meaningful interrelation of events." (Weber 1958, 335-336)

This is similar to the miracle of Angela as well. Angela in this case is led into the abyss of the divinity and, simultaneously, during a vision of the Crucified, is transfixed by the sword of compassion.

"The result of this ecstasy was such fruition and illumination as is totally indescribable. What is said here of this experience captures absolutely nothing of it, for no human words are eloquent enough to express the way the uncreated and omnipotent God powerfully draws the soul to himself. After her absorption into the fathomless depths of God and while she was

still under the impact of this continuing vision, the image of the blessed crucified God and man appeared to her, looking as if he had just then been taken down from the cross. His blood flowed fresh and crimson as if the wounds had just recently been opened. Then she saw how the joints and tendons of his blessed body were torn and distended by the cruel stretching and pulling of his virginal limbs at the hands of those who had set upon him to kill him on the gibbet of the cross. The bones and sinews of his most holy body seemed completely torn out of their natural position; and yet his skin was not broken." (Lachance 1993, 245)

In this part, Angela is offering herself and all her spiritual sons to God. What does this quotation add to the analysis? "Recognizing the personal mission of a charismatic master establishes his power" (Weber 2013, 1115). The recognition of Angela as a charismatic master is proved by the mere fact that she talks about her spiritual sons in this part. Where does this recognition come from? "[...] recognition derives from the surrender of the faithful to the extraordinary and unheard-of, to what is alien to all regulation and tradition and therefore is viewed as divine-surrender which arises from distress or enthusiasm" (Weber 2013, 1115).

"But immediately, my soul, in an indescribable and marvelous way, offered itself to him. Then I offered specifically and by name some of my sons. I offered myself and them perfectly and totally, withholding nothing for myself or for them. After this, I offered all my sons together. My soul perceived and understood that God accepted this offering and received it with great joy. I cannot describe the ineffable joy, delight, and sweetness I felt when I saw God receive and accept this offering with such kindness." (Lachance 1993, 274)

In the next few parts of this chapter emptiness/nothingness plays a key role in the religious tradition and logic does not in any way intend to be exhaustive. Furthermore, it intends to sketch the tradition within Christianity to get a better understanding of the kenotic character of charisma and charismatic authority in Weber's as well as in Angela's work.

The concept of *khenósis*:

"The Epistle to the Philippians says "who, though he was in the form of God, did not count equality with God a thing to be grasped, but emptied himself, by taking the form of a servant, being born in the likeness of

men." (Phil 2, 6-7). The expression *ekenószén* derives from the Greek verb *kenóo* which appears in other Epistles of Paul as well (Rom 4:14; 1 Cor 1:17; 9:15; 2 Cor 9:3), however, only in the case of the Philippines does it refer to Christ. Thus, this sentence or conceptual relationship became the starting point for a certain Christian christology and spirituality, which can be found in the Roman Catholic, Protestant and Orthodox theological traditions as well. The theological logic of *khenósis* harmonizes the irreconcilable opposition between the divine and the human being in such a way that it does not resolve the contradiction. It opens up a contrast-harmonic conceptual space in which the concept of emptiness opens up to a specific interpretation of the relationship between transcendence and immanence." (Máté-Tóth 2014, 240; my translation)

A typical example for *khenósis* in Angela's narration is the following text trace:

"I was and I am now drawn out of everything I had previously experienced and had taken such delight in: the life and humanity of Christ; the consideration of that very deep companionship which the Father from eternity in his love had bestowed on his Son (in which I had taken such deep delight), namely, the contempt, the suffering, and the poverty experienced by the Son of God; and the cross as bed to rest on. I was also drawn out of the vision of God in the darkness in which I used to take such delight. Every previous state was put to sleep so tenderly and sweetly that I could not tell it was happening. I could only recall that now I did not have these experiences. For in the abyss of Christ in which I used to take such delight, so as to make it my place of rest and my bed, I find nothing; in the poverty of the Son of God, I find nothing; and in everything that could be named, I find nothing." (Lachance 1993, 211–212)

Furthermore, this part of the text is also a kind of verification of Angela's personal charismatic quality and her ecstatic enthusiasm which is expressed in *unio mystica* in the framework of the Christian mystical tradition.

5.3.3.2. *Via Negativa*

"From a certain point of view, kenotic theology has a similar sense to what is called 'negative theology', which starts from the philosophical assumption that it cannot formulate positive theses about transcendence as a result of the immanent boundaries of human reason and language, so its allegations can only be statements of loyalty to human characteristics. God in this sense is endless and eternal. In addition, in the mystical experience and in the theological reflection on it, the person in contact with the saint can comprehend its fullness and full saturation by experiencing their own total emptiness. This complete emptiness allows us to conceive an unmistakable perception within the framework of ordinary thinking and prayer. Paradoxically, the greatest emptiness does not merely lead to the experience of the most complete encounter and the specific knowledge conceived in this process, but this emptiness and saturation are simultaneously part of the mystical experience. While the mystic is actually filled with superhuman powers and knowledge, he conceives himself as a passive space. The psychological contradiction is solved by theological reflection in which completeness is only a divine attribute and emptiness is human alone. One of the first sources of negative theology, which also refers to the neoplatonic inspiration, is the hymn of St. Gregory of Nazia, in which God is called creative and unintelligible at the same time. The patristic line can be continued with Kyrenei Synesios, a bishop of New Platonism, Dionysus Areopagita and others." (Máté-Tóth 2014, 241; my translation)

5.3.3.3. Emptiness in Weber

In the case of Weberian charisma we can talk about high intensity as it was demonstrated by the previous quotations; however, we cannot talk about low intensity. Low intensity is missing because in contrast to high intensity in the case of charisma there is emptiness. Emptiness – or what I would rather call the kenotic character of Weberian charisma – is characterized by unstable qualities that are possible to lose. Charismatic authority is naturally unstable. This instability derives from the nature of charisma and especially from the nature of charismatic authority.

In the spotlight of this instability stands the well-being, happiness, and benefit of the followers. If the charismatic person is unable to satisfy his/her followers' needs, the person fails. Moreover, Weber refers to the instability of charismatic authority in the case of the religious traditions of India and China as well. The instability of charismatic authority *ab ovo* constitutes a part of the true nature of charisma. This instability underlines my hypothesis, namely, only an emotion-based phenomenon can be unstable.

In her final admonition, Angela talks about a very distinctive element of pure charisma, namely, one that is specifically foreign to economic considerations. As Weber maintained:

"Wherever it appears, it constitutes a call in the most emphatic sense of the word, a 'mission' or a 'spiritual duty'. In the pure type it disdains and repudiates economic exploitation of the gifts of grace as a source of income, though, to be sure, this often remains more an ideal than a fact. It is not that charisma always demands a renunciation of property or even of acquisition, as under certain circumstances prophets and their disciples do." (Weber 2013, 244)

Furthermore, in the following quote one can observe Angela's statement on nothingness.

"On another occasion she said: Cursed be the advantages in life which inflate the soul: power, honor, and ecclesiastical office! My little children, strive to be small. And then she cried out: O unknown nothingness! O unknown nothingness! Truly, a soul cannot have a better awareness in this world than to perceive its own nothingness and to stay in its own cell. There is greater deception in spiritual advantages than in temporal ones—that is, to know how to speak about God, to do great penances, to understand the Scriptures, and to have one's heart almost constantly preoccupied with spiritual matters. For those who are taken by them fall many times into errors and are more difficult to lead back to the right way than those who have temporal advantages. And again she cried out: O unknown nothingness! O unknown nothingness!" (Lachance 1993, 315–316)

In the following quote one can observe the strictly personal charisma of Angela which made her a leader, a spiritual mother and Magistra Theologorum.

"She is truly a shining light of God, a mirror without blemish of God's majesty, and an image of his goodness. Although she is only one person, she can do all things. Even though she remains in herself, she renews all, and her influence extends itself to holy souls throughout the world. She makes all her sons prophets of truth and friends of God. Truly, anyone who fights against Angela—or rather, against the way of Christ, and his life, and his teachings—has no love for anyone. This is taken from the seventh and eighth chapter of the book of Wisdom. Remember, most dearly beloved ones, that the apostles, who first preached Christ's life of suffering, learned from a woman that his life was raised from the dead. In a similar manner, most beloved sons of our holy mother, our rule has been dead in carnal men since the suffering-filled observance of it by our first apostolic parents, Francis and his companions. Now, learn along with me that this rule, preached by the observance of our holy mother, is immortal! It is not against the order of providence that God, to men's shame, made a woman a teacher—and one that to my knowledge has no match on earth. For St. Jerome said of the prophetess Huldah, to whom crowds ran, that the gift of prophecy had been transmitted to the female sex to shame men who are doctors of the law but who transgress the commandments of God. Thanks be to God always. Amen." (Lachance 1993, 318)

5.3.3.4. Summary of the personal dimension

Weber described charisma as a personal energy, prophetic, ecstatic enthusiasm in his work on the sociology of world religions. This can be interpreted as testimony of the disciple and followers as a result of success and happiness. At the beginning of this chapter I began with a question regarding Angela's personal charisma: Is it possible to prove her charismatic personal energy and ecstatic enthusiasm? What kind of testimony results from Angela's text via the success and happiness of the disciples and followers? Through the cited text from Angela's *Liber* and through my comments it could be taken as evidence that Angela was a rule-breaking charismatic personality. In fact, her writing meets every Weberian criteria for a charismatic personality.

After the analysis of the personal dimension of Angela's charismatic character, the next section will discuss the institutional dimension of her work.

5.3.4. Institutional dimension

In a short overview it is worth repeating what has already been stated about the institutional dimension of Weber's theory on charismatic authority. When charismatic qualification becomes impersonal, the process of its institutionalization is underway. More precisely, when the purely personal quality of charisma disappears it opens the way of its institutionalization. This institutionalization may vary in time and space as well, and this very fact will lead in the routinization of charisma.

The following investigation is going to focus on three aspects of the institutionalization. The first examines the turn/shift of Angela's personal charisma, the second the charismatic legitimacy of the institutions, and the third the charismatic education.

The aim is to provide evidence for the charismatic authority of Angela.

Recognizing her personal charisma, Angela became conscious of her effect on her followers. In this section, the various quotations aim to demonstrate her charismatically engaged mission and messages directed to her disciples. As Weber argued on charismatic authority, a charismatic leader needs followers, and this is verifiable in Angela's case.

As Lachance, one of the most remarkable scholars of Angela's work and the English translator of her *Liber* stated:

"Angela clearly took quite seriously the role that had become hers in the spiritual formation and growth of what for the most part she refers to as 'her sons' (although sometimes 'daughters' are also mentioned). They probably belonged to the Franciscan First and Third orders, priests and laity. She seemed to be quite conscious also that her message was meant to extend itself beyond her immediate group of disciples, 'to those beyond the seas' as she said in her testament. " (Lachance 1993, 82)

5.3.4.1. The turn/shift of Angela's personal charisma

What elements and processes can be found in Angela's text and followers which point to the turn/shift of her personal charisma into the institutional dimension? (Any remembrance of her personal charisma – depersonalization of her personal charisma, the destruction of Angela's personal charisma – may be part of this analysis.)

In the following text one of Angela's disciples is talking about her gift of divine charisma which has an immediate impact on her followers. In this section it is demonstrable that Angela's personal charisma is shifting to an institutional one.

"I believe that the friars whom the Most High gave her as sons of her heart should pay close attention to what this holy mother told me. Generally speaking, the gifts she received—that is, the kind just mentioned— begin in her own elevations and her being set afire, and find their fulfillment in our reproduction of them. By such means, the blessed God clearly shows us that in her is the root from which comes everything we receive, and we are her crown and joy in the Lord. Thus the root of her fervent love may blossom and grow in us as if sending off shoots." (Lachance 1993, 247)

This quotation accurately reflects that Angela's charisma is highly communicable to the disciples. However, it also shows that the disciples' pressure on the charisma holder is high. They demand messages from Angela so they can obey them. The question of communicability of a mystical message is widely discussed in the scholarship. Since Williams James' work, which was widely accepted by the scholarship, we have known that the mystical experience in itself is ineffable. "Ineffable" in this case refers to the undescribable nature of the mystical experience. In James's words: "The handiest of the marks by which I classify a state of mind as mystical is negative. The subject of it immediately says that it defies expression, that no adequate report of its contents can be given in words" (James 1902, 370).

Certainly, this does not mean that mystics do not talk about their mystical experiences. In the case of Angela, it is obvious that her experience is a narrated and dictated one. Thanks to this written account, the followers (whether past or present) have been able to follow her. Through the presence of the followers, the institutionalization of charisma is underway.

"For the total state of her soul is so beyond description that we can hardly stammer anything about it. This is not surprising since she herself, an expert and a teacher of these things, asserted that she could say absolutely nothing about them because their modality is totally beyond description. It seemed to her a kind of blasphemy to try to express the inexpressible. But her maternal instincts swayed her, and our persistent requests won her over, to some extent. Still, it must have been extremely painful for her.

More than anyone else I ever knew, she was in the habit of saying: "My secret is mine." (Lachance 1993, 248)

5.3.4.2. Charismatic legitimacy of the institutions

What statements, rites or symbols expressed by Angela's text show a connection with the charismatic legitimacy of the institutions (especially the Church)?

Turning to the question of the charismatic legitimacy of the institutions, first, the circle of disciples has to be examined. It is especially important because the circle of followers guarantees the institutional dimension of Angela. To examine it deeper, in the following section I am going to give a general sketch on Angela's followers and her influence from the Middle Ages until the 20th century based on Lachance's investigation who pointed out Angela's most remarkable impacts.

Angela's most direct influence was on the small group of disciples for whom she served as spiritual mother. Very little is known about them, but it does seem that some of them were likely to be friars who shared the aspirations of the Spiritual party of the Franciscans. Thus, it appears that some of them were quite learned. Furthermore, Angela seems to have been quite conscious of the universality of her message, one meant to extend itself beyond the confines of Umbria. Ubertino of Casale was the most notable and passionate leader of the Spirituels. His encounter with Angela probably took place in 1298 and had a great impact upon him. In the prologue of his book *Arbor vitae crucifixae Jesu*, he sings the praises of Angela, who attributed his conversion to a more ascetic life (Lachance 1993, 109).

In the following I am dealing with the problems in early dissemination of Angela's *Liber*. An important handicap to the early distribution of Angela's text may well have been the fact that it bears the sign of approval of Cardinal James of Colonna, a notable friend of the Spirituels. Only a few months after signing the approbation of Angela's *Memorial* (10 May 1297), the first part of her *Book* was deposed and excommunicated by Boniface VIII (10 May 1297). (Lachance 1993, 111) Significantly, most of the surviving manuscripts do not contain this approbation. In the Assisi codex one finds written on the margin by an anonymous Franciscan that "this book was given to me by an unknown donor and I have not been able to find out who". This codex is entitled "*Liber sororis Lellae de Fulgineo de tertio ordine sancti Francisci*" (*sorois Lellae* refers to Angela). This codex was found in the Sacro Convento in Assisi, and it

was not kept in the public library but under reserve in the "secret" archive, where it was accessible to only a few - yet another indication that it was considered a dangerous book. It might be that Angela's text played a role in the quarrel shaking the Franciscan Order at that time. Many probably sought to keep their distance from the text and its diffusion (Lachance 1993, 111-112).

In the late medieval period, Angela's text found early recognition in Belgium, the text probably circulated among Beguine, and later, perhaps in the *Devotio Moderna* circles. In the fifteenth century, Angela's *Liber* makes its appearance in Spain and France, and in the second half of the sixteenth century its presence is documented in Germany. Indeed, among the Franciscans recognition of Angela's importance seems to have been slow in coming. Her name reappears, especially in the circles of the Observance, a reform wing of the Franciscans, who regarded her as one of their heroines. Finally, the interest in Angela's writings among Franciscan climaxes with the first secularly known printing of Angela's *Liber*, promoted by the Spanish Franciscan cardinal Francesco Ximenes, an Observant: a Latin version was published in 1505, and a Spanish in 1510. This Spanish version was also read by St. Theresa of Avila and probably by St. Ignatius of Loyola (Lachance 1993, 112-113).

In 1643, the notable Jesuit hagiographer Johannes Bollandus published a Latin edition of Angela's writings, which had significant influence. Pope Benedict XIV (1675-1758) saw Angela as the equal of St. Theresa of Avila, St. Peter of Alcantara, St. John of the Cross, St. Bridget of Sweden, and St. Catherine of Siena. Angela's writings also surfaced toward the later part of the sixteenth century in the German Pietism movement. It is in French circles that Angela's influence is most notable, and perhaps no one has given greater impetus to the reading of her writings than the French philosopher Ernest Hello (1828-1885). In 1868, he published his translation of Angela's writings, *Le livre des visions et instructions de la bienheureuse Angele de Foligno*. It had enormous success, enjoying as many as ten editions, the most recent one by a Swiss publishing house in 1976. What Hello tried to do, as he indicates in his preface, is to translate, not according to the letter of the text, but according to its spirit: "I have tried to bring to life in French what was alive in Latin. I have tried to make the French cry out what the soul cried out in Latin. I have tried to translate tiers" (Hello 1976). Hello's brilliant translation catapulted Angela into consciousness of modern French culture. Thanks to Hello's translation Angela became popular outside the Franciscan world. The novelist Georges Bataille, perhaps the most important contemporary philosopher to explore the

link between mysticism and eroticism, refers to Angela in his writings (*L'archangélique* and *Le tombeau*). It was likewise in France that the first major attempt was made to produce a critical edition of Angela's writing in 1925 by Paul Donceaur. Shortly thereafter, in 1932, in Italy, M. Faloci Pulignani published a Latin edition based on a not very reliable codex, the Subiaco (Lachance 1993, 115-116).

In the twentieth century, Evelyn Underhill quoted Angela in her key studies on mysticism. More recently, medieval scholars such as Caroline Walker Bynum and Elizabeth Petroff refer to Angela frequently (this has already been discussed in detail in the introductory chapter). Prominent French feminists Simone de Beauvoir, Julia Kristeva and Lucy Irigaray were intrigued by her and quoted her in their writings (Lachance 1993, 116).

Finally, Thomas Merton devoted a conference to Angela for his novices at the monastery of Gethsemani. He speaks of her ("one of the wild mystics") as follows: "This is the great truth about her life: In her passion, instead of being sort of locked up behind doors and left in a closet, becomes completely devoted to God. Passion gets completely caught up in her love for God and in the giving of herself to God" (Lachance 1993, 117).

To understand the charismatic legitimacy of the institution in Angela's case or the lack of it is important to turn back to Weber's statement on pure charisma. "Wherever it appears, it constitutes a call in the most emphatic sense of the word, a "mission" or a "spiritual duty" (Weber 2013, 244). In the case of Angela, if one reads carefully the reported quotations, we face her pure charismatic quality.

To understand Angela's presence and fervent mysticism, it is necessary to repeat her pure charismatic qualities in the Weberian sense. "Pure charisma is specifically foreign to economic considerations. [...] In the pure type it disdains and repudiates economic exploitation of the gifts of grace as a source of income, though, to be sure, this often remains more an ideal than a fact. It is not that charisma always demands a renunciation of property or even of acquisition, as under certain circumstances prophets and their disciples do" (Weber 2013, 244). That is why she said that power, honor and ecclesiastical office have to be out of interest among her disciples.

"On another occasion she said: Cursed be the advantages in life which inflate the soul: power, honor, and ecclesiastical office! My little children, strive to be small" (Lachance 1993, 315).

In the Weberian analysis, office charisma appeared as a very specific and significant case of institution building. Regarding Angela, office charisma is mostly available in her affection to the Spirituals (a reform wing in the internal struggles of the Franciscan Order of the time). However, as a member of the Franciscan Third Order, and fervent admirer of Saint Francis, Angela never appears as an antipode to the Official Church. Furthermore, in my hypothesis, Angela as *Magistra Theologorum in personam* represents the office charisma, as the priest does via his *character indelebilis*. Angela calls her followers to be fully present in prayer.

"Are you not also aware that when you recite the Divine Office and are not totally present to it as you ought to be, you deserve to be punished? Thus when you recite the Office you do and you do not, because you are not totally present to it. This troubles you and you start over again from the beginning, and this very struggle is your just punishment. And when you want to go back and meditate on what you have just said, you are immediately distracted and do not remember anything about it. This happens as a punishment for our malice. For when we pray God wants us to be totally present and not divided. Therefore when we pray, let us keep our heart totally present to God, and not divided, because when our heart is divided we lose the fruit of true prayer." (Lachance 1993, 260)

From Angela's *Liber* we do not have information regarding her exact position on the Church. As a matter of fact, the unique statement by her in this regard is addressed to the followers not to have any ecclesiastical office in their life – which is a remarkable sign of her strong affiliation to the Franciscan Order and its radical poverty mission. Albeit, she refers frequently to the divine office, which is proof of her constant focus on the transcendent. The divine officers, namely, the angels are in an auxiliary role in Angela's mysticism, especially arcangel St. Michael.³²

"On the feast of the angels during the month of September, I was in the church of the Friars Minor in Foligno and wanted to receive communion. When the time for communion arrived, I prayed as I had before to the angels and especially St. Michael, and I asked them the following: 'O ministers of God, you have the office and the power to administer and present him to others, make the God-man present to me and make him

³² Faes de Mottoni, Barbara: *Gli Angeli nel Liber*. Angèle de Foligno. Le dossier. Collection de l'École Française de Rome 255 185-202.

present in the same way that the Father gives him to humanity, first of all as alive, poor, suffering, in contempt, wounded, bloodied, crucified. Afterward, make him present to me as dead on the cross.'" (Lachance 1993, 275)

The priest, as the holder of office charisma according to Weber, appears in the *Liber* only in connections with daily serving the holy mass.

"I know that I was also very upset because the priest put down the host on the altar too quickly" (Lachance 1993, 147).

The question of charismatic authority in the case of the legitimate sons of God in Angela's *Liber*. Angela talks a lot about the "legitimate sons of God"³³ who are those followers of God (and in this certain sense, her disciples as well) who constantly seek God, hear the divine teachings, obtain divine wisdom, and find their own delight. Christ's sufferings are central for them, they are devoted to true prayer, their soul is transforming into the Beloved, they follow the Father in poverty, suffering and contempt, and they feel perfect love for God and their neighbour. Here we have to do with an emotional form of communal relationship according to the Weberian terminology: "An organized group subject to charismatic authority will be called a charismatic community (*Gemeinde*). It is based on an emotional form of communal relationship (*Vergemeinschaftung*)" (Weber 2013, 243). Charismatic authority is *sui generis* foreign to all rules and sharply opposed to the patterns of everydayness, it is an irrational and emotion-based community.

There are eight quotes in Angela's text which touch on the question of the legitimate sons of God (Lachance 1993, 134; 162; 233; 236; 261; 268-269; 277; 281-282) What can prove best Angela's charismatic quality? Certainly, the presence of her disciples/followers. "These are such as are not accessible to the ordinary person, but are regarded as of divine origin or as exemplary, and on the basis of them the individual concerned is treated as a 'leader' [...]. What is alone important 'is how the individual is actually regarded by those subject to charismatic authority, by his 'followers' or

³³ "It was used by Franciscans of the first generations in the debate on who were the legitimate sons of St. Francis. Its primary source seems to be a story in *The Legend of the Three Companions*, an early biography of the saint (1246). The Lord tells St. Francis a parable; in it a king espouses a poor woman, and he tells her sons when they have reached adulthood: "Fear nothing, for you are my sons. If strangers are fed at my table, how much more you who are my legitimate sons. (*Omnibus of Sources*, chap. 12, n. 50, 934)" (Lachance 1993, 372-373).

‘disciples’” (Weber 2013, 241–242). The above listed three affirmations are valid also for the charismatic education of Angela.

"It also teaches that the legitimate sons of God are those who seek to know who is this God, their Father, who gave them the gift of sonship. They do this because they truly wish to know him and please him" (Lachance 1993, 134).

"I cannot conceive anything greater than the manifestation of God and self. But this discovery, that is, this manifestation of God and self, is the lot only of those legitimate sons of God who have devoted themselves to true prayer" (Lachance 1993, 236).

"In the beginning when he had shown me the specific characteristics of his sons he had said to me: "All those who are lovers and followers of my poverty, suffering, and contempt are my legitimate sons; and these are likewise your own sons, and no others." (Lachance 1993, 281–282).

5.3.4.3. Charismatic education

Is it possible to transmit charismatic education? All the topics regarding Angela's understanding of the world are of particular importance. How can Angela's mystical message be communicated to her followers? (During the mystical experience mystics do not become unable speak, they communicate their message, the problem is the perception of the message by those around.)

On charismatic education, contrasting Angela and Weber's notions are the following:

"Once charismatic qualification has become an impersonal quality, which can be transmitted through various and at first purely magic means, it has begun its transformation from a personal gift that can be tested and proven but not transmitted and acquired, into a capacity that, in principle, can be taught and learned. Thus charismatic qualification can become an object of education, even though at first not in the form of rational or empirical instruction, since heroic and magical capacities, are regarded as inborn; only if they are latent can they be activated through a regeneration of the whole personality." (Weber 2013, 1143)

Regarding Angela, charismatic education in the Weberian sense appears as teaching and exhortation. In her *Instructions*, Angela addresses many of her teachings to

her thirty-six disciples. In general, Angela's teachings concern many aspects of spiritual life, including but not limited to keywords like spiritual love, true love, transformative love, sins, prayers, poverty, extraordinary revelations, humility, temptations, suffering of Christ, and the sufferings of Angela, as well as union of mind, penance, tribulations, knowledge of God and self, legitimate sons of God, nativity of Christ, angels, Christ - St. Francis - The Virgin Mary, intimacy with Christ, liberty, transformative gifts of God, consolations, Eucharist.

In fact, the following quotations are the most remarkable ones of Angela's teachings, underlying the institutional dimension of her activity.

As Lachance comments, we face the dissension that at that time divided the Franciscan Order into two factions: the Community and the "zelanti" or Spirituals. A possible date of composition for this instruction is the end of 1298 or beginning of 1299 (Lachance 1993, 263).

"O you who are dearest to my soul, I desire for you what I desire for my companion and myself: that you always be of one mind and that there be no divisions among you. I desire that you have in your souls what leads from-discord to unanimity, namely, becoming little. When you are little, you do not consider yourself self-sufficient because of your knowledge or natural abilities, but rather you are always inclined to acknowledge your defects and your miserable condition; you question yourself and contend against yourself so as to convince yourself of your defects and strive to correct them. To be little also means that you are not a threat or a burden to others; nor are your words contentious, even if your life strikes a powerful blow to all those who are opposed to this littleness. This is what I desire from you, my dearest ones, that by following this way of littleness and poverty, disciplined zeal and compassion, your life may be, even when your tongue is silent, a clear mirror for those who wish to follow this way, and a sharp-edged sword against the enemies of truth." (Lachance 1993, 263)

In the following quote the strong maternal love is visible and is connected to Mary. The numinous presence of the Virgin Mary and love is similar to Angela's relationship to her spiritual sons.

"Then, as we approached the church of the most blessed mother of God she, the queen of mercy and mother of every grace—who had before

appeared exalted on high—now leaned down toward her sons and daughters, and in a new and most gracious manner redoubled her most sweet blessings. She kissed them all on the breast, some more, some less, and some she held closely in her arms, as well as kissing them. Her love for them was so great that, as she appeared, totally numinous, she seemed to absorb them into the almost infinite light within her breast. It did not seem to Christ's faithful one that she saw arms of flesh, but a wonderful and very soft light into which the mother of God absorbed them as she hid them within her breast and held them with a great and deeply felt love." (Lachance 1993, 249)

What is the role of Saint Francis in Angle's work? This admonition is clear evidence of Angela's intervention in the struggle among the Franciscans between the Spirituals and the "community", as is reflected on by Paul Lachance in his notes on the *Instructions*. Furthermore, Lachance affirms:

"Instruction XXXIV. contains the concrete and detailed application of what it means to share in "the first company of Christ", namely poverty - an enumeration of examples in consonance with *usus pauper* criterion developed by the Spirituals. [...] Francis is described as the personification of perfect interior and exterior poverty and poverty as the key to open and understand the story of salvation. Both of these themes were dear to the Spirituals. Support for the Spirituals is likewise in evidence in instruction e4, where Francis appears to Angela and praises the sons "who burn with zeal to observe the poverty prescribed by the rule"." (Lachance 1993, 353-354)

Zeal equals *zelanti* and refers to the Spirituals.

"Among other things, the blessed Francis appeared to her, glorified, and greeted her in his usual fashion: 'May the peace of the Most High be with you.' He always greeted her with a most pious, very humble, gracious, and affectionate voice. He then highly praised the intentions of those of his sons who burned with zeal to observe the poverty prescribed by the Rule, and he exhorted them to grow in deeds. Then he said: 'May the eternal, full, and abundant blessing which I received from the eternal God descend upon the heads of these most beloved sons, yours and mine. Tell them that they are to help me by following the way of Christ and making it manifest

in word and deed. And they should have no fears, for I am with them and the eternal God is there to help them'." (Lachance 1993, 250)

In this case Angela's intervention in the struggle of the Franciscans between the Spirituals and the "communities" is also visible in a subtle form. This is where Angela's activity becomes social. In the following excerpt she is teaching about clearly distinguishing these.

"Once I, brother scribe, asked her to pray to God for brother Dominic of the Marches that he might not fall into error. Praying fervently, she immediately received the following answer: Everything which belongs to others must be granted to them; but as long as one is alive one must always retain what belongs to oneself. Thus with great care one must retain what is one's own and similarly give back what belongs to others, and not mix up one's own possessions with someone else's." (Lachance 1993, 166)

This teaching also underlines Angela's pure charismatic authority where the focus is poverty, revealing the lack of interest in economic considerations. After the pilgrimage to Assisi, this message was addressed to the followers by Angela.

"Why do you want to know so much? The blessed God himself has poured himself totally out in love for you, and so has his most sweet mother. They wish to bear all the burden of your penance. They only ask that you be shining examples of their pain-filled, very poor, and despised life." (Lachance 1993, 250–251)

Angela's mysticism is imitation based. According to Angela's narration, the imitation of the passion of Christ is easy.

"Christ's faithful one once told me that she had heard God tell her that it is easy for those for whom Christ died to die for him; it is easy for those for whom he suffered to suffer for him; it is easy for those for whom he was despised to be despised for him" (Lachance 1993, 282).

This is another example of the charismatic authority of Angela. The love based communistic group of her sons, who are all blessed by God, is a community. The text shows revelations and visions concerning Angela's spiritual sons.

"Then I was told of all my spiritual sons in general: 'These and all the others will be sources of joy for you. I had prayed that they would all be purified and be sources of joy for me. God himself purified them all and

he said: 'To your sons present and absent I will bestow the fire of the Holy Spirit who will set them ablaze and, through love, will transform them completely into my passion. This transformation, however, will vary greatly from one to another. The more they keep in mind my passion, the more they will have of my love; and the more of such love they have, the more they will be united to me.' He added other things about these different degrees of transformation, but I no longer remember them. All this delighted me very much." (Lachance 1993, 283)

The relationship between Angela and Fr. Arnald (who in the text is referred to as "Brother A.") is crucial for the success of the charismatic message. Fr. Arnald was the first person who became Angela's disciple, giving credibility to her ecstatic states of mind and her narrations on the divine wisdom. This admonition shows how Angela acknowledges Fr. Arnald's presence enforced by this divine message.

"Again, when Brother A. was celebrating Mass at an altar in another part of the church, I was told: 'May my son and now yours receive the blessing of God the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit; this will be a source of great joy for you.' And he said: 'You will have sons, and all of them will receive this blessing, for all my sons are yours, and yours, mine.' While I was back in Foligno, after I had received communion at the last Mass Brother A. celebrated, I was told concerning him: 'This intimate son of yours will be a source of great joy for you; I confirm the eternal blessing I gave him. I am the one who takes away sins; none but I can do so. I have removed from him the guilt and the penalty.' As I did not understand any of these words, I related them to the said brother after he had finished his Mass. When he heard the words 'I have removed from him the guilt and the penalty,' he took off his capuche, bowed his head, and wept. Also, the blessed Francis said of this friar: 'Sister, remember me to my brother, Brother A'." (Lachance 1993, 284)

The spiritual formation of her spiritual sons and daughters is responsible for the unity of *Instructions*. In this part, Angela emerges as *magistra theologorum*, that is, teacher of theologians, spiritual mother, a "great teacher in the discipline that leads to God". This statement was written by the anonymous author of the epilogue. The quotation is probably taken by M. Sandaeus ("Talis fuit Angela, Theologorum

Magistra") in 1624 and quoted by J. Bollandus³⁴ (Lachance 1993, 352). Since then tradition has given Angela the title of "Magistra Theologorum".

This instruction is a kind of systematically constructed summa of Angela's teaching on prayer and the ways of imitation of Christ. Prayer is a central motif of Angela's mysticism, very often presented both in the *Memorials* as well as the *Instructions*.

"It is in prayer that one finds God. There are three schools, that is three types of prayer, without which one does not find God. These are bodily, mental, and supernatural. Bodily prayer takes place with the sound of words and bodily movements such as genuflections. I never abandon this type of prayer. [...] Prayer is mental when meditating on God so occupies the soul that one thinks of nothing but God. If some other thought comes to mind I no longer call such prayers mental. [...] I call prayer supernatural when God, bestowing this gift upon the soul and filling it with his presence, so elevates the soul that it is stretched, as it were, beyond its natural capacities. [...] In these three schools of prayer you come to know who you are and who God is. From the fact that you know, you love. Loving, you desire to possess what you love. And this is the sign of true love: that the one who loves is transformed, not partially, but totally, into the Beloved." (Lachance 1993, 286–287)

Following the construction of the previous instruction, in this part Angela's teachings on the three aspects of the Eucharist are summarized.

"Now I want to begin speaking to you about these three aspects of the holy sacrifice which we should look at, namely, the two with which the God-man was concerned when he instituted it, and third, how the soul is brought in to see these two. In the first aspect we see the ineffable love he had for us; how his deep love for us poured into us totally; how he handed himself over to us totally and for always. In the second we see the unspeakable and deadly pain he suffered for us; how at the moment of his death he had to leave us, and leave us through such a most painful death; how he had to pass through such indescribably acute suffering, which had to include feeling abandoned." (Lachance 1993, 291)

³⁴ In Acta Sanctorum, 1. Antwerp, 1643, 234.

As Paul Lachance mentions, Angela desired to receive the Eucharist daily, an unusual practice at the time. However, the text reported here is not from St. Augustine but from Gennadius of Marseilles, whose text was well known in the Middle Ages (Lachance 1993, 413). The Holy Communion and receiving it was as important for Angela as was constant prayer.

"Once Angela was questioned by two trustworthy Friars Minor concerning a phrase from St. Augustine: 'Receive the Eucharist every day,' and so forth. She replied as follows. Blessed Augustine was holy and wise. Seeing good persons mixed with evil ones, in order not to embolden the latter, he did not praise such a practice. And in order not to hinder the good, he did not blame this practice. For evil persons draw their boldness from the praise of others. The good find their security in a good conscience and this must not incur the blame of a saint." (Lachance 1993, 299)

This instruction is the synthesis of Angela's spirituality. The last instruction is from when she was still alive, the composition is around 1308. The love based mysticism of Angela reaches its apex in this admonition.

"God, our uncreated, incarnate, supreme, and perfect Good, is total love. He loves totally and wants to be loved totally. Hence, he wants his sons to be totally transformed into him by love. The ones I call his special and beloved sons are those who live in grace and charity in this good and perfect God, with the perfection of love. We are all his sons in the order of creation, but his special chosen sons are those in whom God, the supreme Good, takes special delight because he discovers in them his own likeness. Only divine grace and divine love, which is perfect love, deposit, realize, and shape this likeness in the soul of every son of God. Therefore God, noble by nature, wants the heart of his son not partially but totally, without intermediary, and without any rival companion." (Lachance 1993, 299)

Another central tenet of Angela's spirituality is the triad of poverty, suffering and contempt; in Angela's words, the 'companions of Christ'. This is Angela's testament as well.

"What kind of a companionship was it, then, that accompanied Christ faithfully, continually, and lovingly? It seems to me it was the one that God the Father on high, according to his plan, destined for his Son for his

earthly existence; the most perfect, continual, and highest poverty; the most perfect, continual, and highest contempt; the most perfect, continual, and highest suffering. Such was the companionship which accompanied Christ continually in his continual penance. This penance lasted as long as he lived on earth. Through it he, in his humanity, traveled toward heaven. And through it the soul can and should walk toward God and in God. There is no other way. It is necessary that the way the Head followed, the members should follow; and the companions that accompanied the Head should likewise accompany his members." (Lachance 1993, 303)

Angela once again in her last message to the disciples remembers those who are the legitimate sons of God. This status mostly means the deepest and fathomless sufferings in life.

"My little children, strive to be charitable toward everyone, because I say to you that my soul truly received more| from God when I wept and suffered with all my heart over the sins of others than when I wept over my own sins. Truly, there is no greater charity on earth than to suffer for the sins of others. The world could mock what I say, because it seems to be contrary to nature that someone could suffer and weep over the sins of one's neighbor more than for one's own. But the charity which does this is not of this world. My children, strive to have this charity. Judge no one, even when you see someone commit mortal sin. I do not tell you that sin should not displease you, or that you should not sin, but I say that you should not judge sinners, because you do not' know the judgments of God. For many seem to us to be saved and are actually damned before God, and there are many who seem to us to be damned and are saved by God. I can tell you that there are some whom you have despised, who stray, that is, who are destroying the good things they have begun, but about whom I entertain a strong hope that God will lead them back to his way." (Lachance 1993, 314)

5.3.4.4. Summary of the institutional dimension in Angela

The analysis of the institutional dimension of Angela's charismatic authority has attempted to answer to three questions: (1) What elements and processes can be found in Angela's text and followers which point out the turn/shift of her personal charisma into the institutional dimension? (2) What statements, rites or symbols are expressed by Angela in her text in connection with the charismatic legitimacy of the institutions (Church)? (3) Is it possible to transmit charismatic education?

In the shift of Angela's personal charisma into the institutionalization a great role is played by her charismas and the question of communicability of her message to the followers. Concerning charismatic legitimacy I analyzed Angela's influence in a broad sense, in which the legitimate sons of God and Angela's pure charisma constitute elements, e.g. which is specifically foreign to economic considerations. Finally, the question of the charismatic education has been presented via the manifold teachings of Angela addressed to her disciples.

Furthermore, as it has been demonstrated that Angela's mysticism is characterized by Christ centrism, pauperism, vivid, intimate and mystical dialogues with God, Christ, the Virgin Mary and Saint Francis, as well as by her continuous attention to her spiritual sons. This is expressed in her teachings and exhortations as well.

5.3.5. Chapter summary

Repeating once again, Weber's charisma is based around three focal points: (a) an intense field of force, (b) separating immanent legitimacy from magical and religious legitimacy, and (c) a division into personal and institutional dimensions. By applying Weber's theory of charisma as a means to analyze Angela's mysticism, the following can be observed:

(A) By using the theoretical framework of Weber it has been possible to provide an intensive and original analysis of Angela's work, both in personal and institutional dimensions. The investigation has demonstrated the importance of the socio-dimensional approach regarding the mysticism of Angela which may open up new perspectives in future examinations of other cases as well.

(B) In the mirror of Angela's work it is possible to investigate Weber's theory regarding charismatic authority. Angela's person and her followers demonstrate what

kind of central role the enthusiastic, e.g. erotic dimension of charisma plays. By looking at Angela's work, we can also better understand Weber's theory.

Angela's re-discovery is also indebted to the activity by Pope Francis. The equivalent canonization of Angela of Foligno in 2013 and her timeless charisma was evidenced by the Church. Not incidentally, Jorge Mario Bergoglio upon his installation as bishop of Rome stressed the importance of simplicity by taking the name in honor of Saint Francis. His pontiff is characterized by humble service according to the original way of the Gospels. The attraction of the Jesuit Pope to Franciscan Spirituality is clear and obvious.

Angela's female presence emerging from the field of Franciscan Spirituality is a possible way to follow in the modern age. Her medieval life-giving councils are as powerful and fresh as reading the directions of the Dalai Lama, practicing Osho's meditations, or listening to Oprah Winfrey's wise thoughts on life. Angela's central message to the 21st century's followers is available in the calling for regular prayer (the everyday personal conversation with the ultimate reality) as life settlement.

What is still so striking in Angela? Responding with the words of Romana Guarnieri written in the Preface to Lachance's English translation of the *Liber*:

“What struck me then and continues to move me every time I open the Book is the scorching intensity and the extremely daring concreteness and totally feminine way in which Angela narrates her experience of being madly in love with God, striving to be chaste and yet passionately and sensually fully alive.” (Lachance 1993, 7)

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

My dissertation – as it was clarified in the first chapter on “Significance and topicality of the project” – has aimed to discuss medieval female mysticism as a charismatic authority in a Max Weberian sense, introducing a new social scientific approach in the flourishing field of interpretations. In this work I have attempted to argue for a sociodimensional model of the interpretation of mysticism pointing out the figure of Angela of Foligno (1248-1309), the greatest Franciscan female mystic.

Regarding the significance of the project it has been demonstrated that medieval female mysticism is a matter in contemporary scholarship and so is the figure of Angela of Foligno. Another significant matter is the Weberian theory of charisma, which covered the methodological domain of the dissertation. To prove this, I have used various sources during the research, namely, historical, feminist and Weber-related ones, which resulted in a focus shadowed approach. Furthermore, the resulting approach combines the historical one with Weber’s theory of charisma, producing a predominantly sociological perspecting. Certainly, further research is justified on the topic.

Concerning Weber and his theory of charisma, the most important result to be highlighted is the fact charismatic authority is an *a posteriori* recognition by the followers. My investigation has been based on a text centered analysis and understanding of the Weberian theory of charisma. In the first research period, I examined all findings of the term ‘charisma’ and ‘charismatic authority’ in Max Weber’s life work. I used in the process the German original text and received 425 hits. In the second part of the research period, I analyzed every individual occurrence of the terms ‘charisma’ and ‘charismatic authority’, which allowed me to construct a three-dimensional model. These dimensions are the following: (1) intensity (high vs. kenotic character); (2) magical vs. immanent legitimacy; (3) person vs. institution (routinization). Recent literature on the theory of charisma (including Weber’s biography) is also investigated and constitutes a part of this chapter.

Regarding the analysis of the *Liber*, it has been demonstrated that Angela was a charismatic leader in the Weberian sense. It was also possible to find the person and institution related statements by Weber in Angela's text. The starting hypothesis was verified, medieval female mysticism can be understood as charismatic authority in Weberian sense. Furthermore, Angela's influence has been properly understood by means of Weber's theory of charisma.

6.1. Outcomes

Three further outcomes follow from the investigation of the entire dissertation.

The first outcome regards Angela: her meaning and effect are more obtainable thanks to the analysis. The second outcome concerns Weber's theory of charisma. Thanks to the analysis of Angela's work, the emotion based dimension, more precisely, the understanding of the magical-erotic dimension of Weberian theory of charisma has increased, from a hidden aspect to a visible one. For further research on Weber, this aspect can be more emphasized and taken into account. Finally, the third outcome concerns the consistency and dynamics of modern power making in societies.

Through my thesis, a door may be opened for a foundation of a new interpretation of power in contemporary societies where the magical-erotic dimension seems to be predominant. How can it be interpreted and who should care? There is a striking phenomenon that we can face in everyday societal life. The world cannot be interpreted anymore exclusively along theories of cold rationality. This aspect has been already reflected in the chapter about Weber's charisma where I stated: "the world does not suffer disenchantment as Weber argued at the beginning of his career in *The Protestant ethic and the spirit of capitalism* (Weber, 1905). However, with the refreshing presence of charisma the world is refilled with enchantment again and again".

Obviously, to go into more detail on this topic would be much beyond the scope of this dissertation. However, I would like to use one example to cast light on the importance of this finding. This new emotion based approach to understand global geopolitical changes and tendencies is already visible in the work of Daniele Moisi:

"The geopolitics of emotion: How cultures of fear, humiliation, and hope are reshaping the world" who maps the world according to three key emotions: fear, humiliation and hope. To conclude both the dissertation

and the outcomes, Moïsi draws in his essay our future task: "the mapping of emotions will become as legitimate and compulsory an exercise as the mapping of geographical realities." (Moïsi 2010)

REFERENCES

- AASS Acta Sanctorum quotquot toto orbe coluntur, ed. J. Bollandus et al. (Antwerp and Brussels, 1634-present) AASS OSB Acta Sanctorum Ordinis Sancti Benedicti, ed. J. Mabillon, 9 vols (Paris, 1668-1701)
- Adair-Toteff, Christopher (2015): *Fundamental concepts in Max Weber's sociology of religion*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Adair-Toteff, Christopher (2016): *Max Weber's sociology of religion*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- Alfonsi, Domenico (1995). *La figlia dell'estasi: biografia spirituale della beata Angela da Foligno*. Ed. Messaggero.
- Alston, William A. (1991): *Perceiving God: The epistemology of religious experience* Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Andreoli, S. (1975): La Beata Angela era analfabeta? *Gazzetta da Foligno*, 15 January.
- Aquinas, Thomas (2015): *Summa Theologica*. Irvine: Xist Publishing.
- Arcangeli, Tiziana (1995): Re-reading a mis-known and mis-read mystic: Angela da Foligno. *Annali d'italianistica*, 13: 41-78.
- Autieri, Felice (2015): La Bibliografia Angelana. *Miscellanea francescana: Rivista di Scienze Teologiche e Studi Francescani*, 115 (1): 235-257.
- Balthasar, Hans Urs von (2008): Szempontok a keresztény misztika mibenlétének meghatározásához. In: Beierwaltes, Werner, Balthasar, Hans Urs von, and Haas, Alois M., eds: *A misztika alapkérdései*. Budapest: Sík Sándor Kiadó, 41-72.
- Bassetti, Massimiliano and Toscano, Bruno (2012): Dal visibile all'indicibile: crocifissi ed esperienza mistica in Angela da Foligno.
- Baudrillard, J. (1993): *Symbolic Exchange and Death*, trans. I.H. Grant. London: Sage.

- Bauman, Zygmunt (2013): *Liquid modernity*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Bataille, G. (2014): *Inner experience*. Suny Press.
- Beer, Frances (1992): *Women and mystical experience in the Middle Ages*. Boydell Press.
- Bolton, Brenda M. (1973): *Mulieres sanctae*. In: Baker, Derek, ed. *Sanctity and secularity: The church and the world*. Oxford: Blackwell, 77–95.
- Bonaventure, Saint (1987): *The mind's road to God*. New York: Macmillan.
- Boss, George P. (1976): Essential attributes of the concept of charisma. *Southern Speech Communication Journal*, 41(3): 300–313.
- Bouyer, Louis (1986): *Mysterion: du mystère à la mystique*. François-Xavier de Guibert/OEIL.
- Bouyer, Louis (1968): *Eucharist*. South Bend: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Bouyer, Louis, et al. (1968): *History of Christian spirituality* 3, vols. London: Bums and Oates; New York: Seabury
- Brunner, E., and Mystik, Die (1924). *Das Wort: Der Gegensatz zwischen moderner Religionsauffassung und christlichem Glauben dargestellt an der Theologie Schleiermachers*. Tübingen, 21928.
- Butler, Cuthbert, Knowles, David, and Saint Bernard (of Clairvaux) (1967): *Western mysticism: The teaching of Augustine, Gregory and Bernard on contemplation and the contemplative Life. with 'Afterthoughts' and a New Foreword by David Knowles*. Constable.
- Butler, Cuthbert (1922): *Western mysticism: The teaching of SS Augustine, Gregory and Bernard on contemplation and the contemplative life*.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1982): *Jesus as mother: Studies in the spirituality of the High Middle Ages*. Berkeley: Univ of California Press.

- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1989): The female body and religious practice in the later middle ages. *Fragments for a History of the Human Body*, 1: 161-219.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1991): *Fragmentation and redemption: Essays on gender and the human body in medieval religion*. New York: Zone Books.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1985): Fast, feast, and flesh: The religious significance of food to medieval women.” *Representations*, 11: 1–25.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1987): *Holy feast and holy fast: The religious significance of food to medieval women*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1992): *Fragmentation and redemption: Essays on gender and the human body in medieval religion*. New York: Zone Books
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1995): Why all the fuss about the body? A medievalist's perspective. *Critical Inquiry*, 22 (1): 1–33.
- Carrette, Jeremy (2006): Grace Jantzen: Obituary. *The Guardian*, May 11, 2006. <http://https://www.theguardian.com/news/2006/may/11/guardianobituaries.gender>
Date of access: March 31, 2017.
- Certeau, M. de (1982): La Fable mystique XVI-XVII siècle.
- Cervigni, Dino S. (2005): Angela da Foligno's "Memoriale": The male scribe, the female voice, and the other. *Italica*, 82(3/4): 339-355.
- Chan, Hok-Lam (1974): Die Prophezeiung des Liu Chi (1311-1375). *Saeculum*, 25 (4): 338–66.
- Cross, Frank L., ad Livingstone, Elizabeth A., eds. (2005): *The Oxford dictionary of the Christian church*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- D'Avray, David L. (2010): *Medieval religious rationalities: A Weberian analysis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- De Matteis, Maria Consnsiglia, ed. (1981): Idee sulla donna nel Medioevo: fonti e aspetti giuridici, antropologici, religiosi, sociali e letterari della condizione femminile (Vol. 10). Pàtron.

- Desbonnets, Théophile O.F.M., (1988): *From intuition to Institution: The Franciscans*. trans. Paul Duggan and Jerry Du Charme. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press.
- Divani Shamsi Tabriz (1898) transl. R.A. Nicholson, Cambridge
- Dronke, Peter (1988): *Women writers of the Middle Ages: A critical study of texts from Perpetua (m.203) to Marguerite Porete (m.1310)*. 1st ed., reprint. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Faes de Mottoni, Barbara (1999): Gli Angeli nel Liber. Angèle de Foligno. Le dossier. *Collection de l'École Française de Rome*, 255: 185-202.
- Ferré, M. J. (1927): *Le livre de l'expérience des vrais fidèles* Paris: Editions E. Droz.
- Ferré, M.J. (1936): *Sainte Angele de Foligno: sa vie, ses oeuvres* Paris: Libraire Plon.
- Flood, David O.F.M and Thaddeé Matura O.F.M., (1975): *The birth of a movement: A study of the first rule of St. Francis*, trans. Paul Schwartz and Paul Lachance, O.F.M., Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press.
- Flood, David O.F.M., (1989): *Francis of Assisi and the Franciscan Movement*. Quezon City, Philippines: The Franciscan Institute of Asia, Contact Publication.
- Francis and Clare: The Complete Works* (1982) trans. Regis Armstrong, O.F.M. Cap., and Ignatius Brady, O.F.M. New York: Paulist Press.
- Furlong, Monica (1996): *Visions and longing: An anthology of women mystics*. Edited by Monica Furlong. London: Mowbray.
- Gane, Nicholas (2002): *Max Weber and postmodern theory: Rationalization versus re-enchantment*. Springer.
- Grundmann, Herbert (1961): *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter* (pp. 10-11). G. Olms.
- Guarnieri, Romana, and Porete, Marguerite (1965): *Il movimento del libero spirito: testi e documenti*. Roma: Edizioni di storia e letteratura.

- Habig, Marion Alphonse, ed. (1983): *St. Francis of Assisi: Writings and Early Biographies: English omnibus of the sources for the life of St. Francis (Vol. 1)*. Chicago: Franciscan Media.
- Hello, Ernest (1914) (1976): *Le livre des visions et instructions de la bienheureuse Angèle de Foligno*. Paris: Tralin.
- Hollywood, Amy, and Beckman, Patricia Z., eds. (2012): *The Cambridge companion to Christian mysticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hollywood, Amy (1999): “Beautiful as a Wasp”: Angela of Foligno and Georges Bataille. *The Harvard Theological Review* 92 (2): 219–236.
- Hostachy, Victor (1924): *Joie et sainteté*. Lille: Desclée de Brouwer.
- Huxley, Aldous (2010): *The doors of perception: And heaven and hell*. New York: Random House.
- Huysmans, Joris-Karl (1895): *En route*. Paris: Plon.
- Ijjas, Antal (1976): *Szentelek élete II*. Budapest: Ecclesia.
- Il Liber di Angela da Foligno e la mistica dei secoli XIII-XIV in rapporto alle nuove culture. Atti del XLV Convegno storico internazionale, Todi, 12-15 ottobre 2008 (2009). With assistance of Enrico Menestò. 1. ed. Spoleto: Fondazione Centro italiano di studi sull'alto Medioevo (Atti dei convegni del Centro italiano di studi sul basso Medioevo, Accademia Tudertina. Nuova serie, 22).
- Inge, William Ralph (1899): *Christian mysticism: considered in eight lectures delivered before the University of Oxford*. Methuen & Company.
- Inge, William Ralph (1938): The philosophy of mysticism. *Philosophy*, 13(52): 387-405.
- Jacobilli, Ludovico (1628): “Vita della B. Angela da Foligno” in *Vite dei SS. e BB. di Foligno Foligno*
- James, William (1902) (1982): *The varieties of religious experience*. Harmondsworth: Middx.

- Jantzen, Grace M. (1995): *Power, gender and Christian mysticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jantzen, Grace M. (1994): Feminists, philosophers, and mystics. *Hypatia* 9 (4): 186–206.
- Joas, Hans (2017): *Die Macht des Heiligen: Eine Alternative zur Geschichte von der Entzauberung*. Suhrkamp Verlag.
- Jones, Lindsay (2005): *Encyclopedia of religion*. Detroit: Macmillan Reference.
- Jörgensen (1938): Folignói Szent Angéla élete (Ford. Székely László). Pápa
- Katz, Steven T. (1978): *Mysticism and philosophical analysis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Katz, Steven T., ed. (2013): *Comparative mysticism: An anthology of original sources*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kieckhefer, Richard (1984): *Unquiet souls: Fourteenth-century saints and their religious milieu*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- King, Richard (2005): *Mysticism and spirituality: The Routledge companion to the study of religion*. London: Routledge.
- Klaniczay, Gábor (1994): Az égi szerelem: Misztika és erotika a középkorban. *Rubicon*, 5(6): 16-19.
- Kroll, Thomas (2001): “Max Webers Idealtypus der charismatischen Herrschaft und die Zeitgenössische Charisma-Debatte.” In Max Webers Herrschaftssoziologie . Herausgegeben von Edith Hanke und Wolfgang J. Mommsen. Tübingen: J.C.B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck). 47–72.
- Lachance, Paul (1993): *Angela of Foligno: Complete works*. Translated with an introduction by Paul Lachance; preface by Romana Guarnieri. New York: Paulist Press.
- Lachance, Paul (2006): *Angela of Foligno: Passionate mystic of the double abyss*. Hyde Park N.Y.: New City Press.

- Leclercq, Jean, Vandenbroucke, François, and Bouyer, Louis (1968): *The spirituality of the Middle Ages*. Tournai: Desclee Company.
- Leone, P. (1898): *Aureola Serafica*, vol. 1 (Quarachi)
- Loades, Ann (2010): Evelyn Underhill (1875–1941). “Mysticism and worship.” *International journal for the Study of the Christian Church*, 10 (1): 57–70.
- Louth, Andrew (2007): *The origins of the Christian mystical tradition: From Plato to Denys*. Oxford: Oxford University Press on Demand.
- Lyotard, J-F. (1981): ‘Theory as Art: A Pragmatic Point of View’, trans. R. Vollrath, in *Image and Code*, ed. W. Steiner. Michigan: Michigan University Press.
- Manselli, Raoul (1988): *St. Francis of Assisi*, trans. Paul Duggan. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press.
- Marshall, C. (1996): Karma Lochrie Margery Kempe and Translations of the Flesh and Sarah Beckwith Christ's Body: Identity, culture and society in late medieval writings. *Women Oxford*, 7(1), 88-93.
- Máté-Tóth, András and Turai, Gabriella (2015): Amor vacui: Religious attempts to tame love. In: Eszter Kovats, ed. *Love and politics*. Budapest: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 35-45.
- Máté-Tóth, András (2014): *Vallásnézet: A kelet-közép-európai átmenet vallástudományi értelmezése*. Kolozsvár: Korunk–Komp-Press.
- Máté-Tóth, András (2017): *Intézmény és karizma az Egyházban 2.0*. Budapest: Szent István Társulat.
- Máthé-Tóth, András (2007). A misztika szociológiája: Ernst Troeltsch harmadik típusa. *Erdélyi Társadalom*, 5(1), 141.
- Mayring, Philip (2010): Qualitative inhaltsanalyse. In: Mey, Günter, and Mruck, Katja, eds. *Handbuch qualitative Forschung in der Psychologie*. Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 601–613.
- Mazzoni, Christina M. (1996). *Saint hysteria: Neurosis, mysticism, and gender in European culture*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

- Mazzoni, Cristina M. (1991): Feminism, abjection, transgression: Angela of Foligno and the twentieth century. *Mystics Quarterly*, 17 (2): 61–70.
- McGinn, Bernard (1991): *The presence of God: The foundations of mysticism* (Vol. 1). New York: Crossroad Publishing Company.
- McGinn, Bernard (1991): The foundations of mysticism. Origins to the fifth century London: SCM.
- McGinn, Bernard (1996): The changing shape of late medieval mysticism.” *Church History*, 65 (2):197–219.
- McNamara, James A. (1995). *Elizabeth Alvilda Petroff. Body and Soul: Essays on Medieval Women and Mysticism*. New York: Oxford University Press..
- McNamara, James A. (1993): The rhetoric of Orthodoxy: Clerical authority and female innovation in the struggle with heresy.“ In: Wiethaus, Ulrike, ed., *Maps of flesh and light: The religious experience of medieval women mystics*. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press.
- Miller, Julie B. (1999): Eroticized violence in medieval women's mystical literature: A call for a feminist critique. *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion*, 15(2): 25–49.
- Moïsi, Dominique (2010): *The geopolitics of emotion: How cultures of fear, humiliation, and hope are reshaping the world*. New York: Anchor.
- Mommsen, Wolfgang J. (1974): *The age of bureaucracy: Perspectives on the political sociology of Max Weber*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Mooney, Catherine M. (2007): Interdisciplinarity in teaching medieval mysticism: The case of Angela of Foligno. *Horizons*, 34(1), 54-77.
- Moorman, John (1988): *A history of the Franciscan Order: From its origins to the year 1517*. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press.
- Movimento religioso femminile e francescanesimo nel secolo XIII: Atti del VII Convegno internazionale, Assisi, 11-13 ottobre 1979, 315-37.

- Oevermann, Ulrich (2016): Krise und Routine als analytisches Paradigma in den Sozialwissenschaften. In: Becker-Lenz, Ronald, Fanzmann, Andreas, Jansen, Axel, and Jung, Matthias, eds. *Die Methodenschule der Objektiven Hermeneutik: Eine Bestandsaufnahme*. Wiesbaden: Springer Verlag, 43–114.
- Peers, E. A. (1924): *Spanish mysticism: A preliminary survey*. London: Taylor & Francis.
- Pepler, Conrad (1957): *The three degrees: A study on Christian mysticism*. Freiburg: Herder.
- Petroff, Elizabeth (1978): Medieval women visionaries: Seven stages to power. *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies*, 3 (1): 34–45.
- Porete, Marguerite (1993): *The mirror of simple souls*. trans. Ellen L. Babinsky New York: Paulist Press.
- Power, Eileen (1997): *Medieval women*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Pulignani, D. F. (1909): Le antiche cartiere di Foligno. *La Bibliofilia*, 11(3/4), 102-127.
- Pulignani, D. F. (1926): *La Beata Angela da Foligno: Memorie e documenti*. Gubbio
- Puskely, Maria (1990): *Ezer év misztikájából*. Szeged: Szent Gellért Kiadó.
- Radkau, Joachim, and Weber, Max (2009): *A biography*. trans. Patrick Camiller. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Radkau, Joachim (2006): Die Heldenekstase der betrunkenen Elefanten: Das Natursubstrat bei Max Weber. *Leviathan* 34 (4): 533–59.
- Rieff, Philip (1973): *Fellow teachers*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Rieff, Philip (1987): *The triumph of the therapeutic: Uses of faith after Freud*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Rieff, Philip (1990): *The feeling intellect*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press
- Rieff, Philip and Piver, Kenneth S. (2006): *My life among the deathworks*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press

- Rieff, Philip (2007): *Charisma: The gift of grace, and how it has been taken away from us*. New York: Pantheon.
- Riesebrodt, Martin (1999): Charisma in Max Weber's *Sociology of Religion*. *Religion* 29 (1): 1–14.
- Ruether, R., and McLaughlin, E., eds. (1998): *Women of spirit: Female leadership in the Jewish and Christian traditions*. Wipf and Stock Publishers.
- Ruffing, J., ed. (2001): *Mysticism and social transformation*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press.
- Ruh, Kurt (1990): *Geschichte der abendländischen Mystik: Bd. Frauenmystik und Franziskanische Mystik der Frühzeit*. (vol. 2). CH Beck.
- Schleiermacher, Friedrich (1958): *On religion: Speeches to its cultured despisers*. trans. by John Oman. New York: Harper.
- Schluchter, W. (1996): *Paradoxes of modernity*, trans. Neil Solomon.
- Scholem, G. (1946) (1954) (2011): *Major trends in Jewish mysticism*. Schocken.
- Schütz, A. (1932): Szentek élete I. 24-27; Budapest Szent István Társulat
- Sík, Sándor (1996): *A misztika útjai Istenhez*. Szeged: Szepi.
- Smith, M. (1928): *Rabiah the Mystic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Smith, Ruth (1998): The mystical self in the Book of Divine Consolation of the Blessed Angela of Foligno. *Mystics Quarterly*, 24 (1): 8–22.
- Sohm, Rudolph (1892): *Kirchenrecht (Vol. 1)*. Berlin: Verlag von Duncker & Humblot.
- Sohm, Rudolph (1912): *Wesen und Ursprung des Katholizismus*. Leipzig: BG Teubner.
- Sohm, Rudolph (1923): *Kirchenrecht*. Berlin: Duncker & Humblot. Band 2.
- Stolz, A. (1936). *Theologie der Mystik*. Pustet.
- Swinburne, Richard (1979): *The existence of God*. Oxford Clarendon Press.

- Tar, Jane (2005): Angela of Foligno as a Model for Franciscan Women Mystics and Visionaries in Early Modern Spain. *Magistra*, 11(1): 83.
- Thier-Calufetti (1985): Ed.crit Il libro della Beata Angela da Foligno, Grottaferrata
- Thorold, A. L. (1900): An essay in aid of the better appreciation of Catholic mysticism: Illustrated from the writings of Blessed Angela of Foligno. Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner.
- Turai, Gabriella (2017): Medieval female mysticism and Weber's Charismatic Authority. *Belvedere Meridionale*, 29: 152-157.
- Turner, Charles (2011): Sacred sociology. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 28 (3): 80–105.
- Turner, Stephen P. (2003): Charisma revisited. *Journal of Classical Sociology*, 3(1): 5–26.
- Ubertinus de Casale (1961): *Arbor Vitae Crucifixae Jesu*, ed. Charles T. Davis (1485 edition reprinted in Torin)
- Underhill, Evelyn (1995): *Mysticism: The development of humankind's spiritual consciousness*. 14th ed. London: Bracken Books.
- Vauchez, André (1981). L'ideal de sainteté dans le mouvement féminin franciscain aux XIII e et XIV e siècles.
- Vauchez, André (1987): Les laïcs au Moyen Âge: pratiques et expériences religieuses. Cerf.
- Vauchez, André (1998): The religious orders. ??
- Vauchez, André (1981): L'influence des modèles hagiographiques sur les représentations de la sainteté dans les procès de canonisation (XIII-XV siècles). *Hagiographie, cultures et sociétés*, IV-XII siècles.
- von Hügel, F. F. (1923): The mystical element of religion as studied in Saint Catherine of Genoa and her friends (Vol. 1). JM Dent & sons.
- Weber, Max (1905) (2002): *The Protestant Ethic and the "Spirit" of Capitalism and other writings*. London: Penguin.

- Weber, Max (1922), (1976): *Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- Weber, Max (1951): *The religion of China: Confucianism and Taoism*. Translated and edited by Hans H. Gerth. New York: Free Press.
- Weber, Max (1958): *Religion of India*. New York: Free Press.
- Weber, Max (1993): *Landarbeiterfrage, Nationalstaat und Volkswirtschaftspolitik. Schriften und Reden 1892–1899*. Tübingen: J.C.B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck).
- Weber, Max (1994): *Briefe 1909–1910*. Tübingen: J.C.B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck).
- Weber, Max (2010): *Ancient Judaism*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Weber, Max (2013): *Economy and society: An outline of interpretive sociology*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Zaehner, R. C. (1957). *Mysticism, sacred and profane: An inquiry into some varieties of praeter-natural experience*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Zondervan, Antonius W. (2016): *Sociology and the sacred: An introduction to Philip Rieff's Theory of Culture*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Zum Brunn, Emilie and Epiney-Burgard, Georgette (1989): *Women mystics in medieval Europe*. Paragon House Publishers.

PUBLICATIONS

- Turai, Gabriella (2018): Book Review: “Gelehrte Bräute Christi”: Geistliche Frauen in der mittelalterlichen Gesellschaft by Eva Schlotheuber. *Sage Theological Studies*
- Turai, Gabriella (2018): A socio-religious leitmotif to understand religious development in CEE: Charisma 13th ISORECEA Conference Unblocking Religion, Konferencia helye, ideje: Szeged, Magyarország, 2018. 05.24-26, 93.
- Máté-Tóth, András – Turai, Gabriella (2018): Poszt-genocid teológia Európában *Tiszatáj*
- Turai, Gabriella (2017): Egyházak kommunikációs megközelítésben: (Kovács Lajos: Az egyház mint kommunikáció). *Jel-Kép: Kommunikáció Közvélemény Média* 2017 (1): 125-129.
- Turai, Gabriella (2017): Enrico Menestò (ed.) (2009): Il Liber di Angela da Foligno e la mistica dei secoli XIII-XIV. in rapporto alle nuove culture. In: András Hanga (szerk.), *Kommunikációs terek 2017*. Budapest; Sepsiszentgyörgy: DOSZ; T3 Kiadó, 195-200.
- Turai, Gabriella (2017): Medieval Female Mysticism and Weber's Charismatic Authority. *Belvedere Meridionale* 29: 152-157.
- Turai, Gabriella (2016): Lee C. Bollinger: Korlátlan, erőteljes és szélesre nyitott - Az új évszázad sajtószabadsága, Complex, Budapest 2014. In: András Hanga (szerk.), *Kommunikációs terek 2016*. Budapest; Sepsiszentgyörgy: DOSZ; T3 Kiadó, 144-149.
- Turai, Gabriella (2016): James Curran - Jean Seaton: Hatalom felelősség nélkül. A sajtó, a műsorszolgáltatás és az Internet Nagy-Britanniában. In: András Hanga (szerk.), *Kommunikációs terek 2016*. Budapest; Sepsiszentgyörgy: DOSZ; T3 Kiadó, 156-162.
- Turai, Gabriella (2016): Karizma: Vajh feminin vagyol-e? Egy weberi kísérlet. In: Molnár Annamária, Ótott Noémi, Pál József (szerk.), *Lát(szó)tér: Fiatal*

kutatók italianisztikai tanulmányai. Szeged: Szegedi Tudományegyetem Olasz Nyelvi és Irodalmi Tanszék, 239-255.

Turai, Gabriella (2016): Istent mesélni. A vallás mint kommunikáció. *Jel-Kép: Kommunikáció Közvélemény Média*, 2016(3): 115-119.

Turai, Gabriella (2016): A klasszikus női misztika: A női lélek egykor és ma.” *A SZÍV* 102 (5): 18-21.

Turai, Gabriella (2016): Women mystics and charismatic power: The case Of Saint Angela of Foligno. In: Dinka Marinović Jerolimov, Siniša Zrinščak (szerk.), *12th ISORECEA Conference & ESA RN34 Sociology of Religion Mid-Term Conference : programme and abstracts: RELIGION AND NON-RELIGION IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETIES Theoretical, Empirical and Methodological Challenges for Research in Central and Eastern Europe and Beyond.* Konferencia helye, ideje: Zadar, Horvátország, 2016.04.21-2016.04.24. Zágráb: International Study of Religion in Eastern and Central Europe Association; Institute for Social Research in Zagreb, 65.

Turai, Gabriella (2016): Woman mystics: The case of Saint Angela of Foligno: Life and context. Konferencia helye, ideje: Leeds, Egyesült Királyság / Anglia, 2016.07.04-2016.07.07. Leeds. International Medieval Congress.

Máté-Tóth, András and Turai Gabriella (2015): Amor vacui: Vallási kísérletek a szerelem megszelídítésére.” In: Kováts Eszter (szerk.), *Szerelem és politika.* Budapest: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 35-45.

Máté-Tóth, András and Turai Gabriella (2015): Amor vacui: Religious attempts to tame love” In: Kováts Eszter (ed.), *Love and politics.* Budapest: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 35-45.

Turai, Gabriella (2015): Johan Galtung and Carl.G. Jacobsen: Searching for Peace – The Road to TRANSCEND. In: András Hanga (szerk.) *Kommunikációs terek 2015.* Budapest; Nagyvárad: Új Mandátum Kiadó (ÚMK), 139-146.

Máté-Tóth, András; Turai Gabriella szerk. (2014): *Parallax: Meditációk egy változó világról.* Pannonhalma: Bencés Kiadó, 2014. 288 pp.

- Turai, Gabriella (2014): A Holokauszt kulturális vonatkozásai – az emlékezés krakkói olvasata. *Vallástudományi Szemle* 10 (1-2): 3.
- Turai, Gabriella (2014): Középkori női misztika - feminista megközelítés. In: Barát Erzsébet, Zámbóné Kocic Larisa (szerk.), *Nyelv, Ideológia, Média 10.: Interdiszciplináris gender konferencia*. Konferencia helye, ideje: Szeged, Magyarország, 2014.09.19-2014.09.20, 38.
- Turai, Gabriella (2012): Niccoló Machiavelli levele Francesco Vettorinak (214. levél). *Különbség* 12 (1): 30-34.